



City of Santa Barbara

PLANNING COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 14, 2023

1:00 P.M.

City Hall, Council Chambers
735 Anacapa Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Roxana Bonderson, Chair
John M. Baucke, Vice Chair
Lucille Boss
Donald DeLuccio
Sheila Lodge
Devon Wardlow
Lesley Wiscomb

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Mike Jordan

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Allison DeBusk, City Planner
Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Bonderson called the meeting to order at 1:01 p.m.

I. ROLL CALL

Chair Roxana Bonderson, Commissioners Lucille Boss, Donald DeLuccio, Sheila Lodge, Devon Wardlow, and Lesley Wiscomb

Absent: Vice Chair John M. Baucke

STAFF PRESENT

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Allison DeBusk, City Planner
Christopher Bell, City TV Production Supervisor
Janet Ahern, City TV Production Specialist
Megan Arciniega, Project Planner
Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner
Elizabeth Stotts, Homelessness Programs Analyst
Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

II. PRELIMINARY MATTERS

A. Requests for continuances, withdrawals, postponements, or addition of ex-agenda items:

No requests.

B. Announcements and appeals:

Ms. DeBusk announced that an emergency coastal development permit for hillside stabilization for 3405 Sea Ledge Ln and 3357 Cliff Dr has been issued. The documents are available on the City's website.

C. Comments from members of the public pertaining to items not on this agenda:

Public comment opened at 1:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

III. **CONCEPT REVIEW**

ACTUAL TIME: 1:04 P.M.

1529 STATE ST.

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-231-022
Zoning Designation: C-G (Commercial General)
Application Number: PRE2022-00126
Owner: PS & RS LLC
Pradeep Shastri, Managing Member
Applicant: Julie McGeever

The 18,000 square-foot site is currently developed with two commercial buildings, Cantwell's Market and a dance studio, and a surface parking lot. The proposed project involves demolition of the existing development and construction of a new four-story mixed-use development with a ground-floor market and 27 residential units.

The project is being presented to the Planning Commission for AUD concept review and comments only pursuant to SBMC §30.150.060; no decisions will be made at this meeting, nor will any determination be made regarding environmental review of the proposed project. The Historic Landmarks Commission will be the formal decision-maker for the project.

Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, gave the Staff presentation.

Jay Blatter, HBA Architecture, gave the Applicant presentation, and was joined by Julie McGeever, HBA Architecture, and Aiko Stasser, CJMLA.

Public comment opened at 1:28 p.m., and the following individuals spoke:

1. Kerstin Corson
2. Suzanne Cohen
3. Patty Ficke
4. Dustin Hoiseth
5. Steve Fort
6. Katherine Hensler
7. Anna Demmon

Written correspondence from Paulina Conn, Spencer Cole, Susan Jordano, Paul J. Gamberdella, Suzanne Cohen, Tom Kaljian, Natalie Grubb- Campbell, Matthew Raddue and Alice Chen, Marcia Ribeiro, Joan and Robert Lockhart, Kristen Miller, President of Santa Barbara South Coast Chamber of Commerce, Steve Johnson, Abdon Mora, Kerstin N Corson, Sara Bilich, Samuel Seibel, Andrew Firestone, Miles Waters, Patty Ficke, and Jim Youngson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:46 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner DeLuccio:

- Sympathizes with the neighbors on Arrellaga Street.
- Overall, likes design of the building, but the Applicant should try to eliminate as much of the 4th story as possible.
- Glad to have 3 moderate-income units out of the 27 units. The Commission, in general, wants to see more housing. The City should be asking for more than 10% inclusionary units, more like 15-20% inclusionary units.
- Would not support having the project proceed under Builder's Remedy using SB 330.
- Adding more units here is contrary to what the neighbors are requesting, and we should not increase the massing to add more units.
- Likes the arcade along State Street; likes the outdoor dining.
- Encourages a solar study and visual aids. The Applicant will have to demonstrate to the HLC that the visual aids are sufficient for them to waive story poles.
- As we go forward and get into policy, we need to define what "workforce housing" means.
- Can make the General Plan findings today.

Commissioner Wiscomb:

- The project is in the Commercial High-Density area, which is important to keep in mind.
- Appreciates what the design team has done in terms of responding to Historic Landmarks Commission's comments. The project is going in the right direction.
- Likes the proposed building split, and locating the three-story building elements on the west and south side, and concentrating the four-story elements along State Street. The design is in line with the Commercial High-Density land use designation.
- Bus stops are very close on State Street.
- The corner plaza is a very nice design feature that adds an element of personality to the building.
- Appreciates the location of the commercial parking. It is well thought-out.
- Likes the dining arcade on State Street. It will activate this portion of State Street in a very positive way.
- 23% of the project is four-stories and 40% is three-stories, and that is going in the right direction.
- Appreciates the generous setbacks from some of the neighboring living areas.
- Going from an 18-foot-high building to a 48-foot high building is an impactful change to the neighborhood, but the Applicant has done a great job engaging the neighbors in the design considerations. No one will be completely satisfied, but making the effort and having flexibility is important.
- As HLC recommended, a solar study should be done to see the impact of shading on the neighbors.

- Does not support story poles, but absolutely does support providing 3D video simulation of the project.
- This will be a very lovely project.

Commissioner Lodge:

- Agrees with the other comments from Commissioners Wiscomb and DeLuccio.
- The project has proposed the maximum density allowed; but she appreciates the effort to create a design that may be more acceptable to the neighbors.
- When a one-story building that is out of view becomes a four-story building, it may be a difficult situation, but it is allowed.
- Video simulations, if provided, should show the project from pedestrian-level views, not from a birds-eye view.

Commissioner Boss:

- The street goes from a one-story building to a two-story building, to a three-story, and this project will be a three-story building to a four-story building, then landing on the wide street which is used by pedestrians, bikes and buses. It seems like is a natural progression in height along State Street and is meeting a great need.
- Appreciates the proposed changes for the building size, bulk and scale where the building mass is broken-up, the four-story elements have moved to the opposite side, the setbacks are increased, and additional breezeways have been added.
- It is unclear from the public comment if the neighbors have issues with any development at all in this area, or if the issue is with just the height of the design. Appreciates all that the Applicant is doing to accommodate the neighbors feedback.
- Prefers a solar study over story poles; a solar study will tell more than story poles.
- Appreciates that parking is provided, even though there are bike lanes and buses, and it is a good walkable area.
- Finds the project consistent with the General Plan.
- We do not have a market-rate housing crisis, but we have an affordable housing crisis. The project does the bare minimum with the 3 affordable units. She would love to see more affordable units in this project.
- Will continue to request for more affordable housing but it is the City's responsibility to create more incentive to create more affordable housing.

Commissioner Wardlow:

- Supportive of this mixed-use development and the construction of rental units in the community.
- The project is in an excellent location and compliments the Land Use Element goals in terms of the character, design and maintaining and enhancing the neighborhood.
- Loves the corner plaza and the outdoor dining; it will add value to this area.
- Supports the changes proposed in terms of the decision to break up the building in response to HLC's feedback; it is smart and shows willingness to work with HLC.
- Likes the enhanced setbacks and the landscaping is well done.
- Understands the neighbors' concerns and desire to keep the neighborhood the way it is. Views will be impacted, but the development is consistent with policies that address the need to create more housing.
- Incorporating the beloved Cantwell's Market is a really good example of a mixed-use development; happy to see an existing business maintained.

- The project falls short in affordable housing. Not suggesting the applicant increase the size or bulk of the project to accommodate more affordable units, but rather consider increasing the number of affordable units within the proposed 27 units.
- The project is generally consistent with the 2015 Housing Element and General Plan in that it is building rental housing, is in an appropriate location for infill housing. But Policy H11 and Land Use Goal LG1 state that the production of affordable housing is the “highest priority” and Policy H11.3 states we consider a 15-20% inclusionary affordable housing provision, and the project proposes 10% inclusionary units which is the minimum required.
- Asks the Applicant to consider at this time, just as they did with considering the breakup of the building, increasing the number of affordable units within the 27 units.

Chair Bonderson:

- Agrees with the comments made by the other Commissioners.
- This is exactly the type of project that City and the AUD program are trying to promote.
- The architecture and design, of both the original design and the new direction, do a great job to uphold the expectations for Santa Barbara’s urban fabric.
- Prefers the architectural elements and amenities of the original design, but understands the Applicant was taking away massing.
- Would like to see the tower brought back into the design. It is an important design element and ties into expectations we have of Santa Barbara architecture.
- Pulling the building away from the property lines beyond the required setbacks demonstrates the Applicant’s interest to cooperate with the neighbors and provide additional space, light and air.
- Is supportive of the bulk and massing of the design as proposed and would support keeping portions of the three- and four- story elements that are removed in the proposed changes, if the building is appropriately pulled-in from property lines and does not impact the neighbors’ privacy.
- There may be an opportunity to add another affordable unit on the Arrellaga Street side and still be away from the property line. There are many opportunities here to add affordable units that are needed in our community.
- Supportive of it as a mixed-use project; we do not have enough of them in the community.
- Appreciates the State Street façade and covered loggia.
- Glad to see that the Cantwell’s Market is incorporated into the project.
- Commends the project team for actively responding to the neighbors, HOA, and the Commissions, and being open to redesigns and cooperation.
- Not everyone will be satisfied, but the Applicants have a right to develop and they are cooperating and going beyond what is required.
- Recommends a solar study; it will help satisfy some of the concerns.
- Recommends providing a video simulation in lieu of story poles.

MOTION: Wiscomb / Boss

Forward the majority comments to the Historic Landmarks Commission with the comment that the Commission finds that the project is generally consistent with the General Plan. However, additional affordability is encouraged by Housing Element Policy H11 and Land Use Element Goal LG1 which prioritizes the use of resources capacities for additional affordable housing over all other new developments.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 Noes: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 (Baucke)

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:51 TO 3:00 P.M. ***

IV. DISCUSSION ITEM

ACTUAL TIME: 3:00 P.M.

816 CACIQUE ST AND 110 S QUARTANTINA ST (PATH) UPDATE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-240-021 & 017-113-038

Zoning Designation: M-1 Light Manufacturing, C-2/S-D-3(Commercial/Coastal Overlay),
SD-3 Coastal Overlay Zones

Application Number: PLN1999-00432

Owner: People Assisting The Homeless

Elizabeth Adams, Managing Member

Applicant: Jonathan Castillo

The existing homeless shelter at 816 Cacique Street operates under a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) that was approved by the Planning Commission in 1999 (required off-site parking is provided at 110 S. Quarantina Street). As part of that CUP, the current operators of the facility, People Assisting the Homeless (PATH), are required to provide a two-year report to the Planning Commission describing how they comply with the conditions of their CUP.

Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, Liz Stotts, Homelessness Programs Analyst, Liz Adams, PATH, and Jonathon Castillo, PATH, gave the presentation. Barbara Anderson, Senior Assistant to the City Administrator's Office, Commander Charlie Katsapis, and Lieutenant Chris Payne were available to answer questions.

Public comment opened at 3:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA**ACTUAL TIME: 4:10 P.M.****A. Committee and Liaison Reports:****1. Staff Hearing Officer Liaison Report**

No report.

2. Other Committee and Liaison Reports

- a. Commissioner Lodge reported on the September 12, 2023, meeting of the City Council.
- b. Commissioner Boss reported on the September 14, 2023, meeting of the Downtown Parking Committee.
- c. Commissioner Bonderson reported on the August 21, 2023, meeting of the Architectural Board of Review, and the September 6, 2023 meeting of the State Street Advisory Committee.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Bonderson adjourned the meeting at 4:14 p.m.

Submitted by,



Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant