



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 14, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Senior Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg (until 2:53 p.m.), Ooley, and Manuel (absent 1:52 – 2:53 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Lenvik

Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:53 p.m.); Burkhart; Ternovskaya; and Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 31, 2022**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/1. (Manuel abstained. Lenvik and Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 14, 2022**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner Manuel.
- Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Burkhart announced that the annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is in progress. The resignation deadline is Wednesday, September 21, 2022. The application deadline is Monday, October 10, 2022, at 5:00 p.m. The applications are now available online.
1. Commissioner Ensberg announced the following:
 - a. She will need to leave the meeting early.
 - b. She has reviewed the previous minutes and videos for Item 3, 630 Chapala St.
2. Chair Grumbine announced that there will be an architecture exhibit at the Thompson Gallery on Friday, September 16, 2022. Several architects will have their work displayed at the exhibit, including former HLC Commissioner Mahan.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:45PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 220 N LA CUMBRE RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-240-051
Zone: O-M/USS
Application Number: PLN2022-00186
Owner: Dale Fatham-Aazam; 200 N La Cumbre, LLP
Applicant: Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective

(The project consists of demolition of all existing commercial buildings on-site and construction of a new 48-unit multi-family residential development, including a community room, laundry and lobby. All units would be deed-restricted to Low and Very Low Income tenants, with ratios TBD. As a 100% affordable development, under the State's Density Bonus Program unlimited density is allowable, along with exceeding the height limitation of the zone (45'-0"). The project is proposed at a density of 38.71 units/acre, with a maximum height of approximately 53'-0". 71 vehicle parking spaces, including 10 designated for guest parking, are proposed. A partially subterranean garage is proposed for residential parking, with three stories of residential development above the garage.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, M.A., RPA of Stone Archaeological Consulting. The report was reviewed by Dr. Glassow, who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 1:39 p.m.

Present: Dr. Michael Glassow, University of California Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:41 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1426 BATH ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-061-023

Zone: R-MH

Application Number: PLN2022-00063

Owner: Genevieve Fox and Nic Scozzaro

Applicant: Susan Sherwin, HSA Studio

(The site contains a Queen Anne Free Classic Style residence constructed circa 1892 listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to demolish existing garages (one 2-car and one 1-car) and an adjacent storage area; construction of a new 650 square foot three-car garage with roof-deck above and associated paving; and permitting of an existing trash enclosure, on a 12,309 square foot lot in the R-MH zone. No work to existing residential triplex is proposed as part of this project.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by Allison Jaqua, M.A. of A Jaqua Consulting. The report was reviewed by Dr. Glassow, who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Allison Jaqua, M.A. of A Jaqua Consulting

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:47 TO 1:50 P.M. ***

(2:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

3. 630 CHAPALA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-001
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2021-00189
Owner: JoAnn Van Wyk
Applicant: Mary Meany Reichel, Tom Meaney, & Al Winsor; Lucon, Inc.

(The project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal for construction of a new three- and four-story mixed-use development with 5,119 square feet of commercial space and 31,617 square feet of residential space consisting of 39 rental units proposed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. A voluntary lot merger between 630 Chapala Street and 25 W. Ortega Street is proposed, as well as an ingress/egress easement with 17 W. Ortega Street. The project received a Concept Review by the Planning Commission (SBMC §30.150.060), and approval of a Community Benefit Height Exception (SBMC §30.140.110.B) to allow the project to exceed 48 ft. in height.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. The project was last reviewed on August 4, 2021.

Historic Significance Reports*

- [17 West Ortega Street](#)
- [9-15 West Ortega Street](#)
- [614 Chapala Street](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item due to prior work with the applicant.

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Al Winsor, Applicant; Tom Meaney, Applicant; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Arciniega stated that this is an AUD project which utilizes the Priority Housing Overlay density and is located on a lot size over 15,000 square-feet. The project received Concept Review by the Planning Commission (PC). The PC provided comments on the General Plan consistency as well as design comments. Overall, the PC had positive comments and found the project consistent with General Plan policies. Although there is no parking required/provided for the residential units, there is a parking requirement for the commercial units which the applicant has satisfied. The PC was excited about the pedestrian-friendly project. The PC noted that they would like to see the applicant provide e-bicycle spaces in addition to the required bicycle parking. Lastly, the PC approved the height exception, as they found the design and height generally acceptable.

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m.,

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Erin Carroll

Public comment closed at 2:13 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The project shall return for an in-progress review with details, including the weep screed and balcony details and design development. Particularly look at visual and/or sound screening at the balconies. Provide details regarding sound mitigation and assemblies. Show the tile details and other artistry details developed.
2. The Commission finds this to be an exemplary project and the architect has done great job working site and developing the project.
3. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate. And fit right in with the Paseo Nuevo project across the street.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources; the architecture is consistent and sensitive.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas; it is consistent with existing development on that street.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is very nice, appropriate and well-conceived.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:50PM) NEW ITEM: ONE-TIME PREAPPLICATION CONSULTATION

4. [2151 MISSION RIDGE RD](#)
Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-161-002
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PRE2022-00153
Owner: Theodore Bliss
Applicant: Will Sofrin; Will Sofrin, Inc.

(The project site contains a Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed between 1933-1935 listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal for a new detached two-story structure, consisting of a 751-square-foot three-car garage, with a 722-square-foot gym and 310-square-foot balcony above.)

One-time Pre-Application Consultation. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for a Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Will Sofrin; Applicant, Will Sofrin, Inc.

Public comment opened at 3:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Helen Couclelis was acknowledged.

Commission comments:

- The general site location and general footprint seem appropriate to the project and to the scale of house.
- The plate heights need to be reworked and lowered. Look at the main house as inspiration for the plate heights.
- Restudy lowering the garage doors as low as practically possible.
- Look at the dormers of the main house as a potential way of breaking up the mass of the roof and adding some poetry.
- Restudy the balcony and look at examples from Edwards and Plunkett of wood balconies as well as other types of balconies, potentially with plaster at the lower level.
- The doors and windows of divisions of the main house are appropriate, make sure to incorporate them in the drawings. Provide thorough photographs, especially of the historic parts of house for reference, as well as Edwards and Plunkett or similar inspirational images from other projects that are historic.
- Look at providing asymmetry in the composition to break up the massing.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:28 P.M. ***