



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JANUARY 31, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:40 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:59 p.m.), Reidel, and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 10, 2024**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 17, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Ooley abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 31, 2024**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.
- Action: Ooley/Butler, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. The article in the Independent about Saint Mary's Retreat Center behind the Mission was inaccurate. There are Historic Resources on the site, but they cannot be demolished without HLC review and approval. The project is not exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act process..
 - b. On February 10, 2024 the Parks and Recreation Department is hosting a workshop to look at alternatives and get public input for the Franceschi House site.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg announced there is an Objective Design Development Standards meeting on February 9, 2024.

(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. **DISCUSSION ON STATE STREET MASTER PLAN PROCESS**

Reference Number: PLN2024-00003

HLC Representative: Anthony Grumbine, HLC Chair

(A facilitated discussion by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) Chair on topics under the HLC's purview related to the State Street Master Plan. The Commission's comments will be submitted to the State Street Advisory Committee (SSAC) for consideration.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Kevin Boss
2. Marell Brooks
3. Anna Marie Gott

Written correspondence from Kevin Boss and Joanna Kaufman was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. On slide 15 of the State Street Master Plan Discussion presentation add the guiding principle, "To preserve and enhance the distinctive architectural and urban character of El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) which is based on Spanish Colonial Revival Architecture."
2. Acknowledgement of EPV to become a regular introductory part of State Street Advisory Committee (SSAC) meetings.
3. The landscape needs to respond to State Street appropriately whether it's informal or formal in the Mediterranean EPV style. Formality and simplicity are preferred.
4. Request to continue the discussion on State Street Master Plan Process to the next Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) hearing.

(2:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

2. 400 W CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-261-009
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00354
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to construct a new 63-unit residential building. The project includes at-grade surface parking and garage parking as well as additional amenity spaces such as a common room and courtyard outdoor space. The units are proposed to be 100% rent-controlled Moderate-Income (80-12% AMI) and Middle-Income Affordable (120-160% AMI). The project calls for the removal of 8 king palms, 1 jacaranda, and 15 tipu trees on the property; no City street trees or trees within the flood control area outside the western property line will be removed.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required. Project last reviewed on January 18, 2023.

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Christie Brown, Architect; Courtney J Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Megan Arciniega, Senior Planner

Staff comments: Ms. Arciniega stated that after this project was last seen at HLC it went to Planning Commission for their recommendation. It then went to City Council where they approved the Land Use Approval Required Development Agreement. The applicant is requesting the Commission's reconsideration of story poles and comments on the Project Compatibility Findings.

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments and findings:

1. The planter is too modern and needs to be EPV appropriate.
2. The porcelain paver is not EPV appropriate. Select a new porcelain paver.
3. Consider a brighter white for the color of the plaster.
4. The Commission supports not moving the courtyard spacing and all design decisions that the applicants made based on previous HLC comments.
5. Consider the long-term effect of having a solid rod iron fence as opposed to tube steel especially on the public side of the fence.

6. The Commission does not support the synthetic lawn.
7. In this instance the Commission supports waiving story poles.
8. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City, with the removal of the synthetic lawn.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/2/0. (Lenvik and McClure abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:22 TO 3:28 P.M. ***

(3:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. 920 SUMMIT RD (MONTECITO CLUB)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	015-300-001
Zone:	A-2/SD-3
Application Number:	PLN2023-00484
Owner:	MCC BB Property, LLC Joseph Hicks, Representative Member
Applicant:	Nicole Biergiel, SEPPS

(The Montecito Club's clubhouse only is a designated Structure of Merit, designed in 1918 by Bertram Goodhue in the Spanish Colonial Revival style and remodeled in the 1920s by George Washington Smith. Proposal to extend the existing pool deck southerly to accommodate a new spa and cold plunge pool at the existing pool complex of the Montecito Club, including demolition of 1,187 square feet of existing pool deck replaced with 1,288 square feet of new deck area, and construction of an 845-square-foot subterranean equipment room beneath the pool deck to support the mechanical equipment for the pools. Existing glass windscreens are to be reused to enclose the adjusted shape of the pool deck and a new pathway will be created to service the equipment shelter. Grading is limited to 10 cubic yards of cut and 0 cubic yards of fill in the area around the pool and to provide a terraced slope.)

- A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine. Phase 2 concluded that the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).**
- B. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.**

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Steve Welton, SEPPS; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Henry Lenny, Henry Lenny Design Studio; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for their careful consideration of design elements, existing conditions, and views of the public right of way.
2. The Commission is very supportive of the design.
3. The Commission finds that the project generally meets the Project Compatibility Findings and is sensitive to the historic resource.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:59 TO 4:17 P.M. ***

(4:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL**4. 1919 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-005

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2022-00346

Applicant/Owner: Nineteen Nineteen State LLC

Arvand Sabetian, Representative Member

(Located within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to convert three buildings at 1913, 1919, and 1921 State Street from office use to hotel use. Proposal for a conversion of 435 square feet of ground floor area to private patios and a 1,302 square foot addition to the existing fourth floor to create livable space and a roof deck. Project includes reduction of 365 square feet at the second floor, reduction of 430 square feet at the third floor, replacement and relocation of existing stairs, elevator extension, site alterations, and new landscaping. No proposed exterior alterations to 1913 State Street. Proposed reduction of 110 square feet and new entry doors at 1921 State Street. Project requires a waiver by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow an alternative parking lot landscape design.)

Final Approval is requested. Project plans must demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on November 8, 2023, which is when the project was last reviewed.

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Eric Behr, AB Design Studio; and Will Rivera, AB Design Studio

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for a great project and the hard work they have done.
2. The design for the cell tower enclosure is appropriate as presented with the hope that it can be plastered and if not, painted to match adjacent walls. Without the cornice is acceptable as it will be less obvious.
3. Provide a reflected ceiling plan for the first floor. Show the full lighting plan with the drive through and walkway. Show the appropriate dark sky compliant lighting fixtures with specs including the glass and fixture. Some Commissioners feel that light fixture B should be changed to something more Spanish Colonial Revival.
4. The backflow preventer double check valve is not acceptable as proposed. Remove it from the front and ensure it is screened appropriately.
5. The landscape plans aren't complete. Provide quantities, locations, sizes, and screening of plants if they are used as screening devices.
6. Consider painting building C.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 8/1/0. (Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:06 P.M. ***