



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 17, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Senior Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (until 4:00 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Drury (until 4:45 p.m.), Ensberg (absent 2:28 – 2:37 p.m.), Lenvik, and Manuel (absent 2:37 – 3:52 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Ooley

Staff present: Kokinda, Burkhart, and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Kathleen Dagg, Bob Cunningham, Cars are Basic, and Virginia Rehling was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 3, 2022**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Butler, 7/0/1. (Manuel abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 17, 2022**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and Manuel (Items A and D).

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:**1. Ms. Kokinda announced the following:**

- a. The application for Item 1.C, 835 Laguna Street has been withdrawn by the Owner. In order for the property to qualify for the Mills Act Contract it needs to be publicly visible, and the Owner did not want to reduce the hedges.
- b. Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian will be absent from today's meeting.
- c. Bill Mahan, former HLC Commissioner, and Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian were honored with the John Pitman Memorial Award for service to the community by the Santa Barbara Conservancy on August 11, 2022.

2. Vice Chair Hausz announced the following:

- a. He requested a discussion item on the current use of the historic building code and typical questions that come up as projects are reviewed.
- b. He will need to leave the meeting early.

3. Commissioner Drury announced that he will be leaving the meeting early.**E. Subcommittee Reports:**

Commissioner Lenvik announced reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

Commissioner Doordan reported on the HLC Designation Subcommittee.

(1:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATIONS**

Reference Number: PLN2022-00033

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans that meet the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 30.157.145. Make a recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contracts for the following properties.)

A. 326 West Ortega Street:

APN 037-073-016: Designated a Structure of Merit on June 22, 2022. Constructed in 1890 in the Gothic Revival style.

[Proposed 10 year scope of work*](#)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

B. 2019 Plaza Bonita

APN 025-343-002: Designated a Structure of Merit on December 8, 2021. Designed in 1927 by Edwards, Plunkett and Howell in the Spanish Colonial Revival style.

[Proposed 10 year scope of work*](#)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

C. 835 Laguna Street

APN 031-021-019: Designated a City Landmark on March 15, 1983, and is listed on the California Register of Historical Resources and the National Register of Historic Places. Gonzales-Ramirez Adobe built circa 1825, restorations in 1923 & 1956.

[Proposed 10 year scope of work*](#)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda provided an overview of the Mills Act Historic Preservation Incentive Program and presented the 2022 applications. Additionally, she stated that the Owner for 835 Laguna Street has withdrawn their Mills Act Contract application.

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act Contract for the property located at 326 W. Ortega Street.

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comment: Commissioner Doordan stated that he is on the Designation Subcommittee, which raised several issues about additions and individual line items. He is satisfied with the responses received from Staff. He has thought a lot about the individual line items, and he is persuaded that it is the integrity of the whole building which must be preserved. The distinction between a physically attached addition and a stand-alone building is very significant. He is willing to include an addition in the effort to preserve the integrity of the whole. He is in support of the motion.

Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act Contracts for the property located at 2019 Plaza Bonita.

Action: Lenvik/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATION**

Reference Number: PLN2022-00033

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan that meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 30.157.145, recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract for the following property.)

401 East Pedregosa Street

APN 025-393-012: Designated a designated Structure of Merit on December 8, 2021. Constructed in 1912 in a combination of the Shingles and Craftsman styles.

Proposed 10 year scope of work***Historic Significance Report***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda provided an overview of the Mills Act Historic Preservation Incentive Program and presented the 2022 application for 401 E. Pedregosa Street.

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract for the property located at 401 E. Pedregosa Street.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:15PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 425 GARDEN ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-272-006

Zone: M-C

Application Number: PLN2021-00523

Owner/Applicant: Greg Reitz

(The project consists of demolition of the existing development and construction of a new 29,201 square foot, 36-unit apartment complex. The project proposes: two (2) Moderate-Income units, four (4) Very Low-Income Units, and thirty (30) market rate units. No parking is proposed on-site, consistent with the AUD Ordinance. The project is proposed at a density of 94.74 units/acre, which is allowable with the State Density Bonus Law.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by Ignacio Requena, M.S., RPA; Marirose Meyer, B.A.; and Carole Denardo, M.A., RPA of Provenience Group, Inc. The report was reviewed by Dr. Glassow, who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Ensberg recused herself from hearing this item due her involvement on a project with the Applicant.

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Carole Denardo, M.A., RPA of Provenience Group, Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (Ensberg and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:25PM) NEW ITEM: ONE-TIME PREAPPLICATION CONSULTATION

4. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013

Zone: HRC-1/S-P-1/S-D-3, HRC-2/S-P-1/S-D-3

Application Number: PRE2022-00042

Owner: Fess Parker-Red Lion Hotel by Santa Barbara JV Holdings LLC; Carl A. Mayfield, Vice President

Applicant: Trish Allen; SEPPS, Inc.

(Property is located within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project consists of a 48,400 square foot addition to the Hilton Santa Barbara hotel, to allow for 80 additional guest rooms, an adult swimming pool, spa, outdoor fire pit, lounge area and bar. The area of work is proposed to occur in the northwest corner of the parcel, toward South Calle Cesar Chavez and East Cabrillo Boulevard.)

One-time Pre-Application Consultation. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for a Project Design Review Approval.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item due to a conflict of interest with the Applicant.

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Applicant, SEPPS; Clay Aurell, Architect, AB Design Studios; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Arciniega stated that this is a pre-application review. The project will go before the Planning Commission for a Coastal Development Permit. Today's purpose is to get feedback on design, as the project is in a sensitive area. She is available to answer any questions.

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Judy Williams was acknowledged.

Commission comments:

- In general, the Commission is supportive of additional development in this general area for this project. This initial massing stage is important to get right.
- No Commissioners are opposed to the third story in this location, but the Commission needs to see how it will play out in the massing.
- The view shed study is very important. Particularly for photograph #7, taking the same views from sidewalk would be important. Overlaying the three-dimensional (3D) model of the massing from that view as well as views along the sidewalk is important for the Commission to see.
- Provide aerial views that show how things will look in full 3D, not just looking from the mountain side.
- Study recessing the third floor further back and see how it impacts views of the mountains from the sidewalk.
- In general, the project needs more romance and/or poetry. Perhaps simplifying the project is a way of getting there. With the current design and elevation proposed, the project appears too busy and complex.
- One Commissioner does not believe that the architecture for the addition should be different than the existing architecture. At least two other Commissioner find that they can support the idea of the architecture being subtly different, but still of a Spanish Colonial Revival style. Look at the Waterfront across the street as a reference and provide a sympathetic Spanish Colonial Revival style that is simpler than what is currently proposed.
- This proposed portion of the project becomes the front of the hotel and a major symbol of the hotel, therefore it is important to get it right.
- One Commissioner is in favor of more color and striped awnings.
- The existing pattern of the building separated by space is encouraged and at least several Commissioners feel this way.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:39 TO 3:52 P.M. ***

(3:10PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5.

432 DONZE AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-133-008

Zone: R-M

Application Number: PLN2022-00227

Owner: Janis Culmback Living Trust
Janis Jennings, Trustee

Applicant: Michael Ober

(Listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory constructed c. 1920 in the craftsman style. The project site is located within the Lower Riviera Special Design District. The site is currently developed with a 1,270-square-foot single-story single-unit residence and a 216-square-foot one-car garage. Proposal to demolish the existing 216-square-foot one-car garage and construct a new 617-square-foot two-story Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). Replacement parking for the primary residence includes one uncovered parking space to be located in the existing driveway. Staff Hearing Officer review and approval is required to allow the proposed ADU to be located 0'-8" from the east interior lot line, and 0'-6" from the south interior lot line.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alterations for Resources on the Historic Resource Inventory or within a Historic District Overlay Zone Findings would be required for a Project Design Review Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant, Vanguard Planning; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:07 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Janis Jennings, Owner

Public comment closed at 4:09 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Commission is generally in favor of the project and supportive of the requested setback encroachments, including the height increase within the setbacks.
2. Several Commissioners requested more information on the location and permit status of windows on the adjacent apartment building located at the rear of the property as it relates to this project.
3. On the northwest elevation, study the massing of the gable and the shed roof. One suggestion is to slightly bring forward the mass of the whole gable.
4. Study the composition and size of the entry door at the first-floor bedroom by changing the double doors to a single door.
5. Study the primary residence for wall to window ratios and window proportions. Provide photographs of the windows around the house for the next meeting. The Commission does not find that matching the clipped gable of the primary residence is necessary or appropriate for the proposed ADU.
6. On the southwest elevation, study the plan layout and the amount of windows and locations to be consistent with the primary residence, and consider a dormer or alternative method to bring light to the unit.

Action: Doordan/Butler, 6/0/0. (Manuel, Drury, and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:00 P.M. ***