



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

APRIL 13, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Acting Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Senior Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (until 3:15 p.m.), Butler, Drury, Lenvik, Ooley (at 1:41 p.m.), and Manuel (absent 1:53 – 2:43 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: Doordan and Drury
Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:00 p.m.); Burkhart; William Russell, Assistant Planner; and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **March 30, 2022**, as submitted.
Action: Lenvik/Butler, 5/0/2. (Manuel and Hausz abstained. Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 13, 2022**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and Manuel.

Action: Manuel/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Commissioner Manuel announced that he will be absent from the next Consent and Full Commission HLC Meetings.

2. Ms. Burkhart announced the following:

a. The semi-annual recruitment for City Advisory Group Members is in progress. The resignation deadline is Thursday, April 21, 2022. The deadline for applications is Monday, May 9, 2022 at 5:00 p.m.

b. Item 3, 931 Anacapa St. has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

3. Ms. Kokinda announced that a joint special meeting between the HLC and the Plaza De La Guerra Advisory Committee will be held on April 22, 2022 at 8:30 a.m. at the Faulkner Gallery.

4. Vice Chair Hausz requested that an item is agendaized regarding meeting protocol and remote public comment.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

(1:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM

1. GENERAL PLAN HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATE

Reference Number: PLN2022-00033

Staff: Jessica Metzger, Planning Division

(A brief presentation on the General Plan Amendment to update the Housing Element of the City's General Plan in accordance with state housing element law.)

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: Jessica Metzger, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

(2:00PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

2. 400 W CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-261-009
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PRE2022-00027
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Christine Pierron, Cearnal Collective

(The project site is located within the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The project consists of demolition of the existing parking lot and removal of 15 mature on site Tipuana Tipu trees, and construction of a three- and four-story residential structure with 63 rental units. Parking for the residences would be provided in a combination of surface lot and garage parking. The apartments are proposed as 100% rent controlled moderate (80-120% AMI) and middle (120-160% AMI) income affordable apartments operated by the Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara. Modifications are requested for the proposed density and exceeding the 45-foot height limit.)

One-time Concept Review. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item due to a conflict of interest with the Owner.

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: Christine Pierron, Applicant, Cearnal Collective; Rob Fredericks, Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara; Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Commission comments:

- The Commission understands the need for affordable housing in Santa Barbara and is very encouraging of the project in general.
- Regarding this particular project at this location, the Commission is concerned with the size, bulk, and scale of the project, especially regarding the Castillo Street elevation and the way in which it interacts with one and two-story houses beyond.
- In general, the Commission is supportive of larger massing on the corner, especially on Carrillo Street, and smaller massing and greater setbacks on Castillo Street. One potential way to get more setbacks is to look at the interior courtyard as a possibility for moving portions of the building.
- Most Commissioners were not convinced that the internal courtyard adds a lot to the project and it may be helpful to remove portions of the courtyard.
- The architecture as designed along Castillo Street and Carrillo Street and the breaking up of the massing and articulation is preferable to the elevations along the freeway side, as well as the side facing the single family neighborhood.
- There is a concern regarding the 45-foot height element and that while this particular execution of the element is supportable by most Commissioners, the overall height of the project needs to be reduced. There is understanding that this is a design element and it needs to be considered in that context.

- At the next review, provide views coming down Carrillo Street and leaving Santa Barbara, as well as an aerial view around the building so that the Commission can understand the bird's eye view and design. Provide the approximate sizes of the trees in the renderings using Google Earth.
- The Commission finds the planting plan and proposal to remove the Tipuana Tipu trees acceptable.
- One Commissioner is not fond of the eyebrows of tile formed over the roof elements.

(2:45PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

3. 931 ANACAPA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-047
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2021-00460
Owner: Kenneth Huang, MFUG Union Bank
Applicant: Yamel Grijalva, Ware Malcomb

(Project is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and is adjacent to El Castillo Building that was constructed in 1926 and is listed as on the Historic Resources Inventory and contributes to the historic significance of the district. The project proposes to demolish 1,062 square feet of driveway and parking area paving to replace with new paving to match existing, reconfigure the path of travel, and to restripe the entire lot to meet accessibility requirements; a new 4'-0" wide curb cut and opening of the existing wall at the northwest elevation to be patched with reused stone; and new pavers and handrails at the existing ramp on the northeast elevation. The existing stone wall and guard rail will remain.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. Project was last reviewed on March 30, 2022.

Item 3 postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:43 TO 3:14 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

4. 524 CHAPALA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-004
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2021-00518
Owner: Jewish Federation of Greater Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jan Hochhauser, Hochhauser Blatter Associates

(The project site is located within the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Proposal for a 323 square foot addition to an existing single-story commercial building. Project includes renovation of the existing Chapala Street façade, and landscape and hardscape improvements to the parking lot.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. Project was last reviewed on March 30, 2022.

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Applicant, Hochhauser Blatter Architecture & Planning; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Ron Zonen, Jewish Federation of Greater Santa Barbara; and Lauren Katz, President, Jewish Federation of Greater Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:26 TO 4:28 P.M. ***

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Commission prefers the pots on the landscaping plan to not to be square, but rather more El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) consistent and preferably round.
2. The lighting wall wash and other details shall to be continued for review at Final Approval. In general, the lighting plan looks good and is supportable.
3. The Commission appreciates the additional design and adjustments made to the kitchen entry and wall. They look proportionally acceptable and the wall articulation is acceptable.
4. The tile and openings are a step in the right direction. The Commission appreciates the color choice and reasoning behind it, but they need to be integrated in more EPV Spanish way.
5. The Commission appreciates the additional studies done on the main entry design and canopy, however this element is still in need of more refinement. Its' complexity in combining the columns, arch, tilework, and metal awning needs to be resolved in a better way. The applicant shall provide additional study and options. This proposal is acceptable for initial Project Design Approval, with more refinement needed at Final Approval review.
6. One Commissioner would like to see more wall profile adjustments for the mission gable parapet wall. All Commissioners feel that the general size is acceptable, with small molding above the mission gable and with larger molding above the flanking walls.
7. Regarding the glass doors and window muntins, one Commissioner would like to see more horizontal muntins, with at least two more horizontal muntins for both sets of doors and skylights. The other Commissioners find the drawings acceptable as proposed.
8. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project. The building will become more compatible with its neighborhood than it is currently.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are acceptable.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Doordan and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Amended**Motion:****Project Design Approval and continue two weeks with comments:**

1. The Commission prefers the pots on the landscaping plan to not to be square, but rather more El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) consistent and preferably round.
2. The lighting wall wash and other details shall to be continued for review at Final Approval. In general, the lighting plan looks good and is supportable.
3. The Commission appreciates the additional design and adjustments made to the kitchen wall and entry. They look proportionally acceptable and the wall articulation is acceptable.
4. The tile and openings are a step in the right direction. The Commission appreciates the color choice and reasoning behind it, but they need to be integrated in more EPV Spanish way.
5. The Commission appreciates the additional studies done on the main entry design and canopy, however this element is still in need of more refinement. Its' complexity in combining the columns, arch, tilework, and metal awning needs to be resolved in a better way. The applicant shall provide additional study and options. This proposal is acceptable for initial Project Design Approval, with more refinement needed at Final Approval review.
6. One Commissioner would like to see more wall profile adjustments for the mission gable parapet wall. All Commissioners feel that the general size is acceptable, with small molding above the mission gable and with larger molding above the flanking walls.
7. Regarding the glass doors and window muntins, one Commissioner would like to see more horizontal muntins, with at least two more horizontal muntins for both sets of doors and skylights. The other Commissioners find the drawings acceptable as proposed.
8. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project. The building will become more compatible with its neighborhood than it is currently.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are acceptable.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action:

Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Doordan and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:36 P.M. ***