



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 24, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (until 5:05 p.m.), Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan (until 5:05 p.m.), Nemec, and Ooley

Commissioners absent: Veyna

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:05 p.m.), Hernandez (from 1:32-2:11 & 3:30- 6:16 p.m.), Plummer, and Krystal Vaughn, Senior Commission Secretary

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **June 26, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Ooley abstained. Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Public comment opened at 1:40 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 1:42 p.m.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 24, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Nemec.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz recused himself from Item E, 1227 State Street; Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Sign Committee denied an exception for a neon sign at Institution Ale and the applicant filed an appeal which will come before the Commission as the HLC is the appeal body. At this time there is no official date for the hearing, although staff tentatively anticipates a hearing in August. Commissioners are discouraged from discussing the item until the appeal hearing, and will be required to disclose any ex-parte communications.
- b. The City has an application completeness review process now in place. The Commission is asked to indicate in their motion when a project is ready for Project Design Approval, as that will give clear direction to the applicant and staff. However, if the applicant chooses to request Project Design Approval without addressing all of the HLC comments, they may do so. Consistent with Government Code §65950(a)(5), there is a time limit of 60 days for the City to approve or disapprove a project once staff deems an application complete. The HLC will not be able to continue the project indefinitely once a project is scheduled for Project Design Approval. The applicant may request a time extension for the approval/disapproval upon mutual written agreement of the applicant and City for a period not to exceed 90 days from the date of the extension.
- c. Commissioner Veyna will be absent from today's meeting.

2. Chair Grumbine announced he will be leaving at 5:30 today.

3. Commissioner Drury announced that he had an informal meeting with members of other Boards and Commissions where they discussed problems with State Street, Neighborhood Compatibility, and the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

1. Commissioner Mahan reported that he has not been successful in contacting Architectural Board of Review Board Member Kevin Moore to coordinate awards however, he will continue to try.
2. Commissioner Ooley reported on the Designation Subcommittee meeting that took place on July 17, 2019.

(1:50PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**1. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A**

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Reference Number: PLN2019-00245

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on October 16, 2019 to consider designating the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A as Structures of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:06 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-7 to hold a Public Hearing on October 16, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 14 W GUTIERREZ STREET**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-019
Owner: Ablit Trust
Reference Number: PLN2019-00245

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 7, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival Commercial Dry Cleaners, designed by noted architect Roland Sauter in 1930 located at 14 West Gutierrez Street.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-8 to hold a Public Hearing on August 7, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival Commercial Dry Cleaners, designed by noted architect Roland Sauter in 1930 located at 14 West Gutierrez Street.

Action: Mahan/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**3. 830 DE LA GUERRA TERRACE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-071-015
Owner: Mara E. Hochman
Reference Number: PLN2019-00245

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 7, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Alex D'Alfonso designed house constructed in 1931 located at 830 De La Guerra Terrace.)

Actual time: 2:10 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-9 to hold a Public Hearing on August 7, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the, a Alex D'Alfonso designed house constructed in 1931 located at 830 De La Guerra Terrace.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**4. 517 CHAPALA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-038
Zone: C-R/USS
Application Number: PLN2017-00151
Owner: Ed St George
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
Applicant: Shelby Messner
Architect: On Design

(Project site is adjacent to a designated Structure of Merit: Dancaster Residence, constructed in 1887 in the Italianate style. The project consists of the demolition of an existing automobile dealership with 1,300 square feet of office space, merger of two lots (APNs 037-163-007 & 037-163-008) for a combined lot area of 11,500 square feet, and construction of a new three-story, 17,052 square foot (net) building containing 16 hotel rooms, a caretaker unit, and 519 square feet (net) of commercial space. The first level would include the hotel lobby, commercial space, 17 vehicle parking spaces, and three bicycle parking spaces. The second level would include nine hotel rooms and a courtyard area. The third level would include seven hotel rooms and a 905 square foot (net) caretaker unit. A 262 square foot roof deck would be provided for the caretaker unit.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-19, and the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria. Project was last reviewed on January 10, 2018.

Actual time: 2:11 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect, On Design; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; Philip Suding, Landscape Architect, Suding Design Landscape Architects; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that project was approved by the Planning Commission.

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Barbara Primeau
2. Salvatore A. (Tony) Vassallo; Ms. Vassallo ceded time to Mr. Vassallo
3. Leon A. Olson, support
4. George Ogle, opposed

Public comment closed at 2:37 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. In general, for aesthetic purposes, the Commission prefers power poles to be omitted or placed underground if possible.
2. The door on A1.4 detail 48 needs to be studied to see how it will function with the design.
3. Entry door into the lobby needs to be studied for accessibility and full entablature.
4. The Commission likes the entry into the commercial space.
5. The Commission does not like the iron work on the trellis above as proposed, however it is divided on whether or not it is acceptable.
6. The Commission prefers City Hall plaster texture.
7. The current color board submitted is moving in the right direction; however, it needs to provide more information on the plaster, tiles, window color samples, etcetera.
8. Provide sections that show roof top equipment.
9. Provide site sections that show where vents are located.
10. Show where the mechanical vents are located on exterior elevations.
11. The landscape needs to provide more specific detail, as it is currently too conceptual.
12. Vines would be acceptable on the back wall and are encouraged.
13. Provide screening of the fire sprinkler check valves.
14. Study alternatives to the proposed Junipers on the rear or alley elevation.
15. Detail the tower corbels, as shown on page 50 of the HLC guidelines.
16. Provided a sample of the plaster color and texture that is proposed.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 6/0/2. (Nemec and Edmunds abstain. Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:25 TO 3:34 P.M. ***

(3:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 40 E ANAPAMU ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2019-00243
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Klinzing
Landscape Architect: Laurie Romano

(This site contains designated City Landmarks: Central Library, constructed in 1916 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style, Faulkner Galley, constructed in 1930 in the Art Deco style, and five Corymbia Trees. Proposal for a renovation and upgrade of the landscape and hardscape area of the library property. Improvements include approximately 5,980 square feet of additional hardscape, 500 cubic yards of imported fill, a reduction in turf area and in total trees from 95 to 66, new planters, art work, lighting, and approximately 9,800 square feet of activity space. The project includes a new lower plaza for the south entrance to the Library to increase accessibility and address connections to La Arcada, the Museum north entrance, Library Avenue and the upper plaza. No improvements are proposed to the historic buildings or landmark trees.)

Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on June 12, 2019.

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Kalie Grubb, Arcadia Studio, Laurie Romano, Arcadia Studio; Bradley Klinzing, Supervising Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the application is here for a second concept review and the applicant has concurrently submitted to City Staff for Project Design Approval and the 30-day application completeness review; if the Commission believes the project is ready for Project Design Approval they should include that language in the motion. As a reminder, the applicant may choose to request Project Design Approval without addressing all comments of the HLC.

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anne Howard
2. Milt Hess, support
3. Lauren Trujillo, support

Written correspondence from Lynne Tahmisian was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:04 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support up lighting? 8/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support up lighting trees? 5/4 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support up lighting trees and some of the building? 4/5 Failed

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The historic entryway to the library should be modified per the historic drawings, which will be provided to the applicant.
2. Provide a perspective of the entrance to the Faulkner gallery from eye level and off axis, from the public sidewalk.
3. For the allé of palm trees, provide a 10 year visualization of what it will look like and study other paternal species of palms that could be used, and study other possible species of palm trees.
4. The mosaic is aesthetically pleasing and should be non-permeable; alternate draining should be considered and a colored rendering is to be provided.
5. Though an up-lit building would be fine-looking, it may not be appropriate for the City of Santa Barbara, however up lighting trees may be appropriate.
6. Provide alternative lawn options on Anacapa and Anapamu frontages; the Commission agreed that the existing lawn did not need to remain.
7. The proposed lighting plan is appreciated.
8. Simplify the ramp area so as to bring down the sidewall height including the railings.
9. Enhance and incorporate detail into the Library Avenue paving area.

Action: Mahan/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(3:55PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**6. E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-015, 033-120-016
Zone: P-R/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00324
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Rob Dayton
Contact: Taylor Berryman

(The California State East Cabrillo Boulevard Parkway Historic District, designed by the Olmsted Brothers is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a Potential Historic District. Proposal for pedestrian and bicyclist safety improvements from the Beachway at Skater's Point off Cabrillo Boulevard west along the Beachway to the entrance to Stearns Wharf, in order to reduce conflict points between pedestrians and cyclists by encouraging pedestrian use of the Cabrillo sidewalk and cyclists to use the Beachway. The project includes reconstruction of the sidewalks and Beachway around the Stearns Wharf restroom, and reorienting the Beachway toward the ocean by six feet on the northeast side of the Stearns Wharf crosswalk. A second, pedestrian-only crosswalk will be installed northwest of the existing shared crosswalk, and green bicycle stenciling will be painted on the Beachway. A pervious sidewalk will be constructed at an angle connecting the Stearns Wharf sidewalk to Cabrillo Boulevard's sidewalk so that pedestrians do not damage the Chase Palm Park grass, and the pervious concrete will have a perpendicular path connecting to the women's restroom. Project also involves new signage, and landscape improvements, including removal of two concrete connections between the skate park's perimeter sidewalk and the Beachway, to be replaced with planter beds, and installing new planter boxes at the terminus of the Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge rail to further define the separation of the sidewalk from the multiuse path.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 5:07 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Supervising Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Taylor Berryman, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the presentation is a City project for Public Works. This is the first concept review and is very conceptual; the Commission is asked to focus on landscape barriers and what type of landscaping is preferred.

Public comment opened at 5:22 p.m.

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 5:23 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission accepts and appreciates the need for the proposed improvements.
2. The Commission is not supportive of the planters as proposed as they have a temporary look to them; other suggestions are to use an iron railing in lieu of the planters of the same design as currently exists as part of the bridge, or to remove concrete paving and replace it with planting in that area.
3. Study using an alternative paving visual element at the pedestrian walk entrance towards Sterns Wharf to alert pedestrians that they are crossing a bike path.

Action: Drury/Ooley, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Mahan, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(4:40PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

7. 2948 SERENA RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-202-022
Zone: RS-7.5/USS
Application Number: PLN2017-00399
Owner: Francis C. Thompson
Applicant: Larry Thompson

(This is a revised project description. The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, constructed in 1925 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions and alterations to the existing one-story 1,017 square foot single-unit residence with a 169 square foot detached accessory building and one-car garage. The project includes demolition of 79 square feet of habitable space from the dwelling and removal of the one-car garage, and the addition of 516 square feet to the ground floor of the residence, 1,179 square feet for a new partial basement level, and 403 square feet for a partially subterranean garage with two tandem parking spaces. Project includes new handicap ramps for access at the front entry court. The project will address violation listed in ZIR No. 18473 by removing the rear deck and cover, for a new replacement deck. The proposed total of 3,115 square feet (of which 1,179 square feet of the partial basement level and 403 square feet of the subterranean garage are receiving a 50% FAR reduction) on a 7,637 square foot lot is 74% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project design has been revised from the original design granted Project Design Approval on January 9, 2019.

Actual time: 5:49 p.m.

Present: Laurence Thompson, Architect

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer stated that the project previously received Project Design Approval but there is now a different architect working on the project, some of the exterior design has changed, and handicap ramps have been implemented. Due to these changes, a revised Project Design Approval will be required when appropriate.
2. Ms. Hernandez provided a memo to the Historic Landmarks Commission outlining that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation so this project does not trigger a Historic Structures/Sites Report as drawn but the Commission may request one if they feel it is necessary.

Public comment opened at 5:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the paneling underneath the pop out window as presented? 5/1 Passed

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The access ramp is acceptable as proposed.
2. Regarding the pop out windows, the Commission requests that the metal roof be replaced with a traditional clay two-piece terra-cotta, tile roof.
3. The Commission stated that the project is ready for Project Design Approval.
4. The Commission agrees that there are no negative impacts to the Historic Resources.

Action: Drury/Ooley, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Mahan, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:16 P.M. ***

EXHIBIT A

	St Number	Prefix	St Name Vicinity	Year Built	APN
1	136	E	De La Guerra St.	1964-5	031-081-018
2	223	E	De la Guerra St.	1926	031-012-027
3	1520		De la Vina St.	1907	027-222-022
4	1603		De la Vina St.	1887-88	027-171-013
5	1706		De la Vina St.	1908	027-700-001
6	1255		Ferrelo Rd.	1967	029-271-010
7	1225	N	Salsipuedes St.	c. 1915	291-141-023
8	1235	N	Salsipuedes St.	c. 1915	029-141-022
9	724		Santa Barbara St.	1929	031-082-019
10	1301		Santa Barbara St.	1931	029-071-008
11	1332		Santa Barbara St.	1880 & 1922	029-072-028
12	1515		Santa Barbara St.	1909	027-241-008
13	1600		Santa Barbara St.	1940	027-192-020
14	1731		Santa Barbara St.	1907	027-111-016
15	1816		Santa Barbara St.	1929	027-042-011
16	1822		Santa Barbara St.	1885	027-042-020
17	1914		Santa Barbara St.	1916	025-382-023
18	1926		Santa Barbara St.	1916	025-382-022
19	2003		Santa Barbara St.	1920	025-322-008
20	2021		Santa Barbara St.	1929	025-322-003
21	2120		Santa Barbara St.	1906	025-252-001
22	2301		Santa Barbara St.	1928	025-131-008
23	2323		Santa Barbara St.	1921	025-131-006
24	2324		Santa Barbara St.	1921	025-132-015
25	2325		Santa Barbara St.	1919	025-131-005
26	2327		Santa Barbara St.	1922	025-131-015
27	14	E	Sola St.	1903	039-132-004
28	112	E	Sola St.	1921	029-071-019
29	220	E	Sola St.	1917	029-072-003
30	401	E	Sola St.	c. 1915	029-022-024
31	411	E	Sola St.	c.1905	029-022-022
32	419	E	Sola St.	c. 1931	029-022-020
33	424	E	Sola St.	c. 1920	029-085-006
34	430	E	Sola St.	c. 1920	029-085-007
35	35		State St.	1925	033-102-004
36	2101		State St.	1935	025-241-012
37	2131		State St.	1927	025-241-008
38	2135		State St.	1925	025-241-007
39	2310		State St.	1922	025-123-017
40	2331		State St.	1930	025-122-004
41	2419		State St.	1924	025-071-009
42	2426		State St.	1915	025-072-018
43	920		Summit Rd.	1916, 1921, several remodels	009-091-020; 015-300-001
44	219		Toyon	1930	053-233-007
45	15	E	Valerio St.	1883	027-102-015
46	28	E	Valerio St.	1906	027-182-022
47	105	E	Valerio St.	1938	027-111-013
48	335	E	Valerio St.	1884	027-121-010
49	510	E	Valerio St.	c. 1921	027-132-002
50	603	E	Valerio St.	1917	027-142-010