



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

MAY 22, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (absent 2:00-2:13 p.m.), Hausz, Butler, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure
Commissioners absent: Doordan
Staff present: Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney (from 2:13-3:12 p.m.); Hernandez (absent 2:15-4:32 p.m.); Julia Pujo, Environmental Analyst (from 1:31-1:50 p.m.); Reidel; Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant (from 2:10-3:17 p.m.); and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Cheri Rae
3. Emma Brinkman

Written correspondence from Cheri Rae was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **May 8, 2024.**

Item postponed to the June 5, 2024 agenda due to loss of quorum.

C. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Reidel announced the following:
 - a. The City Attorney's Office will present a draft of the revised Sign Ordinance to the Sign Committee on June 11, 2024.
 - b. Single Family Design Board (SFDB) special recruitment is in progress and closes June 5, 2024.
2. Ms. Pujo announced that the City received a grant from the State Office of Historic Preservation to update the Master Environmental Assessment (MEA). Staff plans to bring a draft of the new MEA before the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) in the fall. Following HLC review, staff will be requesting approval from City Council.
3. Ms. Hernandez announced that she is working on revising the Historic Structures/Sites Reports portion of the MEA guidelines to reflect new case law, new CEQA guidelines, and the City's revised Historic Resource Ordinance.
4. Chair Grumbine requested that staff agendize a discussion on the historic Doremus Stone Pines for June 5, 2024. He also requested that Council Member Sneddon bring the issue before City Council.
5. Commissioner Lenvik announced that he will need to leave the meeting by 6:00 p.m.

D. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik announced that the State Street Advisory Committee will meet at the end of June.

(1:45PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

1. **1723 SANTA BARBARA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-003
Zone: RS-15
Reference Number: PLN2024-00003
Owner: Heyman Jason & Fratus Matthew Trust 03/19/20
Matthew Fratus & Jason Heyman, Trustees
Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2024-04 designating the building that was converted from a barn to a residence, constructed in 1888, a historic Structure of Merit.)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)
[Resolution 2024-04*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2024-04 designating 1723 Santa Barbara Street a Structure of Merit.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 1708 PATERNA RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-184-009

Zone: RS-15

Application Number: PLN2024-00118

Owner: Daniel and Kimberly Crocker

Applicant: Jennifer Lewis, Harrison Design

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1920 with a 1929 renovation and addition by Soule, Murphy and Hastings in the English Arts and Crafts style.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine. The report concluded the house at 1708 Paterna Road is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit and the contributing portions of the house are a significant historic resource for the purposes of CEQA review.

[Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates; and Jennifer Lewis, Harrison Design

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 7/0/0. (Doordan and Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**3. 9 W FIGUEROA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2023-00345
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Chelsey Swanson, Project Planner

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Project is adjacent to 1029 State Street, a designated City Landmark. Proposal to realign the vehicular entrance to Lot 3 and add a new pedestrian pathway from Lot 3 to Figueroa Street. Project includes a new mid-block crossing that will align with the public pedestrian access to Lot 4, as well as curb extensions at the mid-block crossing and new landscaping in the expanded parkways.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. Project last reviewed at Consent on October 11, 2023.

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Chelsey Swanson, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; William Bishop, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studios; and Edward France, Downtown Plaza Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Charles Valle

Written correspondence from Charles Valle was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:35 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the condition that the pavers be solid red Hydro-Flo bricks and the following findings:

1. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/1/0. (Lenvik opposed. Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Lenvik stated that he is opposed because the project is creating an unsafe condition through the configuration of walkways and planters that are being proposed.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:05 TO 3:12 P.M. ***

(2:45PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

4. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
Zone: HRC-1/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2024-00063
Owner: KHP IV Santa Barbara LLC
Eric Moulton, Representative Member
Applicant: Madison LaScalza, Sequoia Deployment Services Inc.

(Contributing historic resource in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I, and adjacent to The Vista Mar Monte, a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to construct seven new chimney screens for rooftop antenna equipment, as well as a new 256 square foot equipment lease area in the basement to house related equipment. Project includes a new 12-foot-wide access path from Orilla Del Mar Drive.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. Project last reviewed at Consent on April 10, 2024.

Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Madison LaScalza, Sequoia Deployment Services Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that proposals for new telecommunications facilities on existing buildings are subject to a 90-day timeline, therefore the Commission must take final action at today's hearing unless the applicant agrees to an adjusted timeline.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Return with a design that includes multiple Spanish Colonial Revival style chimney designs that are compatible with the engineering of the antennas. The designs should be more appropriate for Santa Barbara and minimize visual impact.
2. Return with images of the antennas without screening.
3. Return with technical drawings that show the various clearances and constraints of the antennas.
4. The applicant agrees to an adjusted timeline.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

(3:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

5. 320 W CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-033
Zone: C-G (C-2)
Application Number: PLN2023-00408
Owner: Lawrence Broida
Applicant: John Cuykendall, DMI - Commercial Real Estate Services

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I and designated a Structure of Merit, the Bates House was constructed in 1904 in the Queen Anne Free Classic style. Proposal to replace the existing, one-story commercial building, two-car garage, and 21 surface parking spaces with a new 4-story, 47-foot tall, 35-unit residential building, the onsite relocation of the existing historic resource from the rear of the property to the front of the property and conversion back to a duplex, and one vehicle parking space. The average unit size is 764 square feet. The project is proposed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive (AUD) program and State Density Bonus law. State Density Bonus concessions include relief from the maximum height, story pole, and open yard requirements.

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings are required. Project last reviewed under PRE2022-00214 on December 6, 2023.

Historic Significance Report*

Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards (accepted on July 12, 2023)*

Planning Commission Minutes September 7, 2023

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective; Nicole Horn, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; John Cuykendall, DMI - Commercial Real Estate Services; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that the project went to Planning Commission (PC) on September 7, 2023 for Concept Review where the PC stated that they felt the story poles were not necessary, however, at the December 6, 2023 HLC hearing the HLC did require story poles. The Applicant has decided utilize the concessions allowed for State Density Bonus Projects including relief from the 45-foot height limit, a reduction in open yard requirements, and relief from the story pole requirement.

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments and findings:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for their continued hard work. The project is becoming quite beautiful and addresses the important need for housing.

2. Continue to study the window and awnings colors, adding more pizzazz. Study the navy blue awnings of the storefront building.
3. Most Commissioners are in favor of the cobalt blue tile. At least one Commissioner suggested mixing up the tile or adding additional details of tiles to the cobalt blue tile on the storefront building.
4. The landscape is acceptable with the changes shown in the paper plans brought by the Applicant. Submit the digital plans showing the addition of a canopy tree and palm tree to staff.
5. The Commission appreciates the Applicant moving the Bates House to its original position and taking care with the design. The Commission looks forward to seeing a historic color added.
6. A finial or weathervane is appropriate on the tower.
7. The Commission suggests the paving be more El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) appropriate and traditional. The Commission is split in opinion on using cut face pavers.
8. The Commission encourages the Applicant to return for an In-Progress hearing.
9. Return with a plan for mechanical systems and utilities showing appropriate screening and visual impact from public views.
10. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
11. As required for Resources on the Historic Resource Inventory in Section 30.157.110 of the Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
 - b. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

6. 1733 MOUNTAIN AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-171-006
Zone: RS-6
Application Number: PLN2023-00002
Owner: Graeme Lee-Wingate
Applicant: Tod Stockwell, T Stock Design Studio

(Historic Structure of Merit, constructed in 1930 in the English Vernacular style. Proposal for a 128 square foot first floor addition and a 586 square foot second floor addition to the rear of an existing 998 square foot single-unit residence. Project includes addition of dormer window on the front elevation and raising the side facing gable 5'2" from 18'10" to 24'0", removal of an as-built shed, new doors, rear windows, roofing, second story balcony, smooth stucco, exterior lighting, and restoration of original windows. The proposed total of 2,261 square feet on a 5,124 square foot lot is 92% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings are required. Project last reviewed on August 2, 2023.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Tod Stockwell, T Stock Design Studio; and Graeme Lee-Wingate

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that there was an error on the agenda: the project was last heard on October 25, 2024, not August 2, 2024.

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments and findings:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for their continued work on this project. The design is supportive and sensitive to the historic resource.
2. The small portion of roof that protrudes beyond the solar plane is acceptable and is aesthetically and historically appropriate. The Commission feels that continuing the roof has a minor impact and is important to the design.
3. The Commission suggests reducing the number of corbels on the back balcony elevation and changing them to wood instead of plaster. Study the corbel layout and profiles of English Vernacular wood corbels.
4. The Commission thanks the Applicant for their study of the dormer options. Understanding that the owner would prefer option two, most Commissioners find it appropriate and successful.
5. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.

- d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
- e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
- 6. As required for Resources on the Historic Resource Inventory in Section 30.157.110 of the Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - c. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
 - d. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 7/0/1. (Drury abstained. Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:58 TO 5:06 P.M. ***

(5:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

7. **36 E VICTORIA ST**
- | | |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 039-183-006 |
| Zone: | C-G |
| Application Number: | PLN2023-00230 |
| Owner: | Christ Presbyterian Church |
| | Jordan Bentley, Representative Member |
| Applicant: | Lizette Elenes, ERA Architects |

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal for 2,988 square feet of additional floor area to two existing buildings on two separate parcels, resulting in a new combined building totaling 15,919 square feet. Additions include: 237 square feet of ground level infill to an existing recessed entry, a new 452 square foot mezzanine level, and a new 2,299 square foot upper level. Project includes a new roof deck, exterior alterations to the existing facades, eight short-term bicycle parking spaces, and a lot merger to combine the two parcels. Project requires approval of a Development Plan.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Development Plan Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project last reviewed on August 2, 2023.

Actual time: 5:06 p.m.

Present: Lizette Elenes, ERA Architects; and Jordan Bottenfield, General Contractor

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that the project has been taken over by a different applicant team since the Concept Review on August 2, 2023. In the time since the project was scheduled it was deemed eligible for Project Design Approval but can't receive it today due to noticing requirements.

Public comment opened at 5:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for continuing to work on the design and understands the consideration of cost for the next part of this process.
2. The design is too contemporary; bring it more in accordance with EPV guidelines.
3. Study the fenestration on the second floor. It is too horizontal in proportion and needs to be divided up to be more traditional Spanish Colonial Revival.
4. The cantilevered trellises on the second floor should have visual supports whether they are brackets or columns. Use traditional materials of either wood or metal that are appropriate for EPV.
5. The furring as proposed is not acceptable because it combines the building into a horizontal storefront look. The fenestration for the openings should include additional muntins in appropriate Spanish Colonial Revival language and tie to both Anacapa and Victoria Street fronts. Include lights with similar proportion and size in the openings.
6. Add additional detail to the entry so that it reads as an entrance with church character.
7. The trellis over the entrance should be more EPV appropriate.
8. The building should be broken up by either decorative elements, parapet walls, or other features so there aren't continuous horizontal lines across the building.
9. Suggestion to study the landscape on the Anacapa street frontage to ensure that it is in conformance.
10. Study lighting and improvements on the Granada Paseo side.
11. The colors as proposed are not vibrant enough. Study livening up the building with color.
12. Convey the church character of the building in detail or ornamentation.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:59 P.M. ***