



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JANUARY 19, 2022

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Acting Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Ted Hamilton, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Ted Hamilton, Assistant Planner.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (until 6:30 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Drury (until 6:45 p.m.), Lenvik (at 1:38 p.m.), Manuel (until 4:36 p.m.), and Ooley

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Sneddon; Hernandez; Hamilton; Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner; and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2021 Election of Chair and Vice Chair.

Nominations for Chair: Grumbine. Hausz/Drury, 7/0/1 (Grumbine abstained.)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Grumbine was elected as Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair: Hausz. Drury/Ooley, 7/0/1 (Hausz abstained.)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Hausz was elected as Vice Chair.

B. 2021 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Consent Calendar		
Architecture	Hausz	Grumbine
Landscape	Manuel	Butler
Sign Committee	Drury	Hausz
Street Tree Advisory Committee	Manuel	Butler
Arts Advisory Committee	Drury	Hausz
Subcommittees		
Design Awards	Drury, Lenvik , Doordan	Hausz
Designations	Doordan, Ooley, Lenvik, Manuel	Drury
Ad hoc Subcommittees		
Architectural Detail	Grumbine, Ooley, Doordan	Butler
Objective Design Standards	Grumbine, Lenvik, Ooley	Doordan
Guidelines Committee	Hausz, Ooley, Doordan	
FAR Committee	Lenvik, Ooley	
State Street Advisory	Lenvik	Doordan
Plaza De La Guerra Design	Drury, Hausz	Butler
Highway 101 HOV Project	Ooley, Manuel	
Lot 3 Paseo	Hausz, Drury	Doordan

Motion: **Accept the amended subcommittee list for 2022.**

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0 Motion carried.

C. Public Comment:

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Lanny Ebenstein
2. Anna Marie Gott
3. Fred Sweeney

Written correspondence from Richard Closson was acknowledged.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **December 22, 2021**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/1. (Manuel abstained.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Hamilton announced the following:
 - a. The Commission welcomes Keith Butler as its newest Commissioner.
 - b. Mr. Hamilton is leaving his employment with the City and this will be his last meeting. He introduced Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner as the new HLC Staff liaison.
2. Ms. Kokinda announced that Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor has retired and that she will be serving as Acting Design Review Supervisor until the position is filled.
3. Commissioner Butler introduced himself to the Commission
4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that previous Commissioner Mahan will be assisting with an ongoing project to provide HLC Training and Development.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

(2:00PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. **HISTORIC RESOURCES PLAQUES**

Reference Number: PLN2021-00039

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of Standardized Plaque to mark historic resources as recommended by the Historic Resource Plaque subcommittee. All reports and memos can be viewed at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC) Project last reviewed on December 8, 2021

Actual time: 2:23 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the comment that the Commission accepts the changes to Historic Resources Plaque design, with the request that a written document with specifications for the plaques are sent to the plaque applicants.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:15PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**2. 1426 ALTA VISTA RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-100-002
Zone: R-2
Application Number: PLN2021-00374
Owner: Starr Siegele
Applicant: Roxana Bonderson, Power Planning Services, LLC

(The Dutch Colonial Revival residence constructed in 1919 by Architect Wallace Neff is listed on the Historic Resources Inventory as eligible to be designated as a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 2-story addition to the primary residence consisting of 268 square feet on the second floor above a covered porch on the ground floor. The project includes a minor interior remodel. Pursuant to SBMC 30.20.030.B, a sloped lot setback reduction has been applied to the front setback along East Micheltorena Street, reducing the required front setback from 15 feet to 10 feet.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings, Major Alterations Findings, and Hillside Design and Sloped Lot Findings are required. The City's Architectural Historian prepared a Significance Report and a Memorandum evaluating the project's consistency with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. All reports can be found at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC.

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Roxana Bonderson, Applicant, Power Planning Services, LLC; Robert Rich, Applicant; and Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton stated that this is the first review by the HLC. The project has been deemed complete and is eligible for Project Design Approval. There is a provision in the Municipal Code that allows for a front setback reduction for the front setback along East Micheltorena Street, reducing the required front setback from 15 feet to 10 feet.

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission concurs with the City Architectural Historian's evaluation of the project.
2. The Commission accepts the proposed addition but would like to see further study of the dormer on the south elevation to make it more consistent with the other dormers on the same elevation.
3. Provide three dimensional views to give a better understanding of how the massing relates to the existing building.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/1/0. (Grumbine opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Chair Grumbine stated he is opposed to the motion because the issue of the dormer was minor enough that the project could have received Project Design Approval.

(3:00PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**3. 32 & 36 W CARRILLO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 039-281-029

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2021-00540

Owner: Carrillo Pacific LLC, C/O Bruce Meyer

Applicant: Cheree Naes, Core States Energy

(Proposal for a new electric vehicle charging station with 20 charging positions in two vacant lots on the corner of Chapala Street and W. Carrillo Street. The project also includes a new wood trellis structure, landscaping, mechanical equipment enclosure, an amenities space for customers, and public street improvements.)

No final appealable action will be taken at this meeting. The project was last reviewed on July 7, 2021 as part of a Pre-Application Review. City Staff prepared a [Staff Memo](#) describing HLC's purview.

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Lauren Peletta, Applicant, Electrify America, Inc.; Daniel Lasalle, Applicant; Cheree Naes, Applicant, Core States Energy; and Nicole Culp, Program Manager, Core States Energy

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton stated that this project has changed since the last review in terms of the required entitlements. At the previous review, the project was noted as requiring a Performance Standard Permit, however the City Attorney's office has determined the permit does not apply to electric vehicle charging stations. The related equipment to electric vehicle charging stations are subject to ministerial review and not design review.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for the improved design and for addressing the Commission's previous comments.
2. The equipment enclosure on the northeast corner shall be visually screened with a proper El Pueblo Viejo style screen.
3. The perimeter landscape plan needs to abide by all City rules, including 5-foot planting and a 3-1/2 foot wall around perimeter.
4. Study using planting to block any car headlights on Chapala Street and Carrillo Street.
5. At least four canopy trees need to be incorporated, as well as any other City landscaping requirements.
6. The large white wall on the north side of property needs to be planted either with vine pockets or another solution that will break up the wall and cover it. Follow City Municipal Code on the side of the planter.
7. The Commission suggests providing vines at the arbor at the intersection. The bollards shall match the light posts in terms of color and finish.
8. The pergola and trellis structure on the east side of the charging station is not traditional. The applicant shall study providing a traditional pergola, and column or trellis structures designed appropriately.

9. The Commission expresses concern for the uses of the corner, which is unattended and may have undesirable uses and present safety issues, especially at night. Review with the Police Department to see if there are additional methods to address the safety of the corner, including the possibility of an enclosure.
10. The proportion of the columns needs to be restudied for the pergola structure on the corner, providing more traditional Tuscan style columns. For the trellis structure on top, the columns should be stacked. Look at historic examples for sizing and profiles.
11. Try to lower the pole light height to 18 feet or less if possible.
12. The proposed decorative lights of the trellis are not necessary.
13. Any metal work and including any potential enclosures shall be historic in character, such as historic wrought iron work.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:37 TO 4:56 P.M. ***

(3:50PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. **DE LA GUERRA PLAZA/20 E DE LA GUERRA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-037
Zone: C-G/P-R
Application Number: PLN2019-00576
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Hess, Public Works Department

(De La Guerra Plaza is listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, City Hall and the California Pepper Tree, the News Press Building, El Paseo and Casa De La Guerra are designated City Landmarks, the La Placita building is a designated Structure of Merit. The De La Guerra Plaza Revitalization Project involves raising the entire Plaza, as well as De La Guerra Street between Anacapa Street and State Street, to curb height so that the building to building surface would be level. The purpose of the project is to beautify the Plaza and provide a more efficient space for current and future activities. Post/Hazeltine and Associates have prepared a [memo](#) on the historic resources and proposed plan. City Staff have also prepared a [Staff Report](#) for the project.)

No final appealable action will be taken at this meeting. The project was last reviewed on May 7, 2021. The previously [Historic Structures/Sites Report](#) accepted by the HLC board on August 17, 2011 can be viewed at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item due to a conflict of interest with the applicant.

Actual time: 4:56 p.m.

Present: Brad Hess, Principal Project Manager, Public Works; Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Detlev Peikert, Architect, RRM Design Group; Lief McKay, Principal Architect, RRM Design Group; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m.,

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Lanny Ebenstein
2. Mary Louise Days
3. Anna Marie Gott
4. Anne Petersen
5. Todd Boehr
6. Cassandra Ensberg
7. John Chaffee
8. Fred Sweeney

Written correspondence from Peter & Paulina Conn, William & Barbara Wood, Susan Chamberlin, Pamela Jameson Boehr, Victoria Valente, Francesca Galt, Barbara Lyon, Andrew Rawls, Kevin Snow, Barbara Bates Bonadeo, Elly Bajor, Rosanne Crawford, Citizen's Planning Association, Gale Goldberg, and Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:23 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Some Commissioners do not support an arcade and others think it is too large and needs to be less obtrusive.
2. While most Commissioners support a City Hall landscape design for the entry on Anacapa Street; it needs to be developed further to create a better presence.
3. One Commissioner supports the water feature.
4. The trash containers should be painted Milagre green and shall not be enclosed.
5. The simple shed design for the restrooms is preferred. One Commissioner suggests the restrooms to be relocated to the parking lot.
6. For the surface materials, all Commissioners prefer some grass.
7. Some Commissioners stated that "simpler is better".
8. The Commission supports closing the plaza and De La Guerra Street to vehicles.
9. Provide a visual integration of arts and culture.
10. Continue to reach out to the News Press.
11. The Commission would like to see solutions to make the plaza as safe and welcoming as possible.
12. Commissioner Drury and Vice Chair Hausz are appointed to a surface materials subcommittee to assist with developing a palette.
13. The Commission appreciates the City team, consultants, and everyone working hard on the project to move it forward.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 5/0/0. (Manuel, Drury, and Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:23 P.M. ***