



# City of Santa Barbara

## PLANNING COMMISSION

### MINUTES

### NOVEMBER 11, 2021

1:00 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Deborah L. Schwartz, Chair  
Gabriel Escobedo, Vice Chair  
Roxana Bonderson  
Jay D. Higgins  
Sheila Lodge  
Barrett Reed  
Lesley Wiscomb

#### STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney  
Allison DeBusk, Senior Planner  
Gillian Fennessy, Commission Secretary

---

### CALL TO ORDER

Chair Schwartz called the meeting to order at 1:02 p.m.

### I. ROLL CALL

Vice Chair Gabriel Escobedo, Commissioners Roxana Bonderson, Jay D. Higgins, Sheila Lodge, Barrett Reed, and Lesley Wiscomb

Absent: Chair Deborah L. Schwartz

### STAFF PRESENT

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney  
Allison DeBusk, Senior Planner  
Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner  
Adam Nares, Geographic Information Systems Technician  
Stephanie Swanson, Associate Planner  
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner  
Janet Ahern, City TV Production Specialist  
Gillian Fennessy, Commission Secretary

### II. PRELIMINARY MATTERS

A. Requests for continuances, withdrawals, postponements, or addition of ex-agenda items:

No requests.

B. Announcements and appeals:

No announcements.

- C. Review, consideration, and action on the following draft Planning Commission minutes and resolutions:

1. October 28, 2021 Planning Commission Minutes

**MOTION: Higgins / Bonderson**

Approve the minutes as presented.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 Noes: 0 Abstain: 1 (Wiscomb) Absent: 1 (Schwartz)

- D. Comments from members of the public pertaining to items not on this agenda:

Public comment opened at 1:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**III. NEW ITEM**

- A. **ACTUAL TIME: 1:05 P.M.**

**1625 SHORELINE DRIVE**

**ZONE: E-3/S-D-3 (ONE-FAMILY RESIDENCE/COASTAL OVERLAY), COASTAL LAND USE DESIGNATION: LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL (MAX 5 DWELLING UNITS PER ACRE), APN: 045-173-031, PLN2021-00048, APPLICANT / OWNER: SALT ARCHITECTURE / DENNIS & KRISTIN ZOOK, DATE FILED: JANUARY 26, 2021**

The 22,488-square-foot site is currently developed with a one-story, 1,916-square-foot single-unit residence and a 518-square-foot attached garage. The proposed project involves construction of a 487-square-foot single-level addition; removal of an unpermitted 310-square-foot viewing area located on the bluff face; and permitting a 6-inch raised 1,981-square-foot deck and a 2,226-square-foot permeable artificial turf area. The proposed total of 2,929 square feet on a 22,488-square-foot lot is 63% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. The discretionary application required for this project is a Coastal Development Permit (CDP2021-00019) to allow the proposed development in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the City's Coastal Zone (SBMC §28.44.060).

Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Dylan Henderson, Architect, SALT Architecture, gave the Applicant presentation.

Public comment opened at 1:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**MOTION: Wiscomb / Higgins****Assigned Resolution No. 009-21**

Approve the project, making the findings for the Coastal Development Permit as outlined in the Staff Report dated November 4, 2021, subject to the Conditions of Approval provided as Exhibit A of the Staff Report, with the following additions to the Conditions of Approval:

1. To Section C. Design Review, add that the applicant shall demonstrate on the site plan that the existing curb is located at least 5 feet from the bluff edge. If the curb is located less than 5 feet from the bluff edge, the curb shall be relocated to comply with the 5-foot setback.
2. Add new condition B.6 that includes the conditions identified in LUP Policy 5.1-33.C.iv.d referencing compliance with Policy 5.1-42 Conditions for Development in Shoreline Hazard Areas on the Interim Shoreline Hazards Screening Areas Map, and including subsections i through iv of Policy 5.1-33.C.iv.d.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Schwartz)

The ten calendar day appeal period was announced.

**B. ACTUAL TIME: 1:53 P.M.****3030 SEA CLIFF DRIVE**

**ZONE: A-1/S-D-3 (ONE-FAMILY RESIDENCE/COASTAL OVERLAY), COASTAL LAND USE DESIGNATION: LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL (MAX 1 DWELLING UNIT PER ACRE) APN: 047-091-035, PLN2020-00562, APPLICANT / OWNER: BRIAN CEARNAL / ROXANNE AUSTIN, DATE FILED: DECEMBER 9, 2020**

The proposal includes demolition of an existing one-story single family residence and construction of a new two-story single family residence with a basement and attached two-car garage. The project requires Planning Commission approval to alter a previous condition of approval limiting development to one-story. The 79,715-square-foot parcel is located in both the Appealable and Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, but all development is proposed in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction. The discretionary applications required for this project are: (1) A Coastal Development Permit (CDP2021-00021) to allow the proposed development in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the City's Coastal Zone (SBMC §28.44.060), and (2) Amendment of the Conditions of Approval associated with the underlying subdivision (Planning Commission Resolution 011-97) which prohibited two-story development.

Stephanie Swanson, Associate Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective, gave the Applicant presentation.

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m., and the following individuals spoke:

1. William Bridge & Michelle Profant

Public comment closed at 2:09 p.m.

**MOTION: Wiscomb / Escobedo****Assigned Resolution No. 010-21**

Approve the project making the findings for the Coastal Development Permit as outlined in the Staff Report dated November 4, 2021 subject to the Conditions of Approval as outlined in Exhibit A of the Staff Report, with the following amendments to the Conditions of Approval:

1. Amend Condition II.A.3 of Planning Commission Resolution No. 011-97 for the subdivision map, removing the one-story limitation on development at the subject property.
2. Add a condition of approval for protection of the ESHA during construction.
3. Recommend that the Single Family Design Board work with the applicant on visual impacts of the project, especially from Arroyo Burro Beach, as several commissioners are concerned with the visual impacts of this project.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 Noes: 1 (Lodge) Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Schwartz)

The ten calendar day appeal period was announced.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:05 TO 3:20 P.M. \***

**C. ACTUAL TIME: 3:20 P.M.**

**3237 STATE STREET**

**ZONE: RS-7.5/USS (RESIDENTIAL SINGLE UNIT, 7,500 SQUARE-FOOT MINIMUM LOT SIZE/UPPER STATE STREET AREA OVERLAY), LAND USE DESIGNATION: PARKS AND OPEN SPACE, APN: PORTIONS OF 051-112-019 AND -018, PLN2020-00493, APPLICANT / OWNER: BETH A. COLLINS, BROWNSTEIN HYATT FARBER SCHRECK / FEDERAL GOVERNMENT (PENDING - AMERICAN INDIAN HEALTH AND SERVICES)**

**This is a concept review hearing.** The project consists of a new community health clinic for American Indian Health and Services (AIHS), a local non-profit organization, on a 2.57-acre site located at the southeast corner of State Street and Las Positas Road. The proposal includes renovation of the existing buildings, new landscaping, and public improvements. The project includes a request to be designated as a Community Benefit Project, a proposed Specific Plan to allow the clinic use, and a General Plan Amendment to change the land use designation from Parks and Open Space to Office/Low Density Residential (5 dwelling units per acre).

**RECUSALS:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Higgins recused himself from hearing this item due to his residence being located less than 500 feet from the subject parcel.

Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Patsy Price, Project Manager, Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck, LLP; Scott Black, CEO, AIHS; and Detlev Peikert, Architect, RRM Design Group gave the Applicant presentation, joined by Beth Collins, Attorney, Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck, LLP to answer questions.

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m., and the following individuals spoke:

1. Bradley Hope
2. Jonathan Gartner
3. Alice Huang
4. Clara Bell

Public comment closed at 4:15 p.m.

Written correspondence from Sara Cunningham; Van Do-Reynoso, Santa Barbara County Public Health Director; Kurt Ransohoff, MD, CEO and CMO Sansum Clinic; Roderick Robles; David Selberg, CEO, Hospice of Santa Barbara, Inc.; Virginia Hedrick, Executive Director, California Consortium for Urban Indian Health; and Alice Huang, Chief Dental Officer, AIHS was acknowledged.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner Lodge:

- Believes that the uses proposed in the Specific Plan are appropriate and cannot think of any to be added or removed.
- Would support the medium high housing density which would allow up to 27 units per acre.
- The General Plan land use designation is appropriate.
- The project plans are utilizing the existing building and adding on to it to provide dental services and believes that it is very appropriate to the uses of the clinic and will be even more so when added on to it.
- There is plenty of parking.
- The proposed gardens get rid of some of the pavement which is good.
- Would like to proceed with Specific Plan, believes it is a Community Benefit Project, and recommends that Council move forward with the requested clinic.

Commissioner Wiscomb:

- The Specific Plan should include the medical offices with the medium high residential and 100% affordable.
- The Specific Plan should include the public agency for emergency services and the public improvements on State Street and Las Positas.
- There are uses in the OM Zone that she is not in favor of, including the mobilehome park, permanent recreational vehicle parks, and banks and financial institutions.
- Would like Staff to check if mobile home parks and solar energy systems can be removed from the OM Zone uses.
- The proposed General Plan land use designation is appropriate.
- Understands that the plans are concept and thinks that they are really great.
- Appreciates the 21% landscaping and the healing/wellness gardens associated with the plans.
- Can provide a recommendation to Council for the initiation of the Specific Plan and General Plan Amendment with her suggestions of the medical offices, public agency for emergency services, medium high housing and 100% affordable, and public improvements to State and Las Positas.

## Commissioner Bonderson:

- Agrees with Commissioner Wiscomb on every point she made.
- Not as firm with regard to allowing bank or financial institution use and would be more flexible on whether to include that use.
- In support of maximizing the designation of density for residential; not to force the current applicant to use the housing option, but to have that opportunity available in the future.
- Would love to see the entire project be mixed-use where the current design proposed would be on the first floor and housing could be on the second or third floor.
- Supports the presented project design in terms of both the architecture and landscape.
- Interested in seeing how this project might come to life having such a beautiful landscape area on the corner and outdoor uses for the property.
- Commends the applicant for thinking about the use of their parking lot area and having outdoor services due to the COVID-19 events.
- In agreement with Commissioner Wiscomb on the topics of Specific Plan, General Plan, and Initiation.
- Would like to make sure that the recommendation to Council is clear.

## Commissioner Reed:

- Generally supports the clinic use.
- Would like to keep the overarching uses as close to parks and open space as possible in order to be respectful of the lower density in the area and being adjacent to a public park.
- Recommends the low density residential.
- Supports restricting allowed uses to park and recreation facilities, public facilities, and medical and dental clinics.
- Supports including the public improvement recommendation.
- Supports the project plans.
- Supports the General Plan land use designation.
- Could make the recommendation to Council with his suggestions.

## Vice Chair Escobedo:

- The proposed uses are appropriate and he supports the medical offices and staging for emergency services.
- Would like to see a higher density, specifically medium high.
- Would like the following uses to be included in the specific plan: community care facilities for elderly care and hospices, daycare centers, supportive and transitional housing, and college and trade schools.
- Supports the proposed General Plan land use designation.
- Excited about the project design.
- In support of Commissioner Wiscomb's comments.
- Supports the healing garden, the additional landscaping, and common areas for patients to wait.
- Supports the bus shelter because it is a welcome improvement.
- In favor of the public improvements on Las Positas and State Street.
- Can support the initiation of a Specific Plan and General Plan amendment.

**IV. ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA**

**ACTUAL TIME: 4:56 P.M.**

**A. Committee and Liaison Reports:**

**1. Staff Hearing Officer Liaison Report**

No report.

**2. Other Committee and Liaison Reports**

- a. Commissioner Bonderson announced that the State Street Advisory Committee will be meeting on November 15, 2021.
- b. Commissioner Wiscomb reported on the November 8, 2021 meeting of the Plaza De La Guerra Working Group.

**V. ADJOURNMENT**

Vice Chair Escobedo adjourned the meeting at 4:58 p.m.

Submitted by,



Gillian Fennessy, Commission Secretary