



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

DECEMBER 18, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, and McClure
Commissioners absent: Ooley
Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:03 p.m.); Hernandez (absent from 2:43 p.m. - 4:53 p.m.); Reidel; Holly Garcin, Assistant Planner (from 2:43 p.m.- 3:11 p.m.); Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner (from 3:11 p.m.- 5:30 p.m.) Esparza; and Jasper Carman, Commission Secretary

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Cheri Rae
3. Steve Dowty

Written correspondence from Paulina Conn, Steve Dowty and Cheri Rae, on behalf of Bungalow Haven Neighborhood Associate, and Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 20, 2024.**

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 20, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Butler, 7/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **November 20, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **November 20, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Ratification of action taken on the Consent Calendar of December 18, 2024

Consent Calendar December 18, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 12 E Carrillo St	APN: 039-322-045 PLN: 2024-00182 Zone: C-G	12 East Carrillo LLC Ben Romo, Representative Member/ Farah AlQallaf, Cearnal Collective LLP	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 18, 2024**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and McClure

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:

- a. Presented updates on two Mills Act projects.
- b. Bungalow Haven National Registration links were sent to the Commissioners, with instructions that Commissioners individually provide comments to the Mayor and Council by January 15th, in order to forward them to the National Register.

2. Commissioner Ensberg and Chair Grumbine requested a discussion item on the Italian Stone Pines with the HLC City Council Liaison, Kristen Sneddon, in attendance.

3. Commissioner Grumbine presented a resolution of recognition for Vice Chair Steve Hausz.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg reported on the State Street Interim Working Group.

Commissioner Drury reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Design Group

(1:50PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 330 SHERMAN RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-007
Zone: RS-1A
Application Number: PLN2024-00042
Owner: Jennifer Stanowick
Applicant: Jeff Shelton

(Property is not historic or within a historic district. Proposal to construct a 1,490-square-foot two-story single-unit residence with an attached 503-square-foot two-car garage on a vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The project also includes new landscape, hardscape, and site improvements. The proposed total of 1,993 square feet of development on a 29,817-square-foot lot is 42% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Ignacio Requena. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

Present: Ignacio Requena, Archaeologist

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 228 E FIGUEROA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-212-007
Zone: O-R
Application Number: PRE2024-00178
Owner: Matt Shamus
Applicant: Heidi Jones, Meraki Land Use Consulting

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report of a 1923 Craftsman style house, listed on the Historic Resources Inventory as a contributing historic resource to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District that is proposed for demolition to be replaced by a multi-unit residential project.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates and removal of the property from the Historic Resources Inventory. The report concluded that the Craftsman style building constructed in 1923 at the front of the property facing the street and public view does not embody sufficient importance in its design, historical associations, or contributions to the streetscapes for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark or Structure of Merit or as a contributor to the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The rear cottages were determined not historic in a public hearing by the Historic Landmarks Commission on April 10, 2024. The Historic Significance Report prepared by the City's Architectural Historian found the building does qualify as a historic resource prepared on April 10, 2024. The property is adjacent to a historic Structure of Merit at 224 East Figueroa

Street, across the street from three historic Structures of Merit at 223 A East Figueroa Street, 223 D East Figueroa Street, and 223 F East Figueroa Street.

[Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates*](#)

[Historic Significance Report by City's Architectural Historian*](#)

[Cultural Resources Study of the block prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates in 2018*](#)

[224 East Figueroa Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

[223A East Figueroa Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

[223D East Figueroa Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

[223F East Figueroa Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Ex parte communication: Commissioner Grumbine disclosed that he had ex parte conversation with staff, Post/Hazeltine Associates, and the owner regarding the project.

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that in 2018 the Historic Landmarks Commission required a cultural resource study prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates for these blocks related to another project that did find this building contributed to the streetscape of the city, which was used as the planning document to monitor that building. Ms. Hernandez highlighted reasons she found the building does qualify as a historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Derek Penfield
2. Cheri Rae
3. Steve Dowty

Written correspondence from Cheri Rae was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:22 p.m.

Motion: Deny the report as presented.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:20PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. [340 E LOS OLIVOS ST](#)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-261-004

Zone: RS-15

Application Number: PLN2024-00241

Owner: James Charles Lee

Applicant: Brooke Vanduyne, Sherry & Associates Architects

(Located in the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part II, and listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory, the "Edwards/Dole House" was constructed in 1911 in the American Colonial Revival style. Proposal for as-built 209-square-foot addition, landing, HVAC system, water heater, and door and window alterations on the existing 265-square-foot detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). Project includes a new pool, spa, and associated equipment. Request for a Minor Zoning Exception (MZE) from the HLC to allow an existing over height hedge to remain at 12-feet tall near the property line. Project requires approval from the Staff Hearing Officer for three zoning Modifications, to allow the as-built addition to the existing detached standard ADU to be constructed within the primary and secondary front setbacks, and to grant relief from front setback standards to allow the proposed swimming pool to be located closer than 15 feet from the secondary front lot line. The proposed total of 6,641 square feet of development on a 13,589 square foot lot is 159% of the maximum required Floor-to-Lot Area Ratio (FAR). Project will partially abate violations in ENF2023-00438.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Zoning Exception Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project last reviewed on September 25, 2024.

Phase 1-2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:43 p.m.

Present: Brooke Vanduyne, Sherry & Associates Architects; and Holly Garcin, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Garcin stated that the project is returning to HLC after further developing plans in response to Commissioners' previous comments and is looking to receive aesthetic supportability comments on the Modifications requested for the ADU and pool locations. The applicant is requesting feedback on the location and aesthetic appropriateness of the Mission aqueduct memorial.

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for the much improved design and for listening to the Commission and adjusting accordingly.
2. The Commission is supportive of the pool and ADU encroachment in the setback as it is better for the historic resource that they are located in the setbacks as opposed to closer to the resource.
3. The height of the existing to remain hedges is supportable.
4. Return to Consent for Project Design Approval and Final Approval.
5. The ADU light fixture at the doors should be reduced to single fixture.
6. The ADU light fixture should be more historically detailed, but the general style is acceptable.
7. Both ADU paint color palettes are acceptable as proposed.
8. The treatment of the aqueduct is acceptable as proposed and is appreciated.
9. The Commission is looking forward to the project going forward.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(3:00PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**4. 517 CHAPALA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007 & 037-163-008
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2024-00306
Owner: SBID LLC
Cole Cervantes, Managing Member
Applicant: Lonnie Roy, ON Design Architects

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project consists of a proposal to demolish the existing automobile dealership with 1,300 square feet of office space, merge the two lots, and construct a new 15-unit multi-story residential apartment complex developed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program and the State's Density Bonus Program. No vehicle parking is proposed pursuant to AB-2097. The project includes a bike room, residential storage area, waste and recycling room, and hardscape and landscape improvements. Project is adjacent to a historic Structure of Merit at 509 Chapala Street and is in proximity to Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required.

509 Chapala Street Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Lonnie Roy, Agent, ON Design Architects; Scott Martin, Architect, RRM Design Group; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer summarized the project and stated that the Applicant is requesting a decision at today's hearing, and is also requesting an exception to the story poles requirement.

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Leon Olson
2. Tony Vasallo

Public comment closed at 3:35 p.m.

Motion: Continue to January 29, 2025 with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for bringing forth the project, and is supportive of more residential development and the general direction that this project is going, especially since this is the first review.
2. The Commission thanks the Applicant for being amenable and continuing to work through the next review, knowing what the State Laws are.
3. The Commission needs more information on a number of areas:
 - a. Provide least three sections, one from Chapala to the alley through the main entry and courtyard, one from in front of the three-story building to show the facade facing Chapala, and one that cuts through the courtyard and parallel to that to that

that cuts through the building to show those relationships and the relationships to the neighbors on either side.

- b. Provide a streetscape elevation showing at least the 531 Chapala St. building and the historic two-story Italianate building on either side for context.
 - c. Provide additional 3-D views from Brinkerhoff as well as looking up the alley to show the relationship on the backside.
 - d. Renderings can be diagrammatic but need elevations to scale of all sides of the buildings, especially if the Applicant is requesting a story pole waiver.
 - e. Provide elevations of all sides of the buildings, especially of the two or more story side.
4. Continue details studies, and include good reference photographs for details, especially historic references as they are more reliable.
 5. Restudy the metal canopy as the Commission generally frowns upon metal canopies.
 6. Study the Juliette balconies and come back with good historic examples.
 7. Have 8-inch minimum thickness walls.
 8. Recess the windows and doors.
 9. Study the mechanical equipment and how it will be screened.
 10. The Commission understands that they cannot ask for vehicle parking, and are not requiring additional bike parking, but ask the Applicant to consider greatly increasing the number of bike parking, especially because there will be guests, and it will keep the visual clutter to a minimum.
 11. Study the bike entrance to have double doors or a large entry so it is easily accessible.
 12. Study ways, such as eave overhangs, to design in a way that addresses that the small building at 517 Chapala St. and the large building at 531 Chapala St. to bridge the gap between the two neighbors and to relate to both in a sensitive way.
 13. Study having softer texture on the plaster.
 14. Study the awnings and consider the use of the element. For example, if it's wrought iron over windows it should be lower down on the building, and awnings would be on the elevation that gets sun.
 15. Study the balance of the awnings and the height of the awnings relative to the windows. Provide reference photos.
 16. Study the visual plaster below the windows and above the eaves, and bring closer to two feet, so to not have so much disparity between them.
 17. Study softening and transitioning the properties by using larger massing of plantings, such as bay laurel, between the 531 Chapala St. building and the project site. In the renderings, show the plantings on and off to show both ways.
 18. Consider using tile as a detail around windows or the entry to bring more poetry into the building and tie into the neighboring property at 531 Chapala St.
 19. The roof should be two-piece clay tile all the way, not just at the end.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:40 TO 4:53 P.M. ***

(3:45PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

5.

518-524 N MILPAS ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-241-041 & 031-241-040
 Zone: C-G, C-R
 Application Number: PRE2023-00121
 Owner: AJ Vido Inc.

Applicant: Nick Gibson, Representative
Ed DeVicente CPHC AIA, DMHA

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1925 by Elmer Whittaker in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposal for a lot merger and to demolish the non-historic car wash building at 524 North Milpas Street and non-contributing portions of the building at 518 North Milpas Street to construct a new 23-unit multi-story residential apartment complex developed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program and the State's Density Bonus Program incorporating the historic façade on 518 Milpas into the project. The project includes 20 covered vehicle parking spaces onsite and three uncovered parking spaces offsite. Project is adjacent to historic Structures of Merit at 514-516 North Milpas Street, and all the buildings from 502-516 are Structures of Merit at they were all built together as a commercial street front.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The Phase 2 concluded the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).

B. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

[Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report \(accepted by the HLC on April 10, 2024\)*](#)

[Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*](#)

[514-516 North Milpas Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:53 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Ed DeVicente, DMHA; Ryan Mills, DMHA; Guillermo Gonzalez, Blue Studio Landscape Architecture; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer summarized the project and stated that the applicant is requesting feedback on the project's consistency with the Project Compatibility Findings in advance of the Planning Commission conceptual review.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment reopened at 5:26 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. George Trujillo
2. Sebastian Aldana Jr.

Written correspondence from Jonathan Stein and Sebastian Aldana Jr. was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:30 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for this exceptional project. It is beautifully designed and sensitive to a number of constraints while also providing housing. The Applicant has done a great job incorporating the historic resource into the design.
2. The Commission feels that story poles would be appropriate, at least the three mentioned on the front elevation to the two closest buildings along Milpas.
3. In general, the Commission feels that while this is on the larger end of size, mass, bulk, and scale, as currently shown, it seems it is within reason of meeting the guideline requirements.
4. The Commission would like story poles to check for mass, bulk, and scale as well as public views of the Riviera.

Motion: **Accept the report as submitted.**

Action: Hausz/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(4:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

6. STATE STREET 1200 BLOCK PLANTER IMPROVEMENTS PILOT PROJECT

Reference Number: PLN2024-00003

HLC Representative: Anthony Grumbine, HLC Chair

(The HLC will hear a report from the HLC State Street Subcommittee about planters on the 1200 block of State Street. HLC will provide staff with input on proposed landscaping changes, including changes to plantings and removal of some landscaping and replacement of non-tree landscaping with brick.)

Actual time: 6:04 p.m.

Present: Sarah Clark, Downtown Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Tess Harris, State Street Master Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:22 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

Motion: **Approve the pilot program and adjourn the meeting.**

Action: Hausz/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:24 P.M. ***