



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 13, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (at 1:32 p.m.), Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Ensberg, Lenvik, and McClure

Commissioners absent: Drury and Ooley

Staff present: Hernandez, Reidel, and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 30, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 13, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and McClure (Item A).

Action: Doordan/Butler, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Reidel announced that recruitment is open for Board/Commission elections. If there is a Commissioner with a term ending on the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) they will need to reapply. Recruitment closes on October 6, 2023.

2. Commissioner Ensberg requested that:

a. A preliminary review of the State Street plans be brought to the HLC for review as El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) is an important district.

b. A discussion item be agendaized on each agenda for the State Street interim plan and Master Plan.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the September 6, 2023 State St. Advisory Committee meeting.

Commissioner Ensberg and Chair Grumbine met with Staff on interim solutions on State Street.

Commission Comments:

In previous projects where there has been a lot of design work, money, time, and effort invested, the projects have gone too far in the process before being brought before the HLC. The Commission is worried that the HLC will be at the end of the State Street discussion and disappoint the applicants by having a harsh criticism of the design. The Commission wants the most efficient and successful flow for the project. Preliminary review is not too early for the project to come before the HLC. Although there are aspects of the project not in the HLC purview, all things take form in some physical way and will eventually be part of the HLC's aesthetic purview.

(1:45PM) NEW ITEM: HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. **800 E MICHELTORENA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-100-026
Zone: R-2
Application Number: PLN2023-00357
Owner: Ronald J Boehm
Applicant: Brian Zant

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The property is being evaluated for historic significance in conjunction with Enforcement Case ENF2023-00144 for unpermitted window replacement. The 2011 Lower Riviera Survey completed by Post/Hazeltine Associates found that the property may be eligible for historic designation. The HLC voted on January 29, 2014 to accept the conclusions of the survey and added the property to the Historic Resources Inventory.)

Requesting acceptance of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Sarah Corder and removal of the property from the Historic Resources Inventory. The report concluded that the property is no longer eligible for designation as a City Structure of Merit or City Landmark.

[Historic Structures/Sites Report](#)*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian, South Environmental

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted and remove 800 Micheltorena St. from the Historic Resources Inventory.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent) Motion carried.

(1:50PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

2. **[2101 STATE ST](#)**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-241-012
Zone: RS-7.5
Application Number: PLN2023-00272
Owner: First Congregational Church of SB
Peter R. Preiswerk, Representative Member
Applicant: Amy Von Protz

(Designated a Structure of Merit, First Congregational Church, constructed in 1935 in a vernacular form of the Colonial Revival style. Proposal to restore eight wood windows, replace 12 metal windows on the non-significant portion of the building with fiberglass, and replace an existing door.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alterations Findings are required. Project was last reviewed on the August 30, 2023 Consent Calendar and was continued to the Full Commission.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Applicant; Sharon Kaiser, First Congregational Church of SB; and Peter R. Preiswerk, Representative Member, First Congregational Church of SB

Public comment opened at 2:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following findings:

1. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources. The window installation is sensitive to the context of its immediate location to the historic sanctuary.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Lenvik/Doordan, 6/1/0. (Hausz opposed. Ooley and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Vice Chair Hausz stated that he is opposed because he cannot make the Project Compatibility Findings.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:20PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. 800 ALVARADO PL

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Zone: R-2/4.0/R-H

Application Number: PLN2023-00155

Owner: David Price

Applicant: Kaitlyn Earnest, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services, Inc.

(El Encanto Hotel Historic District is a designated Landmark, constructed in 1913-1930 by Soule, Ray, Eaton, Edwards, Plunkett, and Howell in the Craftsman Vernacular/Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposed exterior improvements to the site, located in the Hillside Design District, including two new pools, a spa, outdoor dining area, fencing, trellis, a valet kiosk, removal of a tiered water feature on an existing fountain, replace the (Alvarado Place) driveway materials from concrete to brick, and hardscape and landscape alterations. The project also includes one window to door conversion on Building 14, and the removal of one native oak and ten non-native trees.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Letter Addendum to the 2002 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Preservation Planning Associates. The report concluded that the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

B. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings, Hillside Design District Findings, and Minor Alteration Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

[Letter Addendum to 2002 Historic Structures/Sites Report](#)*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:46 p.m.

Present: Alexandra C. Cole, Architectural Historian, Preservation Planning Associates; Trish Allen, Applicant, SEPPS; Cameron Hunt, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; and Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis + Mixon

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Joe Campanelli
2. Beverly Johnson Trial

Public comment closed at 3:01 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 3:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue the report with the comment to address the concerns about construction impacts on the historic resources at the site.

Action: Hausz/Doordan, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for their submission. In general, the project is off to a good start, well done, and very supportable.
2. Provide site sections of the proposed construction areas with the nearest buildings and illustrate what the public would see of the proposed project from Lasuen Street towards the impacted areas and new features, possibly in an overlay rendering.
3. Provide a lighting design.
4. In general, infinity pools are too modern of a design. Study a more traditional pool design within the language of the period of significance of the surrounding buildings. Study historic examples of those periods and provide those examples to the Commission as precedence studies.
5. Study a more historic or traditional garden surrounding the pool in base D.
6. Continue to study the relationship of the pool locations to the neighboring properties in order to be sensitive.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:05 TO 4:11 P.M. ***

(3:20PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**4. 1925 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-008
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2023-00246
Owner/Applicant: Nineteen Twenty Five State LLC
Arvand Sabetian, Representative Member

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project is adjacent to 11 West Mission Street, Modoc Substation, a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to convert an existing 2,555 square foot commercial building to a 2,905 square foot mixed-use building. Project includes a 350 square foot addition, hardscape and landscape changes, new bicycle parking, and exterior alterations such as roofing, doors, windows, skylights, walls, gates, scuppers, and downspouts. Project requires approval of a Design Review Development Plan by the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Development Plan Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

11 West Mission Street Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

*** The item was heard out of agenda order. ***

Actual time: 5:05 p.m.

Present: Will Rivera, Architect, AB Design Studios; Eric Behr, Architect, AB Design Studios

Public comment opened at 5:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission compliments the designers on the beautiful design. They are generally very supportive of the project and look forward to it progressing.
2. The west patio has too little landscape. Study ways of bringing in more landscape, potentially with something more vertical to soften the area.
3. The Commission would support a taller wall of eight feet or more. Study decorative elements with security in mind.
4. The front wainscot tile should be a different color or design in order to be more decorative than the color of the window and door trim.
5. Further develop the back wrought iron railing on the west elevation adding more detail and breakups in the railing.
6. The Commission suggests adding muntins to the doors leading to the side patios, as it would make that patio space feel more residential.
7. Restudy the clearstory horizontal window on the back west elevation to make it more traditional in shape.
8. Check on skylights and their proximity.
9. The planters shall be a minimum of six inches in height.
10. The Commission feels that the project is ready for Project Design Approval if the above comments are addressed.

Action: Hausz/Doordan, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent) Motion carried.

(4:20PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 1919 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-005
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00346
Owner/Applicant: Nineteen Nineteen State LLC
Arvand Sabetian, Representative Member

(Located within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to convert three buildings at 1913, 1919, and 1921 State Street from office use to hotel use. Proposal for a conversion of 435 square feet of ground floor area to private patios and a 1,302 square foot addition to the existing fourth floor to create livable space and a roof deck. Project includes reduction of 365 square feet at the second floor, reduction of 430 square feet at the third floor, replacement and relocation of existing stairs, elevator extension, site alterations, and new landscaping. No proposed exterior alterations to 1913 State Street. Proposed reduction of 110 square feet and new entry doors at 1921 State Street.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project was last reviewed on July 19, 2023.

*** The item was heard out of agenda order. ***

Actual time: 4:13 p.m.

Present: Will Rivera, Architect, AB Design Studios; Eric Behr, Architect, AB Design Studios; and Justin Manuel, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Design

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that the last time this project was before the HLC it was agendized for Project Design Approval, but it was brought to Staff's attention that the parking lot changes triggered compliance with the Parking Lot Landscape Design Standards. The application has still not been deemed complete, therefore it is before the HLC for Concept Review instead of Project Design Approval.

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the Applicants for listening to the Commissioners previous comments. They have done a great job improving the design. It is an improvement to the existing building.
2. Continue to study the free-standing arches on State Street. Either integrate them into the building, eliminate them, or change to a different way of screening. The whole piece needs to be simplified.
3. Continue to study the three arches on building B in perspective. The Commission does not feel that it's necessary as a design element. Look at simplifying them to simple piers perhaps with a trellis.
4. The elevator tower is acceptable as proposed.
5. The plants up against the parapet edge spilling over onto the State Street side are not needed. The Commission suggests they be removed.
6. Restudy the transition between the stepped parapet on State Street and the taller parapet with the current plaster corbel.

7. Check whether utilities such as valves and transformers need to be installed. Study where those might go if they need upgrading or installing.
8. The Commission appreciates the solution on the south elevation.
9. The Commission feels that the project is ready for Project Design Approval with the above comments being addressed.

Action: Hausz/Ensberg, 7/0/0. (Ooley and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:29 P.M. ***