



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 17, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan (until 5:26 p.m.), Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure (until 6:11 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: Ooley
Staff present: Ted Hamilton- Rolle, Acting Design Review Supervisor (at 4:46 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:27 p.m.), Reidel, and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Cheri Rae
2. Richard Closson
3. Lisa Ballantine

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **June 26, 2024**, as submitted.
Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 17, 2024**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Doordan/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Consent Calendar July 17, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Concept Review 630 Garden Street	APN: 031-160-015 PLN: 2024-00199 Zone: M-C	City of Santa Barbara / Maja Adamski, Representative Member	Continue indefinitely
2.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 803 Laguna St	APN: 031-021-010 PLN: 2024-00092 Zone: C-G	Christina Songer, Laguna Cottages / Thomas Moore	Project Design Approval and Final Approval
3.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 800 Alvarado Pl	APN: 019-170-022 PLN: 2024-00205 Zone: R-2/4.0/R-H	El Encanto, Inc. Janis Clapoff, General Manager/Joe Andrulaitis, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects	Continue two weeks to the Full Commission
4.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 210 E Ortega St	APN:031-152-002 PLN: 2024-00073 Zone: M-C	Jade Capital LLC; Tyler Rameson, Representative Member/ Jennifer Macisaac, Kevin Moore Architect	Continue indefinitely
5.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 316 W Anapamu St	APN:039-162-027 PLN: 2024-00190 Zone: R-MH	Draghi 316 Anapamu LLC / Patricia Sherman, Managing Member	Continue two weeks

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

- Ms. Reidel announced that solar panels are exempt from HLC review; however any proposed supporting structure, such as a trellis, would be subject to HLC review.
- Commissioner Lenvik announced he will not be in attendance at the July 31, 2024 HLC hearing.
- Commissioner Ensberg requested the following:
 - A discussion on the draft El Pueblo Viejo outdoor dining standards created by the State Street Interim Working Group.
 - A discussion on the creation of a local Department for Historic Preservation.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

Commissioner Doordan reported on the Objective Development Design Standards Working Group.

(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. EAST ANAPAMU ITALIAN STONE PINES

Reference Number: PLN2024-00003

Staff: Nathan Slack, Urban Forest Superintendent

(Designated Landmark Trees, the Doremus Italian Stone Pines. Staff presentation and discussion regarding the East Anapamu Italian Stone Pines.)

No final appealable decision will take place at this hearing. Staff requests feedback from the Historic Landmarks Commission on options and opportunities for replanting East Anapamu Street.

Staff Report*

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](https://santabarbaraca.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: Nathan Slack, Urban Forest Superintendent

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated in the Historic Resources related definitions under 30.300.080 "H" of the Santa Barbara Historic Municipal Code that a Landmarked tree is defined as a Historic tree and treatment and jurisdiction of historic trees are found under section 15.24.10. Final decisions on Historic trees are under the purview of the Parks and Recreation Commission based on recommendations from HLC and the Street Tree Advisory Committee.

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Cheri Rae
2. Richard Closson
3. Monie de Wit
4. Emma Brinkman
5. Christine Neuhauser
6. Kristen Sneddon

Public comment closed at 2:45 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission supports keeping the Italian Stone Pines as the designated street tree for the 300-800 blocks of East Anapamu Street.
2. Study utilizing root barriers or mitigation measures to reduce the stress on the East Anapamu Italian Stone Pines. Suggestion to eliminate a couple parking spaces per block to allow for more root space.

3. The original East Anapamu Italian Stone Pines will be gone in the next 100 years, so it is important to have a long-term plan for replacement of the street canopy.
4. The Commission requests that the Parks and Recreation department involve the HLC in communications on projects relevant to the Commission early on in the process, even if HLC approval is not required.
5. The Commission requests that City Council direct staff to revise the Municipal Code to include HLC as a decision maker for Landmark trees similar to those in historic districts.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:27 TO 3:34 P.M. ***

(2:45PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

2. 900 PHILINDA AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-018
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PRE2024-00088
Owner/Applicant: Desoni Management, LLC
Vadim Kotlyar, Representative Member

(Designated a City Landmark, the Live Oak Dairy Building was designed in 1939 by Alexander D'Alfonso in the Streamline Moderne style. Proposal to relocate the iconic cow statue, which is a character defining feature.)

Request for feedback from the Historic Landmarks Commission on options for the new cow statue location.

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Item postponed to the August 14, 2024 agenda.

(3:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

3. 36 E VICTORIA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-006
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2023-00230
Owner: Christ Presbyterian Church
Jordan Bentley, Representative Member
Applicant: Lizette Elenes, ERA Architects

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal for 2,988 square feet of additional floor area to two existing buildings on two separate parcels, resulting in a new combined building totaling 15,919 square feet. Additions include: 237 square feet of ground level infill to an existing recessed entry, a new 452 square foot mezzanine level, and a new 2,299 square foot upper level. Project includes a new roof deck, exterior alterations to the existing facades, eight short-term bicycle parking spaces, and a lot merger to combine the two parcels. Project requires approval of a Development Plan.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Development Plan Findings are required. Project last reviewed on May 22, 2024.

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Lizette Elenes, ERA Architects; Jordan Bottenfield, Bottenfield Construction; Terry Bottenfield, Bottenfield Construction; and Kyle Wells, Minister, Christ Presbyterian Church

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Dan Burnham was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Commissions thanks the Applicant for their continued work on the design.
2. Integrate the lights over the door as down lights with an option of decorative lights.
3. Check the accuracy of the 3D model for the height of wall above the openings to ensure it corresponds to the elevations.
4. Suggestion to study blade signs around Santa Barbara that have been approved by the Sign Committee to find a blade sign that will be supportable.
5. The window treatments/glazing should be the same for all windows.
6. Study the bell tower, focusing on a single bell and bringing the width more in line with the pier below.
7. Suggestion to add color variation to the pots on the paseo side.
8. Suggestion to add solid tile underneath the windows to add more color.
9. Choose a brighter, stronger color for the window frames and mullions. Add more contrast between the body of the building and the window frame color.
10. Study the pot size for the vine on the upper level. Return with a landscape plan showing the species and pot specifications.
11. Return with physical color samples or color board.
12. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
13. The Commission makes the following Development Plan Approval findings:
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title.
 - b. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning.
 - c. The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community's aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk, or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project

Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code.

- d. The proposed development is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy (as approved by City Resolution No. 13-010 dated as of March 12, 2013) as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 28.85.050. (Ord. 5609, 2013.)

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(3:45PM) PRE APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT PROGRAM (ITEMS 4-7)

Staff: Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Acting Design Review Supervisor

(In compliance with Assembly Bill 1332, the City is implementing a program to provide for the pre-approval of accessory dwelling unit (ADU) plans. To gain pre-approval of their ADU design, a designer must receive an affirmative vote from at least one of the City's design review bodies (Architectural Board of Review, Single Family Design Board, and/or Historic Landmarks Commission). Once an ADU design has been approved by a design review body, the designer may submit working construction drawings to the City's Building & Safety Division for review of Building, Zoning, and Fire code compliance. Approved designs will be posted on the City's website with the designer's contact information so that anyone may contact the designer to purchase the pre-approved plan set. Pre-approved ADU plan sets are subject to shorter permitting deadlines in an effort to streamline housing production.)

4. PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS

Application Number: PRE2024-00096

Applicant: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Proposal for Design Option A: Gable Roof, Traditional or Spanish Style and Design Option B: Flat Roof w/Parapet, Spanish Colonial Style.

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A & B. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable.

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton-Rolle stated that the City is required by State law to implement a process for the pre-approval of ADUs. The goal of the program is to facilitate a faster, lower cost permit path for these small one-story ADUs. Applicants can still choose to go through the normal process, but this program provides an alternative option. Staff is the final decision maker; however, staff will rely heavily on the Commission's recommendations.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue Design Option A indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission feels this design is appropriate for post-World War II modern Historic Resources.
2. Add board and batton all the way around to soften the design.
3. Lower the plate height to 8 feet.
4. The roof plate feels very thin and should have exposed 2x6 inch, 16 inches on center rafter tails.
5. The design lacks character and should communicate post-World War II modern style.
6. Add a beam at the corner of the building that projects out to support the overhang and a ridge beam.
7. Add a casing around the doors and windows in a post-World War II modern style.
8. Remove the bathroom window and consider a skylight instead.
9. Eliminate the single window in the bedroom and replace it with two windows on either side of the bed.
10. Remove the transom above the door.
11. Add two windows in the dining room instead of one.
12. Windows shall be bronze anodized aluminum sliders or better.
13. Study 60s/70s post-World War II modern style lighting.
14. The color palette should match the existing house.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (Doordan and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue Design Option B indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission feels this design is appropriate for flat roof Spanish style.
2. Add horizontal muntins to the windows.
3. Inset the windows as far as possible.
4. Remove the transom window above the door.
5. Drop the plate height to 8 feet.
6. The doors and windows should have a 6'8" head height.
7. Parapet detail should be proper historic El Pueblo Viejo (EPV).
8. The windows should be wood or wood clad casements.
9. The door needs to be Spanish style.
10. Include an option with the bathroom window removed and a skylight included instead.
11. The light fixtures should be wrought iron.
12. Leader heads and down spouts should be painted metal.

Action: Ensberg/Drury, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

5. PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS

Application Number: PRE2024-00097

Applicant: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Proposal for Design Option A: Gable Roof, Traditional or Spanish Style and Design Option B: Flat Roof w/Parapet, Spanish Colonial Style.

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A & B. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable.

Actual time: 6:04 p.m.

Present: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Public comment opened at 6:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue Design Option B indefinitely with comments:

1. Top trellis members need to be minimum 3 inches and include a detail on the ends.
2. Support posts shall be minimum 6x6 inch posts and beams.
3. The sliding glass doors need to be French doors with muntins/divided lights.
4. All windows should be 6'8" head height.
5. Recess the windows as deeply in the wall as possible.
6. The light fixture should be wrought iron.
7. Leader heads and downspouts should be painted metal.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue Design Option A indefinitely with comments:

1. Top trellis members need to be minimum 3 inches and include a detail on the ends.
2. Support posts shall be minimum 6x6 inch posts and beams.
3. Change the roof to a 2-piece Spanish tile roof with a double starter course row and a mortar bird stop.
4. Change the gable ends to hipped ends.
5. The light fixture should be wrought iron.
6. Change the horizontal window to a vertical window.
7. Remove the overhang.
8. Include a half round gutter.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

6. PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT

Application Number: PRE2024-00103

Applicant: Adam Stickels

Proposal for Design Option A: Gable Roof, Spanish Colonial Style.

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable.

Actual time: 6:23 p.m.

Present: Adam Stickels, Applicant

Public comment opened at 6:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue Design Option A indefinitely with comments:

1. Lower the chimney and eliminate the tile running across the eave line.
2. Move the chimney to the corner and remove the flaring at the corner.

3. Study Spanish style chimney examples and return with a couple of options.
4. Eliminate the light fixture on the wall of the back patio and study more Spanish lighting.
5. The wall on the left side of the entry door should be at least 8 inches wide.
6. Study a decorative element for the entry door opening.
7. Change the door to a V-groove vertical board wood or appropriate Spanish Style.
8. Add a pendant light to the door alcove.
9. Change the windows to 6 lights instead of 4.
10. Center the downspout between the front door and the window.
11. Add a tooled drip on the inside of the window heads.
12. Study more traditional Spanish style lighting.

Action: Butler/Drury, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

7. **PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS**

Application Number: PRE2024-00105

Applicant: Lucrezia DeLeon, Itzi House

Proposal for Design Option A: Craftsman Style (250 SF); Design Option B: Spanish Colonial Style (250 SF); Design Option C: Spanish Colonial Style (400 SF); Design Option D: Craftsman Style (400 SF).

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A, B, C, & D. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable.

Actual time: 6:43 p.m.

Present: Lucrezia DeLeon, Itzi House

Public comment opened at 6:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue Design Options A and D indefinitely with comments:

1. The color should match the existing house.
2. Change the siding to horizontal siding.
3. Study columns on historic craftsman styles in Santa Barbara.
4. Eliminate the column inset into the building.
5. Add casings around the doors and windows.
6. The eave overhang should be 18 inches. Add open rafter tails to the ends.
7. The roof should be dimensional asphalt shingles.
8. Include options for an ogee and half round gutter in painted or copper finish.
9. Look at the EPV Design Guidelines for Craftsman style.

Action: Drury/Butler, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue Design Options B and C indefinitely with comments:

1. Change the light by the front door to a pendant light.
2. Change the square windows to two vertical rectangular windows with 6 lights.
3. Drop the arches on the side elevations of the porch and make them flat.
4. Make the pier on the side of the porch as wide as it is on the front side.
5. The porch columns should be 8 inches thick.

6. Pull the upper and right windows away from the corner.
 7. Include options for an ogee and half round gutter in painted or copper.
 8. The decorative lights should be wrought iron traditional Spanish style.
 9. Add an option to include a back door.
 10. The weep screed should have a traditional Spanish style look.
- Action: Ensberg/Drury, 6/0/0. (Doordan, Ooley, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:23 P.M. ***