



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

MAY 25, 2022

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Acting Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Senior Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan (until 4:45 p.m.), Drury, Ooley, and Manuel (absent 1:42 – 2:37 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Lenvik

Staff present: Kokinda; Heidi Reidel, Planning Technician; and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Cassandra Ensberg, Accessible Santa Barbara, and Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **May 25, 2022**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/1. (Manuel abstained. Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

Commissioner Doordan announced that he will leave the meeting early.

- D. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Hard Materials Subcommittee.

Commissioner Drury reported on the Arts Advisory Subcommittee.

(1:40PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 3707 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-590-024

Zone: C-R/USS

Application Number: PLN2021-00093

Owner: Michael McColm; McColm 3707 State, LLC

Applicant: Sarah Bronstad; Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck LLP

(The Chick-fil-A restaurant proposes to convert the existing one-lane drive-through to a new two-lane drive-through for the existing service window. The project includes a new canopy over the drive-through lanes behind the building, new ordering stations/menu boards with small canopies, widening the entrance driveway to three lanes for improved site access, reconfiguring the existing parking lot and removal of 15 parking spaces, new bike racks, a new storm water treatment system, and other site improvements. Landscaping requires consideration by the ABR of an Alternative Landscape Design pursuant to SBMC §30.175.080.E.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich Ph.D., R.P.A., of Leftwich Archaeology. The report was reviewed by Dr. Glassow, who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 1:37 p.m.

Present: Brent Leftwich, Ph.D., R.P.A., Leftwich Archaeology

Public comment opened at 1:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(1:45PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**2. 101 GARDEN ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-008; -009; -018; -021; -024; & -027
Zone: HRC-2/SP-2/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00052
Owner: Wright Family H. Limited Partnership
Applicant: Carolyn Groves, Dudek

(The project site is located within the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project consists of a new 250-room, 235,690-square foot (net) hotel located on a 4.53-acre site at the southwest corner of Garden and E. Yanonali Streets. The project site is Area A of the Cabrillo Plaza Specific Plan (SP-2). The hotel would consist of 120 standard guestrooms and 130 extended stay guestrooms. A total of 266 parking spaces would be provided (33 surface and 233 in an underground parking garage). All existing structures and uses on the site would be removed. The project includes a voluntary lot merger of the six lots. The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Parking Modification, Development Plan, and Coastal Development Permit.)

No final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. The project also requires Planning Commission approval of a Parking Modification, Development Plan, and Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on [August 7, 2019](#).

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item due to a conflict of interest with the applicant.

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that this project is currently under a 30-day completeness review by Staff. If this project is ready to move forward to the Planning Commission, the HLC should provide comments regarding the Project Compatibility Analysis Findings. The Commission will also need to make a determination on whether they would like to request story poles for this project.

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission is very supportive of the project, likes it a lot, and thinks it is developed well.
2. The bar and arch window on Sheet A2.1.3 needs to be restudied, potentially arching the bar window or provide a blind window, or some other solution as it looks awkward as proposed.
3. The staircase on Sheet A.2.1.6 needs more study. Potentially look at providing plaster wall for portions of it, as it is too busy with all the iron pickets. The big blank wall above the stair needs some articulation, for example a small window or some other form of articulation.
4. The landscape design is very beautiful, attractive, and impressive. A suggestion is to provide a didactic panel explaining the difference in landscape habitat.

5. On Sheet A.2.1.3, the tower design needs to be adjusted. The columns are too slender and do not feel strong enough for support. Restudy the tower; the upper portion of the tower especially.
6. The Monterey component of the design is very successful and appreciated.
7. On Sheet A.2.1.5, the wood trellis as well as the trellis on the roof deck appears awkward and disconnected from the rest of the roof structure. They need to be restudied in terms of placement, or materials and design, to feel more integrated with the building.
8. On Sheet A.2.1.5 the openings are too repetitive and institutional looking, look at ways to break them up more. One suggestion was to warm them up with color.
9. The public facing walls should be a minimum of 8-inch thick with the windows set back.
10. The Commission can support not having story poles for this project, it is not a tall building and the Commission has a clear picture of the impact of the development.
11. The Commission makes preliminary comments regarding the Project Compatibility Analysis Findings (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project. The project is appropriately establishing character of neighborhood.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate because of the large footprint of the project.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 6/0/0. (Lenvik and Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(2:15PM) NEW ITEM: ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION CONSULTATION

3. 1815 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-011
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PRE2021-00221
Owner: 1815 State Street LLC
Applicant: Rachel Raynor, RRM Design Group

(The project site is located within the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Conceptual review of a new 16-unit, four-story residential development under the City's residential density bonus program. The project would remodel the existing commercial building fronting State Street, demolish the existing rear commercial building, convert the front building to 4 residential units, and attach a new 12-unit residential building and a new 16-space parking stacker. The site plan will accommodate residential open yard, two surface parking spaces, loading space, trash enclosure, and landscaping.)

No final appealable action will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Tony Tomasello, Applicant, RRM Design Group; Katie Moses, Architect, RRM Design Group; Deitlev Peikert, Principal, RRM Design Group; Chris Van Bogelen, Owner, 1815 State Street, LLC; and David Chase, Owner, 1815 State Street, LLC

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda stated that this is a one-time pre-application consultation. The Commission should provide comments on the design but there will be no motion.

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m.,

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Fred L. Sweeney

Public comment closed at 2:58 p.m.

Commission comments:

- The floorplan, site plan, and the general massing seems to work pretty well for the site and is a good use for getting a number of residences on this tight lot.
- Look at other precedents, especially close by the project, for both the language and expression on both State Street and along the side.
- Simplify the front elevation and the side elevation in terms of having less languages; have one or two languages to work with. Spanish Colonial Revival style is key. Simplify the front with less elements, including the tile which stands out too strongly. Accentuate what was the entry doors and have a feel for that, especially the center portion.
- Stylistically, do not take the project a contemporary way, remove the contemporary horizontally of the proportions and detailing and go towards an El Pueblo Viejo appropriate style.
- On the front, articulate the corner piers more and give them either a base, shaft, and capital or articulate some other way.
- Provide more information on the bungalow proposed to be removed. Look at moving it as opposed to demolishing it.
- Provide a landscape plan. The hardscape needs to be El Pueblo Viejo appropriate. There is a good amount of landscaping and that is appreciated.
- On the garage, provide a perforated masonry screen or grill that looks real in lieu of the windows.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:33 TO 3:45 P.M. ***

(2:45PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 820 CIMA LINDA LN

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-162-018
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2022-00087
Owner: Katie and John Carpenter
Applicant: Glen Deisler; DesignARC, Inc.

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, designed by noted architect Carleton Winslow, FAIA, in 1926, is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The project proposes a 402-square-foot

demolition and construction of an 898-square-foot first floor addition, a 795-square-foot second floor addition, a 185-square-foot second floor terrace, and an 845-square-foot three-car garage to the existing 5,322-square-foot single-story single-unit residence. The project also proposes demolition of a 720-square-foot swimming pool and spa, and the installation of a new 1,088-square-foot swimming pool and spa, and 220-square-foot pergola; as well as the addition of two uncovered parking spaces. The site includes an existing 720-square-foot accessory structure. The proposed total of 7,015 square feet of floor area, on a 46,654-square-foot lot, is 140% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations to Resources on the Historic Resource Inventory Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

[2003 Historic Structures/Sites Report*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields, Applicant, DesignARC, Inc.; George Mansour, Project Designer, DesignARC; and Jay Carlander, Ph.D. Historian

Public comment opened at 4:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

The following individual(s) spoke:

Written correspondence from Susan Budinger & Jeff Harrah, Susan Jordano, Nancy Even, Andrea (*no surname provided*), and Marcy Burton was acknowledged.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The project is very supportable. The Commission thanks the applicant, team, and the owner for bringing the project forward and handling the historic structure in sensitive way.
2. The Commission appreciates the site visit to help understand how pieces of the project have been changed and what has not.
3. This is the most appropriate way to add to the historic structure because the addition is located at the back end and part of many remodels.
4. The Commission would like to see a landscape plan showing the trees being removed as well as a full planting design.
5. On sheet A.3.2 on east elevation, study the guard rail break up and design further and the adjustment to the bracket design at the master bedroom.
6. The Commission feels that for the neighborhood the size seems appropriate as well as the FAR and scale.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

(3:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL**5. 256 EUCALYPTUS HILL DR**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-050-026
Zone: RS-25
Application Number: PLN2021-00494
Owner: Okeanos SB, LLC
Applicant: Trish Allen and Haley Kolosiekie; SEPPS, Inc.

(The Solana Estate, a Stripped Classicism style estate designed by Frances Underhill and constructed in 1913, is a Structure of Merit. The proposed project consists of exterior alterations to the main residence, new trellises, an elevator to the roof deck, new landscaping, and new exterior stairs and site walls.)

B. Requesting acceptance of an Addendum to a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report that was accepted by the HLC on December 8, 2021, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that the implementation of the proposed project would have a less than significant (Class III) impact on a designated historic resource; and that after implementing the proposed project, the property would maintain its status as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Revised Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Lenvik and Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

A. Final Approval is requested. Project plans must demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on December 8, 2021. The project was last reviewed on December 8, 2021.

Present: Don Nulty, Architect, Don Nulty AIA; Katie Klein, Landscape Architect, Parryi Studio; and Tarn Shea, Don Nulty AIA

Public comment opened at 4:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 4/0/2. (Drury and Butler abstained. Lenvik and Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:46 P.M. ***