



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 31, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (at 1:33 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg (at 1:34 p.m.), Ooley, and McClure
Commissioners absent: Lenvik
Staff present: Hernandez; Reidel; Johnson; Rosie Dyste, Project Planner (until 2:04 p.m.); and Carly Earnest, Assistant Planner (from 3:01 - 3:39 p.m.)

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Cheri Rae
2. Rick Closson

Written correspondence from Rick Closson and Kevin was acknowledged.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 17, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 17, 2024**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 5/0/3. (Ooley, Doordan, and McClure abstained, Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **July 17, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **July 17, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Butler, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

D. Ratification of action taken on the Consent Calendar of **July 31, 2024**.

Consent Calendar July 31, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 928 Garden St	APN: 029-301-042 PLN: 2023-00308 Zone: C-G	Ray Mahboob / Ken Dickson; Windward Design Services, LLC	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions.
2.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 135 E Anapamu St	APN: 029-121-011 PLN: 2023-00409 Zone: C-G	Sourmany 2006 Revocable Trust 5/25/06 Maurice and Mary Sourmany, Trustees / Craig Minus, CAM Land Use & Development	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with condition.
3.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 634 Anacapa St	APN: 031-151-020 PLN: 2024-00215 Zone: M-C	Anatega Partners, LLC Chris Parker, Representative Member / Lisa Liles, Cearnal Collective	Project Design Approval and Final Approval.
4.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 316 W Anapamu St	APN: 039-162-027 PLN: 2024-00190 Zone: R-MH	Draghi 316 Anapamu LLC	Project Design Approval and Final Approval.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 31, 2024**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

- Ms. Dyste announced that there is a proposed adoption draft for the Title 25 Objective Design and Development Standards (ODDS) for public review on the City's website. Web maps are included to guide the public through the ODDS Zones and Architectural Styles. Staff is presenting the ODDS to Planning Commission on August 8, 2024 to ask for a recommendation to City Council to adopt ODDS and amendments to Title 30 that are related to these new standards.

2. Vice Chair Hausz announced he took a walking tour in downtown Los Angeles in the Broadway National Historic District put on by Esotouric.
3. Commissioner Ensberg requested the following:
 - a. An agendaized discussion on creating a Department of Historic Preservation.
 - b. An agendaized discussion on the discrepancy in the tree ordinance between how historic trees are treated differently in or out of a historic district.
 - c. An agendaized discussion about the responsibilities of Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC).

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Chair Grumbine reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

Commissioner Ensberg reported on the State Street Interim Working Group.

Ms. Hernandez reported on the Designation Subcommittee.

(1:45PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **102 W DE LA GUERRA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-038
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2024-00246
Owner/Applicant: 101 CP, LLC
Greg Reitz, Manager

(Project is not a historic site or within a historic district, but is adjacent to 101 West Canon Perdido Street, The Telephone Building, a contributing historic resource to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Proposal to construct a new five-story multi-family residential building and a four-story self-storage building with a basement.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Provenience Group, Inc. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Carole Denardo, Provenience Group

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**2. 800 ALVARADO PL**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Zone: R-2/4.0/R-H
Application Number: PLN2024-00205
Owner: El Encanto, Inc.
Janis Clapoff, General Manager
Applicant: Joe Andrulaitis, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects

(El Encanto Hotel Historic District is a designated Landmark located in the Hillside Design District, constructed in 1913-1930 by Soule, Ray, Eaton, Edwards, Plunkett, and Howell in the Craftsman Vernacular/Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposal for a new 1,900 square foot pergola with retractable cover on the existing outdoor dining terrace of a non-historic building at the site.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Hillside Design District Findings are required. Project last reviewed on July 17, 2024.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:10 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with findings:

1. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
2. The Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The development, including the proposed structures and grading, is appropriate to the site, is designed to avoid visible scarring, and does not significantly modify the natural topography of the site or the natural appearance of any ridgeline or hillside.
 - b. The development maintains a scale and form that blends with the hillside by minimizing the visual appearance of structure(s) and the overall height of structures.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 5/3/0. (Ensberg, Hausz, and Grumbine opposed. Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Individual comments:

Commissioner Ensberg stated that she is opposed because the pergola is out of proportion and does not meet the spirit and materials of the historic design of the El Encanto building.

Vice Chair Hausz stated that he is opposed because he does not feel that the perception of the project feels traditional.

Chair Grumbine stated that he is opposed because the aluminum materials and the form in how the fabric is sealed off isn't as good as it could be.

(2:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. **12 E CARRILLO ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-045
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2024-00182
Owner: 12 East Carrillo LLC
Ben Romo, Representative Member
Applicant: Farah AlQallaf, Cearnal Collective LLP

(Contributing historic resource to the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, the Chamber of Commerce building was constructed in 1927, in the Italianate/Mediterranean Revival style. Proposed new infill housing within the existing building, including 12 units as well as two Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs). Exterior alterations include a new vestibule in the rear, site work, window restoration, a height increase to the existing elevator shaft, relocated exit, and window conversion to match adjacent building, as well as new French doors, Juliette balcony, arched entrance, vent with wrought iron décor, windows, light fixtures, and trash enclosure.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alteration Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards*

**Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](https://www.santabarbaraCA.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: Farah AlQallaf, Cearnal Collective LLP; and Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Collective

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards as noted in the Memo. Fortunately, the original drawings illustrate there was a center arched window opening that was at some point removed and boarded. The Applicants are reopening the window to match the original drawings, which will benefit the historic integrity of the building.

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant and Owners for a beautiful job, sensitive treatment of a Historic Resource, and a great example of adaptive reuse.
2. Continue to develop the landscape plan. The Commission appreciates the inclusion of the landscape and paseo.
3. Investigate the original colors. The Commission is in favor of utilizing original colors.
4. The Commission is supportive of the treatment of the rear of the building and thankful for the restoration of the front.

Action: Ensberg/Drury, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:52 TO 3:01 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

4. 835 ALBERTA AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-242-001

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PRE2024-00041

Owner: David Botsford & Daina Budreckis

Applicant: Jonathan Villegas, Darkmoon Building Design and Engineering

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1923 in the Craftsman style. Proposal for additions to the existing 1,086 square foot one-story single family residence including a 141 square foot first floor addition, 629 square foot second story addition, and two second floor decks. Project will require Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Setback Modification for the secondary front setback encroachment and Open Yard Modification for reduction of the nonconforming open yard.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:01 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Darkmoon Building Design and Engineering; and David Botsford, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Earnest stated that this is a One-Time Pre-Application Review so no final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Staff requests comments on the overall site design and aesthetic appropriateness of the additions. As currently designed the project will require a Setback Modification and an Open Yard Modification.

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Sonia Zuniga-Lomeli was acknowledged.

Commission comments:

- The Commission is supportive of the project and its sensitivity to the Historic Resource.
- The existing front façade on Alberta should remain as it is (altering the front façade does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not qualify the project for a CEQA Exemption) and additions should be set back from the front façade in an appropriate Craftsman manner.
- Study the porch supports on the rear elevation with a more Craftsman style solution either through piers, posts, or cantilevering as a balcony.
- Study using attic vents that are similar to the original or with a different pattern, but relatable to the original.
- Either match the proposed railing to the railing in the back or study another solution using historic precedence.
- Study the character of the windows to tie to the original and existing window alignments as much as possible.
- Restudy the French doors off the upstairs deck to be more Craftsman Style.
- Study the knee brace to make the geometry and sizing closer to the outriggers of the historic resource and/or some other solution that is appropriate for the Craftsman style.
- The Setback Modification and Open Yard Modification are supportable because they are required to make the addition to work while being sensitive to the Historic Resource.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:39 TO 4:00 P.M. ***

(4:00PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

5. **33 E CANON PERDIDO ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PRE2024-00110
Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
David Asbell, Executive Director
Applicant: Melisa Turner, DesignARC Inc.

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I and designated a City Landmark, the Lobero Theatre was designed in 1924 by George Washington Smith in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The rear addition to the building was added in 1926. Proposal for approximately 10,000 square feet of addition to the theater, 900 square feet of addition to the Scene shop, and a new courtyard off the Lobero Paseo.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report completed in 2012- for reference only on history, does not evaluate this project*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner MCCure recused himself from hearing this item.

Present: Mark Shields, Lead Architect, DesignARC; Melisa Turner, Senior Project Manager, DesignARC Inc.; Brad Hodges, Lobero Theatre Board Member; and Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Brandon Mowery
2. Todd Jared

Public comment closed at 4:28 p.m.

Commission comments:

- The Commission thanks the Applicant for bringing this important Landmark project early in the process and encourages the project's success going forward.
- The Commission is in favor of the size of the addition. Their main concern is the overall vertical massing and detailing.
- Return with perspectives from the major public streets and paseo. Suggestion for an animation or 3-dimensional model.
- Restudy the addition including the red tile roof, cornice, and large arched window to be simplified and not draw more attention than the main Landmark.
- Some Commissioners feel that the railing wall solution for the second-floor roof terrace should be restudied.
- Some Commissioners feel the third floor of the annex building should be moved to another location rather than altering the building as it is a small amount of space.
- Study the paseo design as it is a complex 3-dimensional space. Address how the public passes through the space and how patrons access the rehearsal hall in the back.
- Study the north elevation, paseo entrance, and the intersection of the various buildings.
- The Commission is supportive of the former entrance on Anacapa Street becoming the back of house. Simplify the side entrance to make it more appropriate for its purpose.
- Expand the proposed basement into the space that is marked as dirt.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:20 P.M. ***