



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 9, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhardt, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Hausz, Butler, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and Manuel (until 4:00 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: Grumbine, Doordan, and Drury
Staff present: Kokinda, Hernandez, Burkhardt, and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Elly Bajor was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 26, 2022**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Lenvik, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Doordan, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Burkhardt announced that Chair Grumbine, Commissioner Drury and Commissioner Doordan will be absent.

D. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:45PM) HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 3237 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-019

Zone: RS-7.5/USS

Application Number: PLN2022-00415

Owner: United States Indian Health Service;

Kevin J. D'Amanda, Director, Division of Facilities Operations

Applicant: Scott Black, American Indian Health & Services

(Request for acceptance of a Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR) for 3237 State Street, September 2022, associated with the transfer of the property out of federal ownership to American Indian Health & Services. The transfer is subject to review under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) and Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA). The HSSR conforms with the requirements of Section 106 and the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code Chapter 30.157 (Historic Structures), the City's Master Environmental Assessment with Guidelines for Historic Structures and Sites. No development is proposed as part of this HSSR review request. The report concluded that the building is eligible for National, State, and local designation.))

Request for acceptance of a Historic Structures/Sites Report

Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:35 p.m.

Present: Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian; and Beth Collins, Land Use Attorney

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez gave a presentation that explains the triggers for Historical Structure reports and provided the background and framework of the project.

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with the comment that Figure 2 shall be modified to reflect the parcel boundary more accurately.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Doordan, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:59 TO 2:09 P.M. ***

(2:15PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

2. 1230 E DE LA GUERRA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-132-005
Zone: RS-7.5
Application Number: PLN2022-00252
Owner: Jordan & Elisse Evans
Applicant: Paul Sicat; Sherry & Associates, Architects

(The site contains a Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, constructed in 1940, that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to construct the following to an existing 2,431 square foot, two-story single-unit residence with an attached one-car garage: a 178 square foot addition to the first floor, and a 172 square foot addition to the second floor, a 296 square foot upper-level deck, 296 square foot covered patio below and Juliette balconies in the rear. The proposed total of 2,781 square feet of development, on a 10,000 square foot lot, is 75% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project site is located within the Hillside Design District and has an average slope of 20%.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings.

Historic Significance Report***Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect, Sherry & Associates; and Paul Sicat, Project Manager, Sherry & Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated the framework of the project, and provided information on the historic resources inventory, the historic resources standards, and guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the following comments:

1. The Board agrees with the reports and findings made by the Architectural Historian.
2. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
3. The Major Alterations Findings have been met as follows:

- a. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
- b. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Ensberg/Butler, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Doordan, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

3. OBJECTIVE DESIGN & DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS UPDATE

Reference Number: PLN2022-00033

Staff: Rosie Dyste; Project Planner, Planning Division

(Rosie Dyste, Project Planner, presented an update of the Objective Design and Development Standards draft.)

[Draft Objective Design & Development Standards*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:30 p.m.

Present: Rosie Dyste, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion Held

(3:10PM) COURTESY REVIEW

4. [GARDEN ST \(BETWEEN FIGUEROA & CARRILLO STREETS\)](#)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-212-011

Zone: O-R

Application Number: PLN2022-00426

Owner: County of Santa Barbara; Shane Mahan, Project Manager

Applicant: Chris Bradbury, RNT Architects

(The project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I, and consists of an on-grade surface parking lot located between Santa Barbara and Garden Streets. Project proposes to construct a new 4 story (3 floors over 1 partially subterranean parking level) 33,438-square-foot office facility for staff of the Santa Barbara County Probation Dept. Additional surface parking at the back of the lot will be provided.)

One-Time Courtesy Review of a County project on County-owned property. No final appealable action will occur.

Actual time: 2:55 p.m.

Present: Chris Bradbury, Architect, RNT Architects; Shane Mahan, Project Manager, County of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Commission comments:

1. Commissioner Lenvik stated that the building design is close to what the expectations of the HLC are for approval. There are minor things the applicant could do that would enhance the quality of the Mediterranean style of the project. The large plaster wall over the garage opening would be more traditional if there was no recess, and it was a primarily plaster wall with windows; the large plaster wall to the left of it, with one window, works. Does not have problem with the metal connecting element between the two towers; the recess on the tower can be simplified or eliminated. Hopefully the parapet height on the roof is tall enough to conceal a good portion of the electric panel arrangement. A traditional cornice on the parapeted walls would work well. The massing and features are close to being traditional. The applicant can simplify by restudying or eliminating the blue tile areas. The applicant should study the entrance of the parking garage to eliminate the appearance of mechanical equipment inside. The building should command respect of its users, similar to how other County buildings do. The arch opening under the mirador on the Garden St. elevation should be restudied or eliminated. Refer to the Monterey style building on East de La Guerra St. because at the rear it is Mission revival style with a contemporary connecting element.
2. Commissioner Ensberg stated that she agrees with much of Commissioner Lenvik's comments. The massing is nice and works well. She agrees with the comments on the blue tile piece, which occurs on two different elevations. The north elevation is simple and straightforward. Suggest that the applicant go through elements and see what can be eliminated and simplified. She appreciates the use of the stone and suggests it be used better and in more places. On the east elevation, study how the curtain wall, mirador, and arbor elements can work together; they seem to be fighting each other and don't have the right hierarchy. The wood in the courtyard elevation may not be necessary, and it seems out of character. The stone on the west elevation seems lost and needs to be tied in. The blue tile may be better used in a different location where it is more up close and visible. She does not think the cornice is necessary and likes the composition as is. The comments on the mirador are good ones, and the mirador should be highlighted.
3. Commissioner Manuel stated that on the Garden St. façade planting area, since there is 6 feet, the applicant should study adding some height of plant material to break up the tall walls, and consider adding more planting along Garden St.
4. Commissioner Hausz stated that the project is a handsome building and agrees with other comments that have been made. The central building element seems too contemporary, as if there was a need to add something different. Anything that can be done to soften that element would be helpful, perhaps with cornice as suggested. The garage entrance doesn't seem too tall, and if there is enough room, the applicant should consider adding a shallow arch across the plaster and with a sandstone wainscot to seem more traditional and softer. It is strongly recommended to enhance the garage entrance to not see mechanical inside the garage. Avoid the use of cap flashing on the top of the parapets, and instead plaster them. The arbor on the top of the building seems too spindly and overly tall, and the proportions should be worked on. The aluminum screen is not traditional for Santa Barbara architecture. He agrees with the comment on the wood siding in the courtyard. Refer to the El Carrillo project's flair at the corners of the parapets that could be traditional without hugely changing the composition of the element.
5. Commissioner Ooley believes that the building overall is too contemporary and believes the mirador is out of scale. The block that is sitting over the stone garage entry does not seem to seat well and echoes the suggestion of a shallow arch and stone wainscot.

(3:40PM) DISCUSSION ITEM**5. 481 W MOUNTAIN DR**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-103-005

Zone: RS-1A

Application Number: PLN2021-00127

Owner: McMillian Shelton Living Trust; Gault/O'Connor Living Trust; John Norris & Deborah Lowry; Norman J. Hendry & Cassie Jane Hendry Revocable Trust; Gary J. Hill & Helena S. Hill Revocable Trust; Jennifer Reitz William M. McMillan and Kimberlee Shelton, Trustees; Shelley Gault and John K. O'Connor, Trustees; Cassie Jane Hendry, Trustee; Gary J. Hill and Helena S. Hill, Trustees

Applicant: Joe Andrulaitis, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects

(The series of seven existing cottages constructed in 1947 are listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. The single-residential zoned site is developed with seven dwelling units (469-493 W. Mountain Dr.) and various accessory structures on one 4.59 acre lot, and is nonconforming to residential density. The project seeks approval of as-built and proposed new residential remodels, additions, and as-built and proposed new accessory buildings. The project has received a Lot Area Modification and a Setback Modification.)

Discussion of project and request to continue to Consent for Project Design Approval. No final appealable action will occur at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. A Phase 2 Historic Sites/Structures Report for the project was accepted by the HLC on October 26, 2022.

Phase 1-2 Historic Structures/Sites Report (Accepted by the HLC on August 2, 2021)*

Revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report (Accepted by the HLC on October 26, 2022)*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:40 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis+Mixon Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda stated that processing and noticing errors occurred that prevented the applicant from requesting Project Design Approval at this meeting; therefore, the project was agendaized as a Discussion Item to get comments on Project Design Approval consideration at a future meeting.

Public comment opened at 3:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks to Consent with the recommendation that the project be approved during Consent for Project Design Approval and be sent to Consent for Final Approval.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Doordan, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(4:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**6. 113-117 W DE LA GUERRA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-027

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2015-00626

Owner: John R. Dewilde

Applicant: Ed De Vicente, DMHA Architecture

(This is a revised project. The project site is located within the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I, and includes the W.D. Smith Building at 113 W. De La Guerra Street, which is on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to construct a new mixed-use building with 1,085 square feet commercial area and 23 residential units. All existing development would be demolished with the exception of the historic façade and tile roof of the W.D. Smith Building, which will be preserved. One existing Queen Palm in the right of way is proposed to be relocated. A Minor Zoning Exception is requested to allow for reduced driveway visibility adjacent to the portion of the existing historic building to remain.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires Project Compatibility Findings, Tree Removal Findings, Major Alterations Findings, and an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). A Minor Zoning Exception is requested to allow for reduced driveway visibility adjacent to the portion of the existing historic building to remain, and an Alternative Landscape Design Waiver. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2022.

[Historic Structures Report*](#)[HSSR Addendum*](#)[HSSR Addendum Plans*](#)[HSSR Addendum Driveway Elevation*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Ed De Vicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture; Ryan Mills, DMHA Architecture; and Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Shella Comin-DuMong
2. John Campanella

Written correspondence from Joan Davidson, Lina & Rick Wooden, and Shella Comin-DuMong was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support Project Design Approval? 5/0 Passed

Motion: Revised Project Design Approval with the following comments:

1. The Applicant shall continue to work with the neighbors to be sure that the project comes together in a way that makes everyone happy.
2. The awnings are mounted too high and need to be brought down.
3. The wood column post/beam brackets on the third floor need to be on top of the columns to spread the load.
4. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - g. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - h. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - i. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - j. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - k. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - l. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
5. The Commission makes the Tree Removal Findings as follows:
 - a. That principles of good forest management will best be served by the proposed removal;
 - b. That a reasonable and practical development of the property on which the tree is located requires removal of the tree or trees whose removal is sought;
 - c. That the character of the immediate neighborhood with respect to forestation will not be materially affected by the proposed removal;
 - d. & e. not applicable.
6. The Commission makes the Major Alterations Findings as follows:
 - a. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
 - b. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
7. The Commission makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
8. The Commission finds that the following Minor Zoning Exception criteria have been met regarding reduced driveway visibility:
 - a. The granting of such exception will not be detrimental to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the neighborhood;
 - b. The improvements are sited such that they minimize impact next to abutting properties;
 - c. The project generally complies with applicable privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting standards in the Single Family Design Board Good Neighbor Guidelines; and
 - d. The improvement will be compatible with the existing development and character of the neighborhood.

9. The Historic Landmarks Commission finds that the project qualifies for an Alternative Landscape Design Waiver for planting adjacent to the driveway building to provide relief for site constraints or to achieve a superior aesthetic.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 5/0/0. (Grumbine, Doordan, Manuel, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:47 P.M. ***