



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 16, 2020

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, and Ooley

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Ostrenger; John Doimas, Assistant City Attorney; Unzueta; Ellen Kokinda, Administrative Analyst; Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Janet Ahern, City TV Production Specialist; Hernandez; Plummer; and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Gott
2. Richard Closson

Written correspondence from Linda Wright was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 2, 2020**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 16, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that the HLC needs a new member to replace Julio Veyna on the Plaza De La Guerra Subcommittee. Vice Chair Hausz volunteered to accept the position.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced that the City is applying for a grant through the California Office of Historic Preservation that would fund an African American context statement that outlines the history of the community and identifies significant buildings. Commissioner Ooley volunteered as a member of the advisory committee that would help develop the grant application.
3. Chair Grumbine gave an overview the AIA Charrette.
4. Vice Chair Hausz announced that the City is proceeding with installing string lights on State Street and would like staff to investigate and return to the Commission with more information.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Drury reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Subcommittee.

(1:50PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATIONS**1. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES LISTED BELOW**

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

(The Commission is requested to review Staff Historic Significance Reports and hold a Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designations of four historic resources listed below.)

a. 32 E JUNIPERO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-123-006

Owner: James G. Mitchell

(Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed in 1929.)

b. 806 ORANGE AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-024-009

Owner: James & Nicole Lambert

(Italianate style house constructed in c. 1880s.)

c. 1734 ANACAPA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-071-007

Owner: Mission Housing Trust; Jill Kent, Trustee

(Queen Anne style residence constructed in 1888.)

d. 21 E CANON PERDIDO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-038

Owner: R&M El Centro Building, LLC; Westpac El Centro, LLC; 631 Chapala LLC
(Spanish Colonial Revival style building designed by noted architects Edwards and Plunkett in 1927.)

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt resolutions to designate as Structures of Merit the properties at 32 E Junipero Street, 806 Orange Avenue, 1734 Anacapa Street, and 21 E Canon Perdido Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Adopt resolutions to designate as Structures of Merit the properties at 32 E Junipero Street, 806 Orange Avenue, 1734 Anacapa Street, and the Edwards and Plunkett portion of 21 E Canon Perdido Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Edmunds abstained from 32 E Junipero Street.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATION**2. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES LISTED BELOW**

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contracts for the properties listed below.)

a. 806 ORANGE AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-024-009

Owner: James & Nicole Lambert

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the rehabilitation of the Italianate style house constructed in c. 1880s.)

b. 1734 ANACAPA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-071-007

Owner: Mission Housing Trust; Jill Kent, Trustee

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the rehabilitation of the Queen Anne style house constructed in 1888.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend to the Community Development Director to approve the proposed Mills Act Contracts for the properties at 806 Orange Avenue and 1734 Anacapa Street.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:10PM) MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATION

3. 21 E CANON PERDIDO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-038

Zone: C-G

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Owner: El Centro Building, LLC; R&M El Centro, LLC; Westpac El Centro, LLC; 631 Chapala LLC

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the rehabilitation of 21 East Canon Perdido Street, a Spanish Colonial Revival Style building designed by noted architects Edwards, Plunkett and Howell in 1927. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 21 East Canon Perdido Street, and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract.

Actual time: 2:24 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that City Council grant an exemption to the Mills Act contract limits and recommend to the Community Development Director to approve the proposed Mills Act Contracts for the property at 21 E Canon Perdido Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:20PM) CITY LANDMARK DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION**4. 601 E MONTECITO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-352-014

Zone: M-I

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Owner: MLG Leasing, INC.

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of the La Casa De La Raza, Spanish Colonial Revival style building constructed in 1931.)

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara; Cirenio Rodriguez; and Ralph Armbruster Sandoval

Public comment opened at 2:50 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Ana Rosa Rizo-Centino
2. Victoria Dominguez
3. Simone Ruskamp
4. Jennifer Smith
5. Fabiola Gutierrez
6. Eduardo Gonzalez
7. Chelsea Lancaster
8. Cameron Gray
9. Barry Remis
10. Kym Paszkeicz

Written correspondence from Betsy Preciado, David Pellow, and Dillon Grove was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2020-43 recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark La Casa De La Raza located at 601 E Montecito Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:30PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING**5. PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE HISTORIC RESOURCE ORDINANCE**

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review second draft of the Historic Resources Ordinance (Santa Barbara Municipal Code Chapter 30.157) and public hearing to consider recommendations to City Council.)

Ex parte communication: Vice Chair Hausz disclosed that he received ex parte communications about this item as a member of the Santa Barbara Conservancy.

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara; John Doimas, Assistant City Attorney

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days
2. Anna Gott
3. Richard Closson
4. Patricia Saley

Written correspondence from Ed Lenvik, Dennis Doordan, Fermina Murray, Kathleen Weinheimer, Mary Louise Days, Pat Saley, Richard Closson, Steve Dowty, and Susan Gantz was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:40 p.m.

Commission Comments:

- The Commission supports a no de novo hearing, only with evidence already presented to the HLC.
- The Commission supports the buffer zones around historic resources, but asks that staff clarify that they affect noticing only and do not put projects under HLC purview.
- The Commission suggests incorporating the word “neighborhood” to the third criteria in the Proposed National Register Criteria for 30.157, or adding a fifth criteria that mimics Items i or e in the Local Criteria Outlined in 22.22.
- The Commission supports early enforcement in cases of demolition by neglect.
- The Commission suggests defining “façade” as any exterior wall of a structure, including projections from and attachments to that wall, such as balconies, decks, roofs, porches, and chimneys.
- The Commission suggests pointing to other reference documents that can be easily changed, rather than listing approvable architectural styles in section 30.157.089, El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Item A.
- The Commission suggests consideration of the recommendations from public comment letters.

Motion: Recommend the draft Historic Resource Ordinance to City Council, with the comment that the Commission commends staff’s work.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:05 TO 5:15 P.M. ***

(3:30PM) ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES REPORT

6. 2515 CLIFF DR

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-272-033
Zone: E-3, S-D-3
Application Number: PLN2018-00396
Owner: Daniel & Barbara Jelks
Applicant: J. Grant Design Studio

(Proposal for improvements to a property located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Project involves addressing violations listed in ENF2018-00040, including permitting unpermitted slope repair, unpermitted walls and steps, and an unpermitted pump shed and spa.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Wood Environmental & Infrastructure, Inc.

Actual time: 5:15 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 5:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(3:40PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

7. DOWNTOWN AND WATERFRONT CITY RIGHT-OF-WAY

Assessor's Parcel Number: Multiple Locations in City Right-of-Way
Zone: C-G, M-C, HRC-2, S-D-3, P-R, H-C
Application Number: PLN2020-00378
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Samuel Furtner, Public Works
Business Name: Morgan Ramaker, BCycle

(In partnership with the City permitted bike share operator, BCycle, the Public Works Department is proposing the first phase of the Pilot Bike Share Program. When complete, the project will involve the installation of 500 bike share docks, which will serve 250 electric-assist bikes in a public bike share system. Of the 500 docks, around 300-350 will be located downtown or along State Street. The remaining 150-200 docks will be located along the Waterfront. A number of enrollment kiosks will be installed to help serve walk-up customers. These docks and bike share "stations" (grouping of docks) will be located in the furniture zone, adjacent to other street fixtures including: light poles, newspaper stands, planters and street trees, and existing bike hitching posts. Along State Street and in the Downtown area, these stations will consist of small groups of 2-6 docks. Along the Waterfront, and in higher usage area, this dock number may increase to accommodate additional users.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Criteria. Project was last reviewed on September 2, 2020.

Actual time: 5:19 p.m.

Present: Rob Dayton, Transportation Planning & Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Morgan Ramaker, Executive Director, BCycle

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Kent Epperson
3. Anna Gott
4. Barry Remis
5. Hillary Blackerby
6. Edward France

Written correspondence from Alex Trieger, Allied Neighborhoods Association, Andrea Moreno, Antoine Descos, Barbara Wishingrad, Ben Ellenberger, Blake Stok, Bob Zaratzian, Brogan Donahoe, Charity Dubberley, Christopher Montigny, Cynthia Stahl, Dawn Mitcham, Doug Fischer, Gesa Kirsch, Giuseppe Castenetto, Jeanne Dixon, Julie Churchman, Kim Stanley, Lisa Ballantine, Lisa Blake, Millie Sunbear, Mimi Balthazor, Nancy and Pat Donahoe, Nancy Mullholland, Paulina Conn, and Teresa Allen was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:40 p.m.

Motion: Deny the proposal as the Commission is unable to make the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria and consistency with Guidelines with findings:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have not been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project does not fully comply with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design and color, are inconsistent with design guidelines applicable to its location in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is contemporary in a Spanish Colonial Revival style district and not compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are irrelevant.
 - d. The Commission cannot determine if the design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources, because the applicant did not provide a location map.
 - e. The design of the project does not impact established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The Commission does not have enough information to determine if the project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Ooley/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:10PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**8. 410 STATE ST, 27 E. GUTIERREZ ST, 409 ANACAPA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022, 037-212-035, 037-212-030
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2020-00220
Owner: Series C of Old Town Properties SB, LLC
Applicant: The Cearnal Collective LLP (Architect)

(Proposal to merge three parcels located at 410 State Street, 27 E. Gutierrez Street, and 409 Anacapa Street, to create a 59,010 square foot lot. The proposed development involves construction of 81 rental units (43 studios, 20 one-bedrooms, and 18 two-bedrooms) averaging 695 square feet per unit, in a new four-story building on the existing parking lot located at 27 E. Gutierrez Street, using the City's Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The building would be approximately 90,930 square feet, including a 19,710 square foot ground floor consisting of a parking garage, residential lobby, trash enclosure, transformer, and bicycle parking. The proposal includes 89 parking spaces in a combination of surface parking spaces and parking lifts. Planning Commission granted the Community Benefit Project exceptions to height limitations.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on June 24, 2020.

Actual time: 6:12 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Applicant, The Cearnal Collective LLP; Martha Degasis, Senior Associate, Arcadia Studio Landscape Architecture

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Planning Commission approved the Community Benefit Project exceptions to height limitations.

Public comment opened at 6:34 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Robin Donaldson
3. Anna Gott
4. Fred Sweeney

Public comment closed at 6:42 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission prefers the ground floor of the paseo to be commercial rather than residential and finds the change to be an improvement.
2. Resolve the top level of the building to look less top heavy.
3. The Commission feels that the project is going in the right direction and is ready for Project Design Approval.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:13 P.M. ***