



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

MAY 15, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Hausz, Drury, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec (until 5:00 p.m.), Ooley (until 4:26 p.m.), and Veyna (at 1:34 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: Grumbine and Edmunds
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:00 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:55 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **May 1, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 15, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Commissioner Edmunds and Chair Grumbine are absent from today's meeting and Commissioner Ooley will leave at 4:30 p.m.
 - b. The Historic Landmarks Commission will receive an email from staff with a Planning Commission agenda staff report and a Phase I Historic Structures/Sites Report for 226 East Anapamu Street, so the Commission may re-familiarize themselves with the project in preparation for the Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report and concept review, which will be coming before the Commission at the meeting on May 29, 2019 or the following meeting on June 12, 2019.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. The Certified Local Government application is going to City Council on Tuesday, May 21, 2019 on the Consent Agenda for approval and adoption of a Resolution. Once Council approves the application, the application will be submitted to the Office of Historic Preservation. The program certifies the Commission's historic preservation program under the National Historic Preservation Act.
 - b. The Mills Act revisions are going to City Council on June 4, 2019. Ms. Hernandez requested that a member of the HLC attend.
 - c. Ms. Hernandez provided updates on the Cabrillo Pavilion rehabilitation, including that the second floor railing is so deteriorated it will need to be replaced. The replacement case concrete railing will be made in a mold of the existing cast concrete.
3. Commissioner Nemec announced that he will recuse himself from Item 6, 651 Paseo Nuevo.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Awards Program.

(1:50PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. HISTORIC STRUCTURES/SITES REPORT REVIEW

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

(Historic Structures/Sites Reports Review under the Adopted Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites.)

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Discussion held.

(1:55PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**2. 2190 ALSTON RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2019-00176
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC
Applicant: Shubin Donaldson

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, "Grahholm," is eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources, and for designation as a City Landmark. Proposal for a 1,250 square foot detached garage for the existing 19,611 square foot historic residence. Project includes 1,914 square feet of driveway extension, 6,679 square feet of new permeable parking, and proposed improvements to the existing motor court, drive, and repainting of the historic residence.)

A. Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

B. Acceptance of a Phase I & II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Sarah Corder, Kate Kaiser, Samantha Murray, and Bryce Beemer, is requested. The report concluded the property is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, California Register of Historical Resources, and as a City Landmark. The property is significant for its association with the growth and development of the current Eucalyptus Hill neighborhood, its association with master architect Ronald Sauter, and its representation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style of architecture. A detailed impact analysis of the proposed project found all proposed new construction and modification to the Grahholm property is in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Therefore, the proposed project's level of impact on historical resource will be less than significant (Class III).

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Robin Donaldson, Architect, Shubin Donaldson; and Sarah Corder, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez gave a presentation that outlined the information provided in the Phase I & II Historic Structures/Sites Report for 2190 Alston Road.

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners believe the architecture is not acceptable as presented? 5/2
Passed

Motion: Continue the concept review indefinitely with comments:

1. Verify the size and condition of the 36 inch diameter oak tree, the majority of the Commission prefer it be maintained.
2. The majority of the Commission feels the garage should be more referential to the architecture of the house, for example through incorporating either a tile roof or arched openings and/or matching the existing irregular stonework.
3. The Commission would like the original stone flatwork to be preserved in place or for reuse, wherever possible.

4. Study alternative orientations of the garage to make it more subservient to the residence.
5. Study the driveway in relationship to the new garage and the grading plan, as it currently looks too engineered.
6. The Commission would consider a relocation of the steps on the east side of the garage, if necessary, to better orient the garage.
7. The majority of the Commission finds that the architecture is not acceptable as presented.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Accept Phase I of the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Nemec. Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the comment that the report should clearly state which part is Phase I and which part is Phase II.

Action: Drury/Nemec, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

(2:40PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. 2190 ALSTON RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2019-00176
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC
Applicant: Shubin Donaldson

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on July 24, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Graholt Estate, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed by Roland F. Sauter in 1916 and completed in 1920 located at 2190 Alston Road.)

Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.030 (d) (3) if Historic Structures/Sites Report finds property as having potential for designation as a City Historic Resource, it shall be considered and acted upon by the Commission for listing on the Potential Historic Resources List; and Section 22.22.035 (d) (2), The permit request shall be scheduled at the Commission for a hearing on the application in accordance with this paragraph 2 concurrently with a duly noticed hearing to allow the Commission to also decide among the following options: (a) the listing of the structure, site, or feature as a Potential Historic Resource; or (b) its designation by the Commission as a City Structure of Merit; or (c) a recommendation to the City Council to designate the structure, site, or feature as a City Landmark pursuant to this chapter.

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Motion: Item postponed because the Commission did not accept the Historic Structures/Sites Report.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:15 TO 3:20 P.M. ***

(2:45PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**4. 803 BATH ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-032-014
Zone: R-MH
Application Number: PLN2017-00714
Owner: Furst, Michael B Revocable Trust 12
Applicant: SEPPS
Architect: John Beauchamp

(The Craftsman Residence constructed in 1906 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish the as-built garage/storage building constructed without a permit, for a new single-car garage to be constructed in the location of the original garage. A driveway is proposed on the north side of the residence to provide for an additional uncovered parking space. Project includes demolishing the as-built basement access constructed without a permit, replacing the upper window sashes of the residence to match the original diamond pane configuration, permitting two driveway gates, a skylight, and HVAC equipment. The project will address violations listed in ENF2016-01512, ENF2017-00969, and ZIR2016-00467.)

Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for the reduction of qualifying open yard. Project was last reviewed on September 5, 2018.

Actual time: 3:20 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; John Beauchamp, Architect; Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Consent for Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission finds that the open yard modification is aesthetically supportable because the corner lot is unique in its size and history, and the use of both the interior setbacks for driveway and parking make it difficult to create the open space required.
2. Study the downspout and termination of the gutter along the property line.

Action: Lenvik/Mahan, 6/1/0. (Drury opposed. Grumbine and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comment: Commissioner Drury believes the proposed garage location is inappropriate and should be moved ninety degrees to the west.

(3:30PM) IN-PROGRESS REVIEW HEARING**5. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
Zone: HRC-1/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2018-00634
Owner: KHP IV Santa Barbara LLC
Applicant: Steve Fort, SEPPS
Architect: Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal for improvements at the Hyatt Centric Santa Barbara. The original hotel building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is eligible for designation as a City Structure of Merit. Proposal involves reconfiguration of the existing parking with valet spaces to provide for hardscape and landscape improvements, including new green space between the Santa Maria and Santa Cruz buildings, and an outdoor space and wood trellis at the Santa Clara building lobby. Improvements to the Santa Clara building include removing a portion of the colonnade to reveal the original hotel entry, and providing outdoor patio areas connecting to the meeting room and restaurant.)

In-Progress Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on April 17, 2019.

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis + Mixon; Courtney Miller, CJM::LA; and Cameron Hunt, CJM:LA

Public comment opened at 4:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposed black and white striped canopies?
1/5 Failed

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Study the architectural lighting fixtures as what is proposed is not acceptable and should be more traditional.
2. The Commission understands that the new landing and railing on the east end at the stair tower are still in the process of being studied.
3. Continue to study and develop the bar area trellis.
4. The Commission finds that the cartouche on the south elevation is acceptable, but would like to see a section detail.
5. Return with details of new mechanical equipment screening and new penetrations through the walls for vents.
6. The majority of the Commission does not find striped awnings acceptable; return with a solid color.
7. The color chart presented, with the exception of the awning, is acceptable.
8. The hardscape paving materials are acceptable.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Ooley, and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

(4:00PM) REVIEW AFTER FINAL APPROVAL**6. 651 PASEO NUEVO**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2016-00464
Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
Applicant: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for renovation of Paseo Nuevo Shopping Center including the replacement of all existing paving, new hardscape elements, new paint on all existing building elevations, replacement of existing light fixtures and addition of new decorative pendant fixtures, patterned pole lights, and ambient lighting.)

Review After Final is requested for revisions to the previously approved water feature located at Paseo 6 of Paseo Nuevo, for an Interactive Educational Exhibit, inspired by Santa Barbara's coastline intertidal zone. The exhibit includes creating a mini ecosystem, with kelp forest, tidal pools, and sea life. The sea flora and fauna are proposed to be made from either bronze, cast concrete or concrete impressions. Project was last reviewed on April 17, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Nemec recused himself from hearing this item as he works for Van Atta Associates.

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Designer, Van Atta Associates; Jianjun Li, Landscape Designer, Van Atta Associates; and Kristen Weidemann, General Manager, Paseo Nuevo

Public comment opened at 5:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Identify the artist contracted for the Interactive Educational Exhibit.
2. Study an architectural overhead piece to give a three dimensional quality to the exhibit.
3. The Commission is supportive of the concept.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/0. (Grumbine, Ooley, Nemec, and Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:23 P.M. ***