



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 25, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (until 4:19 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik (absent 4:20-4:25 p.m.), Ooley, and McClure (until 5:00 p.m.)
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Kokinda (until 1:45 p.m.); Hernandez (until 1:45 p.m.); Carly Earnest, Assistant Planner (until 5:00 p.m.); Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner (at 5:00 p.m.); and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 11, 2024.**

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 11, 2024**, as amended.

Action: Lenvik/Butler, 8/0/1. (Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **September 11, 2024.**

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **September 11, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

D. Ratification of action taken on the Consent Calendar of **September 25, 2024**.

Consent Calendar September 25, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval ROW-1450	APN: ROW-1450 PLN: PLN2024-00295 Zone: C-G	City of Santa Barbara / Derrick Bailey, Principal Traffic Engineer	Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted
2.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval ROW-1444	APN: ROW-1444 PLN: PLN2024-00288 Zone: C-G	City of Santa Barbara / Derrick Bailey, Principal Traffic Engineer	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with condition
3.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval ROW-1376	APN: ROW-1376 PLN: PLN2024-00293 Zone: C-G	City of Santa Barbara / Derrick Bailey, Principal Traffic Engineer	Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted
4.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 2050 Garden St	APN: 025-331-020 PLN: 2024-00105 Zone: RS-15	Thomas Hayes Davenport Jr / Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design	Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted
5.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 424 Bath St	APN: 037-201-024 PLN: 2023-00439 Zone: C-R	Terence Alemann / Michael McGuire, McGuire Project Management	Continued indefinitely

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 25, 2024**, as reviewed by Vice Chair and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that the City received a \$40,000 grant from the State Office of Historic Preservation to conduct a comprehensive survey in the San Roque neighborhood to identify historic buildings.

2. Commissioner McClure announced that he will need to leave the hearing at 5 p.m.

3. Vice Chair Hausz announced that he will need to leave the hearing at 4 p.m.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:45PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**1. 340 E LOS OLIVOS ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-261-004
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2024-00241
Owner: James Charles Lee
Applicant: Brooke Vanduyne, Sherry & Associates Architects

(Located in the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part II, and listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory, the "Edwards/Dole House" was constructed in 1911 in the American Colonial Revival style. Proposal for as-built 209-square-foot addition, landing, HVAC system, water heater, and door and window alterations on the existing 265-square-foot detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). Project includes a new pool, spa, and associated equipment. Request for a Minor Zoning Exception (MZE) from the HLC to allow an existing overheight hedge to remain at 12-feet tall near the property line. Project requires approval from the Staff Hearing Officer for two zoning Modifications to allow the as-built addition to the existing detached standard ADU to be constructed within the primary and secondary front setbacks; as well as a zoning Modification to grant relief from front setback standards to allow the proposed swimming pool to be located closer than 15 feet from the secondary front lot line. The proposed total of 6,641 square feet of development on a 13,589 square foot lot is 159% of the maximum required Floor-to-Lot Area Ratio. Project will partially abate violations in ENF2023-00438.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Zoning Exception Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Phase 1-2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Brooke Vanduyne, Sherry & Associates Architects; and Holly Garcin, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Garcin stated that this project is before Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) for Concept Review to decide if it is appropriate for the project to move on to the Staff Hearing Officer (SHO). If the SHO approves the project will return to HLC for Project Design Approval and Final Approval. Staff is looking for comments on the Minor Zoning Exception and the aesthetic appropriateness and the siting of the as-built additions to the ADU and the new pool. The applicant will return to HLC to abate the violations on the primary residence and garage.

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the doors and windows remaining as they are currently installed? 1/8 Failed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to return to Full Commission with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for coming before HLC.
2. The Commission supports the Minor Zoning Exception for the 12-foot hedge.
3. The Commission is generally supportive of the Front Yard Setback Modification for

- the pool. Study narrowing the pool and finding an alignment within that local area.
4. The Commission finds the massing of the ADU addition generally acceptable.
 5. The ADU railing as proposed is not acceptable. Eliminate the railing for a simpler design.
 6. The ADU shingles, gable, rake, and eave overhang should be maintained.
 7. The ADU siding is acceptable.
 8. The ADU doors and windows as proposed are not acceptable as the proportions and materials are not sensitive to the main house. Study the main house proportions of doors and windows. The trim around the windows and doors should be complementary to and simpler than the main house. Doors and windows should be either aluminum clad wood or all wood to match the existing house.
 9. The Commission supports the memorialization of the aqueduct and looks forward to seeing the design.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

2. [1533 STATE ST \(also referenced as 1529 STATE ST\)](#)
- | | |
|---------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 027-231-022 |
| Zone: | C-G |
| Application Number: | PLN2024-00226 |
| Owner: | PS & RS LLC |
| | Pradeep Shastri, Managing Member |
| Applicant: | HBA Architects |

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to construct a new four-story mixed-use development comprised of 27-units developed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program with an average unit size of 811 square feet. The first floor of the development includes a 4,500-square-foot commercial space, parking garage, residential office, residential lobby, residential yoga studio, and additional amenity space. The project also includes a basement level garage for the residential units, a bicycle storage room, and residential storage room. Staff Hearing Officer review and approval of a Modification for open yard is required.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. The project received a one-time pre-application consultation under PRE2022-00126 on March 29, 2023.

Actual time: 2:55 p.m.

Present: Jay Blatter, HBA Architects; Karl Benkert, HBA Architects; Courtney J Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that this project previously came before HLC for a one-time pre-application consultation. Subsequently the project went before Planning Commission (PC) for AUD conceptual review. Staff is looking for comments on consistency with the Project Compatibility Findings, aesthetic appropriateness of the Modification for open yard, and story poles.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Annika Dahlen
2. Kerstin Corson
3. Suzanne Cohen
4. Patty Ficke
5. Alejandro Perez

Written correspondence from Rebecca Sweeney, Mitchel M. Tsui on behalf of Western States Regional Council of Carpenters, Patty Ficke, Jeff Johnson, Jason B. Wilson, Kerstin N. Corson, Karen Fox, Matthew Raddue and Alice Chen, Andy, Suzanne Cohen, Rajeev Bajaj, Tom Kaljian, Cindy, Tom Carlson, and Kristen Miller on behalf of Santa Barbara South Coast Chamber of Commerce was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:33 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support story poles? 2/9 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support no story poles? 2/9 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support waiting until the next hearing when the Applicant returns with more information to decide on story poles? 5/9 Passed

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Most Commissioners feel that with more information they may be convinced to waive story poles.
2. Return with 3D aerial views showing the project's relationship to adjacent properties. Include street elevations down Arrellaga Street at least two properties over. Show El Prado Inn and adjacent buildings down State Street. In video form would be ideal, but it is not required.
3. Return with solar studies tracking shadows throughout the day and showing the impact the massing will have on adjacent neighbors.
4. The Commission thanks the Applicant for the adjustments that have been made since the one-time pre-application consultation. The project is continuing to go in the right direction.
5. Study the inside corner at State and Arrellaga. Break down the four-story massing so it no longer feels like a four-story blank wall. Suggestion for wrapping and/or extending towards Arrellaga.
6. The Commission is concerned about the operability of the commercial space.
7. The Commission is concerned about bike parking for the public.
8. Study increasing the internal open space to maximize open space for residents.
9. Adjust the door and window openings to have a greater wall to window ratio. Study historic examples and the neighbor next door in terms of proportions.
10. The Commission loves the arcade.
11. Suggestion to study the building on Pedregosa and State as well as the Baylor/Lobero building for examples of wall to window ratio, balconies, and details.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:25 TO 4:29 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. 1 HOT SPRINGS RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
Zone: R-1/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2024-00217
Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
Brian Holland, Managing Member
Applicant: Melisa Turner, DesignARC Inc.

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Only the Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain on site is a designated a City Landmark, constructed in 1911-1912 by Francis W. Wilson in the Beaux Arts style. Proposal for a new 22-unit residential development comprised of two- and three-story townhouses with private garages and carports. The average unit size is 1,421 square feet and the gross building area is 31,258 square feet. Project requires approval from the Planning Commission for a Setback Modification to allow encroachments into the required front and interior setbacks; a Coastal Development Permit; a Local Coastal Program Amendment to change the coastal land use designation from Parks/Open Space to Medium Density Residential (12 du/ac); and a Local Coastal Program Amendment for a Coastal Zoning Map Amendment to change the zone from R-1/SD-3 (One-Family Residence/Coastal Overlay) to R-3/SD-3 (Limited Multiple Family Residence/ Coastal Overlay) Zone.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:25 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Principal, DesignARC Inc.; Melisa Turner, Senior Project Manager, DesignARC Inc.; Mark Shields, DesignARC Inc.; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that this project went before PC on August 15, 2024 where they initiated the Local Coastal Plan amendments that allow this project to move forward to HLC. These amendments will need to be approved by City Council and the Coastal Commission. Staff is looking for comments on story poles, Project Compatibility Findings, and the Front and Interior Setback Modifications.

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Cristo Artusio was acknowledged.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the Applicant for a very beautiful and supportable project.
2. The Commission supports making the exception to not require story poles based on the Applicant's persuasive design, 3D renderings, and lack of neighbors.
3. Break up the visual pattern of the buildings through a variety of techniques to make them individual designs as opposed to repeated patterns.

4. Study relating the front corner buildings to the trough as they will be the primary view from the public right of way.
5. Include unified paving. The landscape plan is acceptable.
6. Suggestion to break up, modulate, and/or limit the arches as they are strong design features.
7. Restudy the large, two story opening to be more traditional and less contemporary in wall to window ratios as well as proportions.
8. The Commission supports the Front and Interior Setback Modifications.
9. The project generally meets the Project Compatibility Findings of neighborhood compatibility, mass, bulk, and scale with additional refinements.
10. Study the areas around the trough so that they feel more connected with the property.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 7/0/0. (Hausz and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

(4:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL

4. 400 W CARRILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-261-009
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2022-00354
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to construct a new 63-unit residential building. The project includes at-grade surface parking and garage parking as well as additional amenity spaces such as a common room and courtyard outdoor space. The units are proposed to be 100% rent-controlled Moderate-Income (80-12% AMI) and Middle-Income Affordable (120-160% AMI). The project calls for the removal of 8 king palms, 1 jacaranda, and 15 tipu trees on the property; no City street trees or trees within the flood control area outside the western property line will be removed.)

Final Approval is requested. Project plans must demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on January 31, 2024, which is when the project was last reviewed.

Actual time: 5:15 p.m.

Present: Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective; Laura Benard, The Cearnal Collective; Nicole Greer, CJM::LA; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition that visitor bike parking be provided.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 7/0/0. (Hausz and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

(4:30PM) PRE APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT PROGRAM

Staff: Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner

(In compliance with Assembly Bill 1332, the City is implementing a program to provide for the pre-approval of accessory dwelling unit (ADU) plans. To gain pre-approval of their ADU design, a designer must receive an affirmative vote from at least one of the City's design review bodies (Architectural Board of Review, Single Family Design Board, and/or Historic Landmarks Commission). Once an ADU design has been approved by a design review body, the designer may submit working construction drawings to the City's Building & Safety Division for review of Building, Zoning, and Fire code compliance. Approved designs will be posted on the City's website with the designer's contact information so that anyone may contact the designer to purchase the pre-approved plan set. Pre-approved ADU plan sets are subject to shorter permitting deadlines in an effort to streamline housing production.)

5. CONTINUED ITEM: PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS

Application Number: PRE2024-00105
Applicant: Lucrezia DeLeon, Itzi House

Proposal for pre-approval of a 250 square foot one-story detached accessory dwelling unit design with a gable roof in a Craftsman style variation (Design A) and a Spanish style variation (Design B); and a 400 square foot one-story detached accessory dwelling unit design in a Spanish style variation (Design C) and Craftsman style variation (Design D).

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A, B, C, & D. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable. Designs were last reviewed August 28, 2024.

Actual time: 5:45 p.m.

Present: Lucrezia DeLeon, Itzi House; and Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner,

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton-Rolle stated that there was an error on the agenda. This project was last reviewed on July 17, 2024.

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Design Options A and D with conditions:

1. Change the porch posts to 8x8 inches instead of 6x6 inches.
2. Adjust the base of the porch posts to be square and match elevation one for width.
3. Align the beams above the porch columns in both directions at the corner with the 8x8 inch posts.
4. The rafters on the eaves should be open rafters without a fascia board.
5. Bring the windows on rear elevation three inward from the corners at least 12 inches.
6. Include a concrete slab porch that is at least three inches wider in both directions than the porch columns.
7. Align the rafter ends.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/1. (Doordan abstained. Hausz and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of Design Options B and C with conditions:

1. Change the porch piers to 16x16 inches instead of 12x12 inches with an elliptical arch. Remove the plaster corbels.
2. Include a concrete slab porch that is at least two inches wider in both directions than the plaster piers.
3. Add two-piece clay tile.
4. Line up the eaves with the porch and main massing.
5. Ensure that the square opening is aligned on both sides.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/1. (Doordan abstained. Hausz and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:22 P.M. ***