



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

FEBRUARY 5, 2020

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (at 1:45 p.m.), Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: Ooley

Staff present: Ostrenger, Unzueta (until 2:08 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:26 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 22, 2020**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 5, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Grumbine and Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that Commissioner Nemec is moving to Florida and today will be his last meeting with the Historic Landmarks Commission.
2. Ms. Unzueta thanked Commissioner Nemec on behalf of the Santa Barbara Community Development Department for his service on the Historic Landmarks Commission.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

1. Commissioner Mahan reported on the Design Awards Subcommittee.
2. Commissioner Veyna reported on the De La Guerra Plaza Subcommittee.

(1:50PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. 1514 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-020

Zone: R-M

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Owner: Edward St. George

(Review of Staff Report, based on Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on October 30, 2019, and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Italianate style house constructed c. 1875.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:43 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:44 p.m.

Motion: **Adopt Resolution 2020-4 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Italianate style house constructed c. 1875 at 1514 Garden Street.**

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

2. 1520 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-021

Zone: R-M

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Owner: Edward St. George

(Review of Staff Report, based on Historic/Sites Report accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on October 30, 2019, and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Gothic Revival style house constructed c. 1874.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:52 p.m.

Motion: **Adopt Resolution 2020-5 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Gothic style house constructed c. 1874 at 1520 Garden Street.**

Action: Hausz/Nemec, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 1103 HARBOR HILLS DR

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-021

Zone: RS-15

Application Number: PLN2019-00492

Owner: Herman & Teri Roup, Trustees

Applicant: Dylan Henderson, SALT Architecture

(Proposal for 775 square feet of additions to an existing 1,772 square foot single-unit residence with a 420 square foot carport. Proposal includes demolition of existing deck, removal of existing carport, removal of existing atrium, and removal of roof to be replaced with a new roof configuration. Project also includes a new 456 square foot attached two-car garage with a 456 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at the second level for a total of 912 square feet of accessory space. A new 827

square foot deck with guardrails, new doors and windows, new siding, and a new trash enclosure are also proposed. The proposed total of 3,459 square feet of development on 15,883 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 79% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

Acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Allison Jaqua, is requested.

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Dylan Henderson, Applicant, SALT Architecture

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. The Historic Landmarks Commission will review the report only; the actual project will go to the Single Family Design Board for review.

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with the condition that the applicant amend the report to include a site plan showing the context of the neighborhood and the surrounding streets.

Action: Hausz/Edmunds, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 1100 E CABRILLO BLVD & 1414 PARK PLACE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-001, 017-383-001, 017-381-001

Zone: P-R/S-D-3

Application Number: PLN2019-00535

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: George Johnson, Parks and Recreation

(The Andrée Clark Bird Refuge (part of the California State East Cabrillo Boulevard Parkway Historic District, designed by the Olmsted Brothers) located at 1100 E Cabrillo Boulevard, and the Municipal Tennis Center property located at 1414 Park Place, are on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as they are eligible for designation as historic resources. The project proposes to improve water quality and restore habitat for aquatic and avian wildlife with the replacement of the Andrée Clark Bird Refuge Lagoon weir and weir gate, removal of approximately 23 non-native trees, recontouring portions of the lagoon shoreline, recontouring the mouth of the lagoon on the beach side (adjacent to the volleyball courts), seasonal lowering of the sand berm at the mouth of the lagoon on the beach side, and installation of native plants and rock clusters along the margin of the lake, islands and mouth of the lagoon. Construction of a bio-retention basin will also occur at the municipal Tennis Center property, located at 1414 Park Place. New proposed interpretive signs around the lagoon will be reviewed separately by Sign Committee. Planning Commission review is required for a Coastal Development Permit and recommendation to the California Coastal Commission.)

Acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, is requested.

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeologist, Stone Archeological Consulting; and George Johnson, Creeks Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 1100 E CABRILLO BLVD & 1414 PARK PLACE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-001, 017-383-001, 017-381-001
Zone: P-R/S-D-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00535
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: George Johnson, Parks and Recreation

(The Andrée Clark Bird Refuge (part of the California State East Cabrillo Boulevard Parkway Historic District, designed by the Olmsted Brothers) located at 1100 E Cabrillo Boulevard, and the Municipal Tennis Center property located at 1414 Park Place, are on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as they are eligible for designation as historic resources. The project proposes to improve water quality and restore habitat for aquatic and avian wildlife with the replacement of the Andrée Clark Bird Refuge Lagoon weir and weir gate, removal of approximately 23 non-native trees, recontouring portions of the lagoon shoreline, recontouring the mouth of the lagoon on the beach side (adjacent to the volleyball courts), seasonal lowering of the sand berm at the mouth of the lagoon on the beach side, and installation of native plants and rock clusters along the margin of the lake, islands and mouth of the lagoon. Construction of a bio-retention basin will also occur at the municipal Tennis Center property, located at 1414 Park Place. New proposed interpretive signs around the lagoon will be reviewed separately by Sign Committee. Planning Commission review is required for a Coastal Development Permit and recommendation to the California Coastal Commission.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: George Johnson, Creeks Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she provided a copy of the original 1924 Olmsted Brothers design for reference.

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Tracey Willfong

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission feels that the project will be very good and is ready for Project Design Approval.
2. Provide a rendering of the outlet structure from the path view.
3. Show the removable handrail from the path view.
4. Provide a rendering of the proposed retention basin from main public views and include the stacked boulders.
5. Show details of the chain link fence in the northwest corner.
6. Provide color and material samples for any above ground built objects and structures.
7. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:26 TO 3:37 P.M. ***

(3:05PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

6. [113-115 & 117 W DE LA GUERRA ST](#)
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-027, 037-082-003
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2015-00626
Owner: John R. Dewilde
Architect: Ed De Vicente, DMHA Architecture

(The W.D. Smith Building, constructed in 1928 and located at 113 W. De La Guerra Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 23-unit mixed-use project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program on two parcels known as 113-115 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-027) and 117 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-003). The project proposes the demolition of two existing 1,113 and 923 square foot commercial buildings, two outdoor patios, 15 surface parking spaces, and the near complete demolition of a 4,455 square foot commercial building, of which the historic façade and tile roof will be preserved. The project proposes to construct a 28,788 square foot, three- and four-story mixed-use building that includes 16,692 square feet of residential area, 1,139 square feet of commercial area, and 10,957 square feet of parking garage. Twenty-six parking spaces will be provided in the at-grade parking garage. The residential component comprises 23 residential units with an

average unit size of 685 square feet and a unit mix of studios, one-bedroom, and two-bedroom units. The two parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential/Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). The proposed density on the lots totaling 16,273 net square feet will be 62 units per acre. One existing Queen Palm in the right of way is proposed to be relocated and one existing avocado tree at the rear of the property is proposed to be removed. A Minor Zoning Exception is requested to allow for reduced driveway visibility adjacent to the portion of the existing historic building to remain.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Analysis, Findings for Tree Removals, Historic Resource Findings, and an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). A Minor Zoning Exception is requested to allow for reduced driveway visibility adjacent to the portion of the existing historic building to remain, and an Alternative Landscape Design Waiver. Project was last reviewed on January 22, 2020.

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA Architecture; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Ed Di Vicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that due to the Permit Streamlining Act, the Commission will need to make an action at this meeting and if Project Design Approval is granted, they will need to make the findings outlined in the staff report. Ms. Arciniega stated that the Commission should include the staff recommended conditions of approval as part of their motion, with any changes they deem necessary.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions:

1. On the north elevation, return with an alternative detail treatment for the garage entry and wall above, and reduce the garage opening height to the minimum required.
2. On the south elevation, return with alternative detail treatment of the wall above the three brick infills.
3. On the north elevation, return with alternatives for the recessed three-story wood balconies, the upper-level of the three-story portion at the courtyard, and the recessed portion at the far south end.
4. The Commission prefers the open patio option on page L.1 with no tree in the center.
5. Return with an alternative option for the brick step pattern in the front courtyard.
6. Return with fleshed out details for an in-progress review.
7. Add additional perspective studies from the front looking southeast.
8. The Commission accepts the staff-prepared Decisions and Findings Memorandum for 113-117 W De La Guerra dated February 5, 2020, and is incorporating by reference the findings and actions for CEQA Exemption 15183, Historic Resource Findings, Minor Zoning Exception, Alternative Landscape Design, Street Tree Removal, and Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria, as well as conditions of approval 1-9 contained therein.
8. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:

- a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
- b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
- c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
- d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
- e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:54 P.M. ***