



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

FEBRUARY 1, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and Manuel (absent 3:36 p.m. - 4:37 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Kokinda (until 3:04 p.m.), Hernandez, Burkhart, Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner (until 4:14 p.m.), Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner (3:37 p.m.- 4:36 p.m.), Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner (4:36 p.m.- 5:31 p.m.) and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2023 Appointment of Subcommittees

Appointments were made to the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Subcommittees		
Designations	Doordan, Ooley, Lenvik,	Drury
Ad hoc Subcommittees		
Objective Design Standards	Ooley, Doordan	

B. Public Comment:

No public comment.

C. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 18, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 7/0/2. (Lenvik and Manuel abstained.) Motion carried.

D. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 1, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and Manuel (Items A, E, F, G).

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Kokinda announced the following:

- a. This will be Commissioner Manuel's last Historic Landmarks Commission meeting.
- b. City Council has appointed a new Commissioner who is a landscape architect.
- c. Vice Chair Hausz submitted a question to staff regarding a project on Gutierrez St. Ms. Kokinda stated that Staff cannot pull the building plans, as they are not public and there is a process to gain access to them. Staff will look further into design review inspections strategies.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced that she has received a survey of all hitching posts in the City and have accounted for where they're located.

3. Commissioner Lenvik requested that discussion items be agendaized for the project at City Parking Lot 3 and Gutierrez St and the barrier project at the Cabrillo Pavillion.

4. Commissioner Ooley requests an additional item be added on the agenda, or have Item E be edited, to include issues by Commissioners.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg reported that the Airport Workgroup met on January 25th as a continuation of their previous meeting. Simplification was the general theme of the workgroup's feedback, and that information is being melded with comments from police operations and facilities staff. Once the final list of comments is completed, it will be given to design consultant, they will develop a final concept design, which will go out to the public and HLC. That is expected to happen in two months or so.

Commissioner Drury reported that the Plaza de la Guerra Art Advisory Group met. Request for qualifications has gone out and the group is pushing for the Chumash circle water feature and art nodes throughout the plaza. There was discussion the final effort of the artists and how it will be fitted with the maintenance of the plaza.

Commissioner Lenvik reported that the State Street Advisory Committee has not met for the past few months, but there was a recent presentation to City Council from Tess Harris and the State St. consultant, MIG. In April or May, planners will come up with three preliminary design concepts which will be released to the public for input.

(2:00PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. STATE STREET DISCUSSION

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor

(Request from the Commission to discuss and draft possible recommendations to Council regarding the temporary conditions of State Street associated with the Economic Recovery Extension and Transition Ordinance (ERETO) approved by Council. The ERETO temporarily suspends Municipal Code regulations in order to allow outdoor dining and outdoor business uses in the public right of way or on private property. The ERETO will remain in effect until December 31, 2023.

NOTE: Businesses must implement the Design Requirements listed within the [Requirements for Operating a Business on the Temporary State Street Promenade](#) by February 1, 2023.)

Actual time: 2:06 p.m.

Present: Brian Bosse, Public Works Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Jason Harris, Economic Development Manager, City of Santa Barbara;

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda stated this item has been agendaized based on HLC's request.

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

Commission comments:

1. Commissioner Doordan stated that while the Commission is discussing State St., it is not only State St. where these objects come up. Eventually, all standards and guidelines should apply citywide for all merchants in Santa Barbara. It would be best to begin by establishing basic principles instead of specifics. Parklets are substantial hard objects, and create health, safety, circulation and aesthetic implications, and rules should apply.
2. Commissioner Ooley stated that it is hard to have discussion without an understanding on where the government believes the pandemic is. One view is that if most pandemic related operations are back to normal, then all emergency ordinance related elements should be removed. The other view is that it will continue, and outdoor objects will still need to be provided for. Under the assumption that January 1st, 2024 is when the emergency order expires, then State St. should go back to the way it was pre-pandemic. A work group should be formed for creating emergency standards.
3. Commissioner Grumbine stated that if no other plan is in place, State St. should default back to normal until a proper process is in place. HLC contributes not just to the aesthetic value, but also the vitality and economic wellbeing of the City and the EPV. The biggest visual offenses are the vertical surfaces that are not up to the EPV standards and do not feel like Santa Barbara. State St. is getting better, but it is still disorganized, and we have just gotten used to it.
4. Commissioner Butler stated that there are several other development projects and initiatives going

on in the City, and the future of State St will have cascading effects on those projects and initiatives, such as the digital City project.

5. Commissioner Lenvik agrees with the comments regarding the structures that are outside of State St. Projects should be coming back before the HLC for review as they did before emergency order. The expectation should be that emergency order improvements go away January 1, 2024. It is critical to understand the financial implications of these ideas to determine next phase of State St.
6. Commissioner Ensberg stated that this area is the EPV not just State St, which has a beautiful network with paseos that lead off to other areas, and the design is not only the vertical but the horizontal. HLC has a responsibility to be involved, but not hinder, and help ensure that Santa Barbara is beautiful. Outdoor dining existed pre-pandemic and should continue as was approved pre-pandemic; we want outdoor dining, but how do we best accomplish it with existing conditions. Parklets by definition are not dining. There is improvement and State St is looking better as the recommendations from the 2021 work group are being applied. The removal of the green bike lanes is an improvement, and simple outdoor dining areas look good. Accessibility for all is essential for equal access.
7. Commissioner Drury stated that the assumption is that State St. will open back up when the emergency order expires. It is his impression that the vast majority of citizens want to see State St remain closed to automobile traffic. Believes HLC should be the commission to lead the discussion regarding the interim between 2024 to whatever the next phase of State will be.

(2:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM

2. CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT 2021-2022 ANNUAL REPORT

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review and approve the Certified Local Government (CLG) 2021-2022 Annual Report as required by the California Office of Historic Preservation.)

[CLG 2021-2022 Annual Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:04 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, The City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:55PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**3. 1735 BATH STREET**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-082-007
Zone: R-MH
Reference Number: PLN2023-00015
Owner: Shabazz-Peneau Family Trust
Tony Shabazz & Joyce Peneau, Trustees
Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to consider adopting resolution 2023-01 designating the Craftsman style structure designed in 1916 a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report***HLC Resolution 2023-01***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, The City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Joyce Jerge was acknowledged.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2023-01 to designate 1735 Bath St. as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:20 TO 3:37 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**4. 1002 ANACAPA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-024
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00376
Owner: Ocean Hills Covenant Church of Santa Barbara, Inc.;
Jonathan Shaffer, Managing Member
Applicant: Michael Stroh, DMHA Architecture

(The 11,988 square foot project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project consists of an 8,468 square foot interior and exterior renovation of an existing church/office building consisting of a 1,582 net square foot second story addition and a 3,579 net square foot roof deck, as well as a new corner entry tower, new trash enclosure, transformer, short term bicycle parking and new electric vehicle parking.)

No final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for a Project Design Approval.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Ryann Mills, Designer, DMHA; Izzy Savage, DMHA; Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Jaqueline Beraldo
2. Duane Deamicis

Written correspondence from Gina Deamicis was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to the Full Commission with the following comments:

1. The current project is nicely handled and well designed. The Commission appreciates the thought and care that has gone into it and finds them acceptable.
2. The Commission is in support of the parking modification.
3. The Commission appreciates the history of the property that was given, and its sensitivity to the historic nature of the original building within the project.
4. Restudy the northern stair so that there is less light impact on the neighbor. Return with a 3D shadow study that indicates the location of windows and skylights of the neighboring property, especially if the stair is not clearly moved away from that area.
5. The Commission realizes that this is a sensitive project with low impact upon neighbors. Construction impact is not under HLC purview but ask the Applicant return with a strategy on how to have as little impact as possible.
6. Restudy the 5' glass railings and look at it from the street view to see if you can push it back so it's not an obvious element.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(4:00PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 225 EQUESTRIAN AVE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-122-011

Zone: O-R

Application Number: PLN2022-00445

Owner: Herbert House LLC;

Mel Herbert & Mary Lanctot-Herbert, Managing Members

Applicant: Jeff Shelton, Jeff Shelton Architect

(The project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to demolish all existing onsite structures, and construct a new three-story mixed-use building comprised of a 4,688-square-foot single-unit residence, a 656-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), a 500-square-foot commercial office, and 530-square-foot attached garage.)

No final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for a Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 4:36 p.m.

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect, Jeff Shelton Architect; Mel Herbert, Owner; Mary Lanctot-Herbert, Owner; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project is here for conceptual review. The project is to construct a 3-story mixed use building and has gone through initial staff review. Staff determined that three modifications are required, but the Applicant may change the project to avoid two of the modifications.

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Westerman
2. Mark Kenneth Flores

Written correspondence from Kim Hunter, Barbara Hauter, Rick and Jane Westerman, and Mark Flores and Shannon Crane was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:03 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely for return to the Full Commission with the following comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the thoughtful design regarding mass, bulk, and scale. It is an appropriate design for the neighborhood. It is supportable with regards to the setback from the front, the setbacks from the sides, including the modification for the zero setback on the one side. The Commission is also in support of the modification for the other interior setback to allow portions of the third story to have a 6-foot setback rather than the required setback.
2. The interior open space is handled well, and it anticipates potential additional buildings to the east.

3. While private views are not protected or under HLC purview, the Commission appreciates the Applicant working with neighbor being sensitive to their property.
4. The Commission is in support of the modification in an effort to alleviate neighbor's concerns.
5. Multiple Commissioners have concerns with the level and intensity of color, including at least one commissioner who felt it did not adhere to EPV design guidelines. Some commissioners are comfortable with the colors as proposed, especially pertaining to the front.
6. Excellent use of horizontal planning.
7. Study the number and type of elements being used as a potential of being too many, especially pertaining to the front.
8. Two Commissioners are okay with striped awnings.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:41 P.M. ***