



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 16, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (at 1:32 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:04 p.m.), Hernandez (absent 2:21-4:30 p.m.), Megan Arciniega, Project Planner (from 3:26-4:13 p.m.), Pilar Pummer, Associate Planner (from 2:21-3:26 p.m.), Reidel, and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Kevin Boss, Randy Fox, and Kevin Boss was acknowledged.

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 2, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/1/0. Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Lenvik stated that he believes the minutes regarding Item

4 do not adequately reflect the discussion that occurred at the hearing.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 16, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and McClure.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Reidel announced that Item 6, 1002 Anacapa St, is postponed until August 30, 2023 at the Applicant's request.
2. Commissioner Ooley announced he will be absent from the August 30, 2023 meeting.
3. Commissioner Ensberg requested updates on communications with City Council regarding HLC purview, particularly regarding outdoor dining in El Pueblo Viejo.
4. Commissioner Drury announced that he needs to leave by 5:30 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the upcoming State Street Advisory Committee meeting.

(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. IDENTIFYING AND DOCUMENTING HISTORIC RESOURCES IN EPV

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(The City's Architectural Historian will present a training on identifying and documenting historic resources in the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Training held.

(1:50PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM**2. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATIONS**

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans and recommend to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contracts for the properties listed below. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plans meet the criteria outlined in Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and have been recommended for HLC review by the HLC Designation Subcommittee at their meeting on July 18, 2023.)

1. 1426 Bath Street, Structure of Merit[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**2. 427 D East Micheltorena Street, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**3. 1733 Mountain Avenue, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**4. 2419 State Street, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**5. 1335 Bath Street, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**6. 1713 Lasuen Road, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC under staff reports.*

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approve the Mills Act contracts for 426 Bath Street, 427 D East Micheltorena Street, 1733 Mountain Avenue, 2419 State Street, 1335 Bath Street, and 1713 Lasuen Road.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:10PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM**3. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATIONS**

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans and recommend to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contracts for the properties listed below. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plans meet the criteria outlined in Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and have been recommended for HLC review by the HLC Designation Subcommittee at their meeting on July 18, 2023.)

1. 431 East Valerio Street, Structure of Merit[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**2. 101 West Canon Perdido Street, Contributing Historic Resource to El Pueblo Viejo**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**3. 115 East Islay Street, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**4. 1538 Alameda Padre Serra, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**5. 24 East Pedregosa Street, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**6. 820 Cima Linda Road, Structure of Merit**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**7. 117 West Mason Street, Structure of Merit, Requesting renewal of 10-year contract, Requires City Council approval of renewal.**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)**8. 2112 Santa Barbara (E Padres Address) Landmark, Requesting renewal of 10-year contract, Requires City Council approval of renewal.**[Significance report*](#)[10-year proposed scope of work*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC under staff reports.*

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. William Plummer

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

Motion: Recommend to City Council to approve the Mills Act contracts for 431 East Valerio Street, 101 West Canon Perdido Street, 115 East Islay Street, 1538 Alameda Padre Serra, 24 East Pedregosa Street, 820 Cima Linda Road, 117 West Mason Street, and 2112 Santa Barbara St.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 123 E CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-015

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2023-00200

Owner: Maple Investments, LLC

Barbara S. Botts, Representative Member

Applicant: Ellen Bildsten, Bildsten Architecture and Planning

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to construct a new three-story residential apartment complex with a small commercial office fronting Carrillo Street. The development is comprised of three building volumes: one dedicated to units under the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive (AUD) Program comprised of three 2bed/1bath units with an average unit size of 962 square feet, a central stairway structure, and a mixed-use building comprised of ground floor waste/recycling and bike storage, a 287-square-foot commercial office, and an 850-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) occupying the second and third floor. The project includes exterior balconies and roof decks with solar array on supporting trellis structures and planters. Staff Hearing Officer review and approval for building attachments is required.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: Erica Obertelli, Architect, Bildsten Architecture and Planning; Ellen Bildsten, Architect, Bildsten Architecture and Planning; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Pummer stated that this is the first conceptual review for the project. The Applicant is looking for Historic Landmark Commission's overall feedback on the general design of the project and comments on size, mass, bulk and scale. The project will require Staff Hearing Officer review and

approval of building attachment modifications for the walkways connecting the front and rear buildings to the central staircase building.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for a good presentation.
2. In general, the Commission is supportive of the mass, bulk, and scale with refinements.
3. The Commission understands that the size of building and size constraints of the site are a challenge.
4. Restudy the front design facing Carrillo Street, as it needs to be reworked into a more Spanish Colonial Revival or EPV style.
5. Restudy the windows to add traditional rhythms and poetry.
6. Study deepening the walls to help create shadows, especially on the front building facing Carrillo Street.
7. In general, study going stronger into the Spanish Colonial Revival style, especially in the details.
8. Study incorporating additional clay tiles.
9. Study deepening the planters at the roof decks for the plant health and to allow for height of plantings, even if that would require a taller parapet wall.
10. Study lowering the trellis structures on the roof deck as they currently feel too elongated and top heavy. As part of the study, consider making the trellis structures solid to hide the solar panels.
11. Study the balconies and projections at the rear building. Study other wrought iron balconies and provide precedent examples.
12. Restudy the front arch. The arch should be either a full roman arch, or a segmented arch.
13. Study the mailbox and wall plane intersection so that it doesn't have the cantilever.
14. A suggestion is to study adding plaster texture as a way of ornamenting the building.
15. In general, the exterior walkways connecting the buildings are supportable, however study Spanish Colonial style walkway connectors and provide examples in your next review. Study La Arcada and others as inspiration.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(3:15PM) REVISED PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

5. [630 CHAPALA ST, 17 W ORTEGA ST, AND 25 W ORTEGA ST](#)
- | | |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 037-131-001, -002, -022 |
| Zone: | M-C |
| Application Number: | PLN2021-00189 |
| Owner: | Third Generation SB LLC |
| | Pat Meaney and Greg van Wyk, Trustees |
| Applicant: | Mary Meany Reichel |

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Project is adjacent to 17 West Ortega Street, 9-15 West Ortega Street, and 614 Chapala Street, all designated Structures of Merit. This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new three- and four-story mixed-use development. The proposal is for construction of a new three- and four-story mixed-use development. All existing buildings will be

demolished. The project includes 10,147 square feet of commercial space and 29,980 square feet of residential space consisting of 39 rental units proposed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. A voluntary lot merger between 630 Chapala Street and 25 W. Ortega Street is proposed, as well as an ingress/egress easement with 17 W. Ortega Street. In order to effectuate the proposed easement, the demolition of a 1,102-square-foot storage building on 17 W. Ortega Street is also requested. The existing sandstone wall separating 25 W. Ortega Street and 17 W. Ortega Street would be reconstructed as a privacy wall along the south property line. The proposed density on the 27,492-square-foot merged site is 63 dwelling units per acre. The Planning Commission approved a Community Benefit Height Exception on August 12, 2021, to allow the project to exceed 48 ft. in height (50 ft. 11 in. proposed.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. The project was last reviewed on September 14, 2022.

[17 West Ortega Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

[9-15 West Ortega Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

[614 Chapala Street Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:26 p.m.

Present: Tom Meaney, Architect; Al Winsor, Architect; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Arciniega stated that the project received Project Design Approval with a slightly different design. The back building that was previously proposed to be retained and will now be a new four-story building to match the rest of the project. Because it is a substantial design change, a Revised Project Design Approval is needed.

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the thorough study of block buildings and the architectural rigor that the Applicant has come up with to try to make the design fit in with the midblock structures of historic Santa Barbara.
2. Corrugated metal is not an appropriate El Pueblo Viejo material and will need to be changed.
3. Restudy the façade to make the structural grid less rigorous and obvious.
4. In general, the mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
5. Study ways of softening the building, including using canopies, fabrics, tile, and color, to make the façade less harsh.
6. The Commission appreciates pulling back from property line.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/2. (Lenvik and McClure abstained.) Motion carried.

4:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**6. 1002 ANACAPA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-024
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00376
Owner: Ocean Hills Covenant Church of Santa Barbara Inc
Jonathan Shaffer, Representative Member
Applicant: Michael Stroh, DMHA Architecture and Interiors

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project is adjacent to 1010 Anacapa Street, a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal for an 8,271 square foot interior and exterior renovation of an existing 11,988 square foot church/office building, consisting of a 2,482 square foot second story addition, and a 3,590 square foot roof deck. Project includes a new corner entry tower, trash enclosure, transformer, short term bicycle parking, and electric vehicle parking. A Parking Design Waiver is requested to allow the bike racks to be less than three feet from the adjacent building.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. The project was last reviewed on February 1, 2023.

1010 Anacapa Street Historic Significance Report*

*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Item 6 postponed to August 30, 2023 at the applicant's request.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:13 TO 4:30 P.M. ***

(4:45PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION CONSULTATION REVIEW**7. 100 W CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-014
Zone: P-R/SD-3
Application Number: PRE2023-00092
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jill Zachary, Parks & Recreation Director

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I, and designated a Landmark in 1990 at the request of representatives of the Coastal Band of the Chumash Nation to recognize the significant contributions of the Chumash people as the site of the early Chumash settlement, Syukhtun village. Proposal to redevelop Ambassador Park to celebrate Chumash cultural heritage and improve access and usage of the park. Project includes new landscaping and hardscaping, a gathering area for educational events and Chumash ceremonies/storytelling, and multi-lingual interpretative signage.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Parks & Recreation Director, City of Santa Barbara; Matthew Wilkons, Landscape Architect, KTUA

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the Landmark designation was requested by the Chumash communities in 1990, and making the site an interactive space honoring the Chumash community is very important and a best practice in historic preservation.

Public comment opened at 4:49p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Rachel Couch
2. Mariza Sullivan
3. Mark Yee
4. James Yee
5. Ernestine Ygnacio De Soto
6. Frank Arredondo

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:09 p.m.

Commission comments:

- The Commission is extremely supportive of the project and is encouraging of the direction its going in.
- Study a design that might eliminate some of the formality of the palm trees, especially the middle portion of the palm trees. If they remain on site, they do not need to be replaced in the future when they reach their lifetime limit.
- Study a softer border that is more in line with the rest of the design and can also screen out the neighboring architecture.
- Study relocating and/or restating Landmark plaque #306.
- Work with the City Attorney to decide which elements are protected under the 1st Amendment and which elements the Commission can comment on.
- Discuss the possible appropriate use of technology in the exhibits with Chumash representatives.
- Consider using fewer carbon heavy materials.
- Study including taller elements as visual cues to bring people toward the park.
- The interpretation of the Chumash cultural history and significance will be important in ways that it may not be at other sites.
- Study adding a 3D representation of the huts.
- The Commission appreciates the Applicant working with the Chumash representatives on the project.
- In general, the project meets the compatibility findings.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:51 P.M. ***