



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 21, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: Ooley and Hausz

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 3:28 p.m.), John Doimas, Assistant City Attorney (at 3:28 p.m.), Hernandez (absent 2:42 – 3:44 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 7, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/1. (Drury abstained. Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 21, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Commissioners Ooley and Hausz are absent from today's meeting.
 - b. Item 1, Discussion on Non-Discrimination/Harassment Policy is postponed two weeks to the meeting on September 4, 2019.
 - c. There is a new public comment procedure in place where public comment slips and accompanying speaker documents will be deposited in the box near the secretary desk for distribution by staff to the Commission. There is also now a podium where public speakers may stand when providing comments to the Commission. Members of the public may come forward to reference locations on plans and maps if invited to do so by the Commission.
 - d. An advisory group training will take place on Friday, September 13, 2019 from 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room. This is a joint meeting with the other review boards to discuss overall policy and training, and will be followed up by individual trainings for each board.
2. Ms. Ostrenger announced that she will be leaving at 4:00 p.m. but will be replaced by John Doimas, Assistant City Attorney.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Awards Program.

(1:50PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. DISCUSSION ON NON-DISCRIMINATION/HARASSMENT POLICY

Reference Number: PLN2019-00245

Staff: Sarah Gorman, City Clerk Services Manager

(Presentation to the Historic Landmarks Commission on Non-Discrimination and Harassment Policy.)

Item postponed to September 4, 2019.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:46 TO 1:50 P.M. ***

(2:05PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

2. 712 CASTILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-073-018

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Belinda Elizabeth Abbott & Justin Michael Howe

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the vernacular Craftsman style house, constructed in 1913 located at 712 Castillo Street.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Belinda Abbott
2. Justin Howe

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2019-136 to designate as a Structure of Merit the vernacular Craftsman style house, constructed in 1913 located at 712 Castillo Street.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:15PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: MILLS ACT CONTRACT

3. 712 CASTILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-073-018

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Belinda Elizabeth Abbott & Justin Michael Howe

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Justin Howe

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the vernacular Craftsman style house constructed in 1913 located at 712 Castillo Street.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:20PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**4. 223 A E FIGUEROA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-017

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: David Walker & Nonie Hamilton

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the vernacular Craftsman style house, constructed in 1925 located at 223 A East Figueroa Street.)

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:13 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Nonie Hamilton

Public comment closed at 2:15 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2019-137 to designate as a Structure of Merit the vernacular Craftsman style house located at 223 A East Figueroa Street.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:30PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: MILLS ACT CONTRACT**5. 223 A E FIGUEROA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-017

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: David Walker & Nonie Hamilton

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the vernacular Craftsman style house located at 223 A East Figueroa Street.

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:35PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**6. 2410 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-072-017
Reference Number: PLN2019-00234
Owner: Anderson Family Trust
Rebecca Joy Anderson & Ian Brook
Anderson, Trustees

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Shingle style house, constructed in 1916 located at 2410 State Street.)

Actual time: 2:23 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Rebecca Anderson

Public comment closed at 2:29 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2019-138 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Shingle style house located at 2410 State Street.

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: MILLS ACT CONTRACT**7. 2410 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-072-017
Reference Number: PLN2019-00234
Owner: Anderson Family Trust
Rebecca Joy Anderson & Ian Brook
Anderson, Trustees

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 2410 State Street, and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract.

Actual time: 2:34 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Rebecca Anderson

Public comment closed at 2:37 p.m.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Shingle Style house located at 2410 State Street.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

8. 517 CHAPALA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-038
Zone: C-R/USS
Application Number: PLN2017-00151
Owner: Ed St George
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
Applicant: Shelby Messner
Architect: Keith Nolan

(Project site is adjacent to a designated Structure of Merit: Dancaster Residence, constructed in 1887 in the Italianate style. The project consists of the demolition of an existing automobile dealership with 1,300 square feet of office space, merger of two lots (APNs 037-163-007 & 037-163-008) for a combined lot area of 11,500 square feet, and construction of a new three-story, 17,052 square foot (net) building containing 16 hotel rooms, a caretaker unit, and 519 square feet (net) of commercial space. The first level would include the hotel lobby, commercial space, 17 vehicle parking spaces, and three bicycle parking spaces. The second level would include nine hotel rooms and a courtyard area. The third level would include seven hotel rooms and a 905 square foot (net) caretaker unit. A 262 square foot roof deck would be provided for the caretaker unit.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-19, and the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria. Project was last reviewed on July 24, 2019.

Actual time: 2:42 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; Philip Suding, Landscape Architect, Suding Design; Keith Nolan, Architect, On Design Architects; and Shelby Messner, Applicant, On Design Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project was approved by Planning Commission and is requesting Project Design Approval today. The plans approved by the PC are available and were reviewed by staff for consistency with PC approval.

Public comment opened at 3:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions to return to the Full Commission:

1. The Commission is in support of the project design, as it will make an interesting and positive addition to the street.
2. Show the landscaping on all four elevations, as well a section through the second floor raised landscape planter.
3. Gapless permeable pavers are preferred.
4. The substantial door design developed for the commercial space door and two entry doors on the east elevation are acceptable.
5. Consider a gate on the stair for security.
6. The color palette is acceptable.
7. Detail 44 on A9.3 should be a plaster grille flush with the wall in the same color.
8. Detail 43 should have a black screen for the vent.
9. Junipers are tentatively acceptable pending tenured elevations showing a 10-year growth.
10. Relocate the irrigation backflow preventer to be away from the driveway.
11. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:34 TO 3:44 P.M. ***

(3:40PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

9. 2190 ALSTON RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2019-00176
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC
Applicant: Shubin Donaldson

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, "Graham", constructed in 1920-1924 is eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources, and for designation as a City Landmark. Proposal for a 1,250 square foot detached garage for the

existing 19,611 square foot historic residence. Project includes 1,914 square feet of driveway extension, 6,679 square feet of new permeable parking, and proposed improvements to the existing motor court, drive, and repainting of the historic residence.)

A. Focused Concept Review on arborist evaluation of oak tree. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on May 15, 2019.

Actual time: 3:44 p.m.

Present: Robin Donaldson, Architect, Shubin Donaldson; Sarah Corder, Dudek; and Greg Griffin, Architect, Shubin Donaldson

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the intent of the concept review is a focused response to the condition and health of the oak tree based on a comment the Commission made during the last review of the item asking that the applicant verify the size and condition of the tree.

Public comment opened at 3:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: The Commission is supportive of the removal of the oak tree with the arborist report to be amended to include mitigation measures that replace the oak tree with three new oak trees.

Action: Drury/Nemec, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

B. Acceptance of a Phase I Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Sarah Corder, Kate Kaiser, Samantha Murray, and Bryce Beemer, is requested. The report concluded the property is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, California Register of Historical Resources, and as a City Landmark. The property is significant for its association with the growth and development of the current Eucalyptus Hill neighborhood, its association with master architect Ronald Sauter, and its representation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style of architecture.

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Robin Donaldson, Architect, Shubin Donaldson; Sarah Corder, Dudek; and Greg Griffin, Architect, Shubin Donaldson

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooely absent.) Motion carried.

(4:15PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**10. 2190 ALSTON RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2019-00176
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC
Applicant: Shubin Donaldson

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on November 13, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Grahlm Estate, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed by Roland F. Sauter in 1916 and completed in 1920 located at 2190 Alston Road.)

Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.030 (d) (3) if Historic Structures/Sites Report finds property as having potential for designation as a City Historic Resource, it shall be considered and acted upon by the Commission for listing on the Potential Historic Resources List; and Section 22.22.035 (d) (2). The permit request shall be scheduled at the Commission for a hearing on the application in accordance with this paragraph 2 concurrently with a duly noticed hearing to allow the Commission to also decide among the following options: (a) the listing of the structure, site, or feature as a Potential Historic Resource; or (b) its designation by the Commission as a City Structure of Merit; or (c) a recommendation to the City Council to designate the structure, site, or feature as a City Landmark pursuant to this chapter.

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

Present: Robin Donaldson, Architect, Shubin Donaldson; Sarah Corder, Dudek; and Greg Griffin, Architect, Shubin Donaldson

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez recommended that the Commission adopt a Resolution of Intention to designate 2190 Alston Road as a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-13 to hold a Public Hearing on November 13, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Grahlm Estate, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed by Roland F. Sauter in 1916 and completed in 1920 located at 2190 Alston Road.

Action: Lenvik/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(4:20PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**11. 532 E SOLA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-008

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2018-00672

Owner: Jakob Bogenberger & Susan Swift

Architect: Arketype Architects Inc.

(The Spanish Colonial Revival residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is contributing to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. Proposal for a remodel and additions to the one-story 1,861 square foot residence, including demolition of 36 square feet off an existing porch at the driveway side yard and 310 square feet at the rear living area to accommodate a rear 347 square foot first floor addition, and a 438 square foot accessory dwelling unit in the partial basement. Site improvements include new deck area, reconstruction of the front patio trellis, remodel of the existing garage, fencing, and a new swimming pool. The proposed total of 1,932 square feet on a 6,250 square foot lot is 70% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Historic Resource and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings are required. Project was last reviewed on May 1, 2019.

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: David Ferrin, Architect, Arketype Architects Inc.; and Jakob Bogenberger, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The main body and window trim colors shown on the color board are not acceptable as submitted and need to match the examples on page A1D of the drawing set, which the owner states are the original red and green.
2. The windows as proposed need to work to be more compatible with the front portion of the house, with casements as options, and should have lintels to match the front portion of the house as well.
3. The articulation on the back wall of the south elevation is acceptable.
4. The back deck on the west elevation needs to be less contemporary with vertical wood members rather than horizontal.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 6/0/1. (Lenvik abstained. Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Lenvik abstained because he does not believe the project's direction is appropriate for the neighborhood.

(5:05PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**12. 1202 DIANA RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
Zone: RS-6
Application Number: PLN2019-00280
Owner: BLH Properties LLC
Applicant: Shaun Lynch
Contractor: Vernon Construction

(The adobe residence constructed in 1921 in combination Norman Revival and Spanish Colonial Revival style is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal for restoration of the historic residential adobe, including demolition of unpermitted additions, and opening an enclosed patio. Project includes minor additions to the rear of the adobe, and construction of an attached two-car garage with a bump out for washer/dryer equipment. Site landscaping, alterations, and tree removals consistent with the subdivision and grading plans approved by Planning Commission are part of this application. The proposed total of 1,436 on a 12,552 square foot lot is 36% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio. This is Lot 3 of a 4-lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission (PLN2017-00217).)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 006-19. Structure of Merit and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings are required. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2018 under PLN2017-00217.

Actual time: 5:18 p.m.

Present: Shaun Lynch, Applicant, Evoke Interior Design; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Bedard stated that the project obtained Planning Commission approval on April 11, 2019. The subdivision and lots 1, 2, and 4 obtained Project Design Approval by the Single Family Design Board on August 5, 2019. The Historic Landmarks Commission is reviewing lot 3, as it is a designated Structure of Merit, and may grant Project Design Approval but not Final Approval, as the project still needs to comply with the Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.

Public comment opened at 5:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval to return to Consent with the following conditions and findings:

1. The Commission is supportive of the project and appreciative of the enhancement of the adobe historic resource.
2. The plaster walls, particularly the corners, and the parapet of the garage should match the roundedness of the existing walls and chimney as shown on A012.
3. The garage door needs to match the depth of detail 6 on A701 in the floorplan.
4. Detail 4 on A701 should match detail 6 and be corrected to remove the LED light.
5. The closet additions are acceptable and the Commission does not find that detracts from the original adobe or porch area.
6. Move the laundry area to the southwest corner on the other side of the garage closer to the fountain.
7. Add a door on the north side of the garage to access trash area.

8. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Structure of Merit findings (per SBMC 22.22.090) as follows: the exterior alterations are being made for the purposes of restoring the Structure of Merit to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a Historic Resource.
9. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC 22.69.050) as follows:
 - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale is appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
 - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree or Landmark Tree.
 - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
 - g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/2. (Edmunds and Nemec abstained. Hausz and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:01 P.M. ***