



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

DECEMBER 7, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Butler, Doordan, Drury (until 4:52 p.m.), Ensberg, Ooley (at 1:38), and Manuel

Commissioners absent: Hausz and Lenvik

Staff present: Kokinda, Hernandez, Burkhart, and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Paulina Conn, Kevin Boss, Francesca Galt, Kevin Boss, and Anne Petersen was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 9, 2022**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Butler, 4/0/3. (Doordan, Drury, Manuel abstained. Hausz, Ooley, and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 23, 2022** as reviewed by Commissioner Hausz, and **December 7, 2022**, as reviewed by Chair Grumbine and Commissioner Manuel.

Action: Drury/Doordan, 5/0/2. (Drury and Ooley abstained. Hausz and Lenvik absent.)
Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Kokinda announced the following:
 - a. Commissioners Ooley and Doordan have been reappointed to the Historic Landmarks Commission
 - b. Special acknowledgment to Commissioner Manuel who will stay on as the Commission's Landscape architect as there were no applications to fill the vacancy.
 - c. Ms. Kokinda is working on the Downtown team and Tess Harris on status of State Street and the roles of HLC and City Council. Currently under the Economic Recovery Extension and Transition Ordinance, and the City will be enforcing the requirements starting Feb 1, 2023.
 - d. It is suggested that the Commission members read the Objective Design standards and submit feedback.
2. Ms. Harris announced the State St. community design workshops on December 9th and December 10th.
3. Ms. Hernandez announced that she has emailed the Commissioners the Professional Qualification forms required by the State Historic Preservation office and asks that Commissioners sign and return them.
4. Commissioner Drury announced he will be leaving at 5:15 pm.
5. Commissioner Grumbine announced he will be leaving at 4:30 if possible.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Grumbine reported that he and Commissioner Ensberg met with staff regarding State St. and there will be further discussion on a future agenda.

Commissioner Ooley will be participating next year in the designation subcommittee meeting

**(1:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: CITY LANDMARK DESIGNATION
RECOMMENDATION**

1. STATE STREET PARKWAY FROM MISSION STREET TO CONSTANCE AVENUE

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-870
Reference Number: PLN2022-00033
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of resolution 2022-03 to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of the State Street Parkway from Mission Street to Constance Avenue from the 2000 Block of State Street to the 2500 Block of State Street. The proposal was last reviewed on October 26, 2022.)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

[HLC Resolution 2022-03*](#)

[Attachment A: UEA State St Median WC*](#)

[Attachment B: Nomination Packet*](#)

[Attachment C: City Park Commission Meeting Minutes Excerpts from 1924*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Barron
2. Fred Sweeney
3. Mary Louise Days

Written correspondence from Susan Gantz was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:56 p.m.

Public comment reopened at 2:07 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Fred Sweeney

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2022-03 to designate State Street Parkway From Mission Street To Constance Avenue as a City Landmark with the comment that the language "or similar" is to be stricken from the resolution as it relates to the Pindo palms.

Action: Manuel/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**2. 618 SIERRA STREET**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-404-006
Zone: R-2
Reference Number: PLN2022-00033
Owner: Jane Hway-Jain Sun Living Trust 10/9/96
Jane Sun, Trustee
Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adopting resolution 2022-07 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival Style house constructed in 1927.)

Historic Significance Report***HLC Resolution 2022-07***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from David Jones was acknowledged.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2022-07 to designate 618 Sierra St St. as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Butler/Doordan, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(2:15PM) NEW ITEM: ARCHAEOLOGICAL REPORT & CONCEPT REVIEW**3. 710 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-013
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00325
Owner: 710 State St Partners
James P. Knell, General Partner
Applicant: Kevin Moore, Kevin Moore Architect

(The project site is located within El Pueblo Viejo, Part I. The project consists of a proposal to construct a 32,799-square-foot, four-story, 66-room hotel including a restaurant/bar and conference rooms on six lots totaling 30,004 square feet. The project also includes 16 parking spaces on the ground floor. A Lot Merger is required for the properties at 710-720 State Street and 15 E. Ortega Street. The 14,455-square-foot buildings at 710 State Street (including 19 E. Ortega) and the 1,000-square-foot building at 19 E. Ortega are proposed to be demolished. The remaining 6,071 square feet of existing nonresidential development will remain (714-720 State Street).)

A. Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, R.P.A. of Stone Archaeological Consulting. The report was reviewed by Dr. Glassow, who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

B. Concept Review. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Neighborhood Compatibility Findings will be required for a Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting; Kevin Moore, Architect, Kevin Moore Architect; Jennifer McIsaac; and Kelly Brodison, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison stated that initially there was a visually similar project for housing, but that project was withdrawn. This project is similar in footprint and height, except the use has changed. The project can either be continued back to the Commission or continued to Planning Commission for review.

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment reopened at 2:52, and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Pamela Boehr was acknowledged.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Doordan/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with the following comments:

1. In general, the mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable and are going in the right direction.
2. The paseo is solving spatial issues and the Commission welcomes the design of it, and the thinking as the next lots get developed and is sensitive to the neighbors them is to be commended.
3. The setbacks from State St. and the way of which it is been handled is acceptable.
4. The Commission recommends to study the entrance off State St. with the suggestion of a 3rd arch as a way to making the entry to the paseo celebrated and special.
5. Study the transparency of some of the railings and balconies, especially for the rooms, for more privacy. Study semitransparent balconies as opposed to transparent iron.
6. The signage and branding and how the hotel is expressed is important and should be developed and looked at.
7. The Commission would like to see color renderings walking through the paseo as it will be an important experiential component.
8. There is some concern with the sequence of the hotel check in and how it will work out practically, and where the gate and control points will be. Develop that more as the project goes forward.
9. Study reducing the height of the rooftop trellis structure.
10. Study views of trellis from down the paseo and how visible it is.
11. Further color study is needed and the Commission encourages colors that are beautiful and standout.

Action: Ensberg/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(2:55PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**4. 1118 E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001
Zone: P-R/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2022-00345
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Sean Stewart, Project Planner
City of Santa Barbara Parks & Recreation

(The project site contains the Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa, a designated Structure of Merit, designed by architects Roland Sauter, Keith Lockard, and Windsor Soule, and constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposal for installation of an 87-linear-foot glass windscreen and iron gate, 42" in height, along the west corner of the Cabrillo Pavilion portico. The applicant is seeking a Level 1 Substantial Conformance Determination to PLN2014-00248 and CDP2015-00004.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alteration Findings are required. The project was last reviewed on October 12, 2022.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:19 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect, DMHA; Lindsey Campbell, DMHA; and Sean Stewart, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following comments:

1. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
2. The exterior alterations are being made primarily for, and will substantially advance, restoration of the Historic Resource to its original appearance
3. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/0. (Manuel, Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:43 TO 4:03 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

5. 1426 BATH ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-061-023
Zone: R-MH
Application Number: PLN2022-00063
Owner: Nic Scozzaro and Genevieve Fox
Applicant: Susan Sherwin, HAS Studio Inc.

(The site contains a Queen Anne Free Classic Style residence constructed c. 1892 listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to demolish existing garages (one 2-car and one 1-car) and an adjacent storage area; construction of a new 650 square foot three-car garage with roof-deck above and associated paving; and permitting of an existing trash enclosure, on a 12,309 square foot lot in the R-MH zone. No work to existing residential triplex is proposed as part of this project.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. The project was last reviewed on October 26, 2022.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:03p.m.

Present: Susan Sherwin, Architect, HAS Studio Inc.; and Nic Scozzaro, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue two weeks to Consent with the following comments:

1. The Applicant shall look at additional lighting, especially decorative lighting.
2. The Applicant shall adjust the railing, both in the posts of the rail to correspond to the rhythm of the structure below, and the top rail of it to be lighter and more in keeping with the architectural language of the house.
3. Study adding an edge board along the top of the shingles where the garage walls meet the deck above.
4. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.

e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.

f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Drury/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(3:45PM) NEW ITEM: PHASE 1 AND PHASE 2 HISTORIC STRUCTURES/SITES REPORTS & CONCEPT REVIEW

6. 1242 DOVER LN

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-203-002

Zone: RS-15

Application Number: PLN2022-00411

Owner: Margaret Phelps

Applicant: Will Sofrin, Will Sofrin Inc.

(The residence is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal for demolition of a 216-square-foot single-story addition, a 91-square-foot portion of the porch, and a 56-square-foot exterior staircase at the rear (south) of the residence, and a 154-square-foot covered porch addition at the western side of the residence; construction of a new 1,843-square-foot two-story addition (plus basement) and a 211-square-foot extension to the porch (includes new staircase) at the rear of the residence; and a re-roof to replace the existing clay S-tile material with two-piece Mission tile throughout.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post Hazeltine. The report concluded that the residence is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit.

B. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post Hazeltine. The report concluded the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).

C. Concept Review. No final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for a Project Design Approval. This project was reviewed on a Pre-application (PRE2022-00158) on September 28, 2022.

Phase 1 Historic Structures/ Sites Report*

Phase 2 Historic Structures/ Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:25 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine; Pamela Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine; Will Sofrin, Architect, Will Sofrin Inc.; Nathaniel, Design Team; Peg Phelps, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment reopened at 4:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Accept the Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates**

Action: Drury/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: **Continue indefinitely, the phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report and project, with the following comments:**

1. Overall, the design is favorable.
2. The mass, bulk, and scale is supportable as designed with minor recommendations which include:
 - a. On the southwest perspective, both the 3rd story elevation and side elevation need to be restudied with the suggestion of looking at full alignment of planes as well as looking at aligning the top story gable on the side elevation with the wall below.
 - b. On the 3rd story elevation, look at potentially overhanging the upper two stories with corbels in a manner similar to what is being done on the front.
3. The upper-level balcony of the gable facing out on the southwest perspective is too large; study making smaller.
4. A dark brown balcony color, stained or painted, is more appropriate than a white balcony for this Monterey style balcony.
5. As the project moves forward, lighting and landscape design will be important, especially in the pool facing areas and the large plaster walls.
6. Study and refine the three, square openings on the lowest level facing the pool by aligning the placement so there are equal walls on either side, and/or narrowing the space of the opening division, or another solution.
7. The surface texture is to be consistent with the existing and illustrate the texture on future renderings.
8. At least half of the Commission believes all wood railings would be better than a mix of wood and iron.
9. The research into the property and into other Cooke designs is excellent.
10. The Commission believes that going to plaster eaves for both fire and in a way that's appropriate for other Cooke architecture is convincing and acceptable.
11. In general, the design of the new door and window openings are going in the right direction by matching existing proportions, sizes, divisions, and muntins.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Drury, and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:40 P.M. ***