



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 25, 2020

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Planning Technician I

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, and Ooley

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Tony Ruggieri, City TV Production Supervisor; Unzueta; Hernandez; Plummer; and Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 11, 2020**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Mahan abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 25, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that the Planning Commission will be reviewing amendments to the Historic Resources Ordinance on December 3, 2020.
2. Chair Grumbine requested a discussion item be scheduled for State Street improvements related to the parklets.
3. Jessica Metzger, Project Planner requested for two members to serve on a Working Group to develop new Floor-to-Lot Area Ratios for multi-unit housing development. The group will be composed of appointees from Historic Landmarks Commission, Architectural Board of Review, and Planning Commission.

The Commission appointed Commissioner Ooley and Commissioner Lenvik to the Working Group.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Subcommittee.

(1:50PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

1. 701 CHAPALA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2020-00575
Owner: Nancy Boeseke Brock
Applicant: DMHA Architecture

(Proposal for tenant improvements to an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project involves various improvements including a new plaster finish over existing walls, window and door improvements, constructing a new roof at the exterior dining area, new roof mechanical equipment and associated screening, new seating and counter finishes at the existing exterior counter, and the removal of two trees.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Applicant, DMHA Architecture; and Justin Harmon, DMHA Architecture

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Matthew Ozyilmaz

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:09 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the comment that the style of the project is not acceptable, and the applicant should provide a style that follows the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Design Guidelines.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:35PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

2. 1790 SYCAMORE CANYON RD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-163-018

Zone: RS-1A

Application Number: PLN2019-00128

Owner: BGHS Holdings, LLC

Applicant: Karl Kras, Kras Design Studio

(This is a revised project description. This site contains a designated City Landmark: Jack's Trough/Courtney Fountain, constructed in 1926 by Lulah Riggs. The lot is otherwise vacant as the original non-historic residence was demolished. Proposal for a new 2,460 square foot two-story residence and detached two-story accessory building comprised of a 665 square foot garage and 525 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above. The project includes new entry gates and restoration of the historic fountain. The new entry gates require a waiver by the Public Works Director to be located closer than 20 feet to the front property line. The proposed total of 3,650 square feet on a 34,309 square foot lot is 75% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project design has been revised from the original design granted Project Design Approval on October 16, 2019. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Landmark findings are required.

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Karl Kras, Applicant, Kras Design Studio; and Matthew Simpson, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project is requesting new Project Design Approval and Final Approval due to elevation changes, window and door changes, and a slight increase in height of the primary residence that was originally approved.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner on behalf of Martha Helkey

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt and Glenn and Irene Dorfman was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The design is generally acceptable and an improvement.
2. The height increase is acceptable.
3. The Commission finds the traditional window details and mullions favorable.
4. The Commission is encouraged to hear about the continued stewardship of the landmark fountain by the owners.
5. The Commission looks forwards to reviewing the restoration of the landmark fountain if funds become available for restoration.
6. Address the gate and driveway and make sure clearance and vehicle turnaround works.
7. The hardscape above the fenced termination of the driveway shall be studied to minimum pavement included, if possible.
8. Specify lumen outputs for all exterior fixtures.
9. Study the entry segmented arch at the front porch.
10. Increase the thickness on the plaster on either side of second floor balcony dormer.
11. As required for Landmarks in Section 22.22.080 of the Municipal Code: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.
12. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC 22.69.050) as follows:
 - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale is appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
 - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details.
 - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree, or Landmark Tree.
 - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
 - g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:38 TO 3:47 P.M. ***

(3:20PM) PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**3. 401 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-018
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2020-00552
Owner: Shaohong Watanabe
Applicant: Melisa Turner, DesignARC Inc.

(This is a One-time Pre-Application Consultation. Proposal to demolish all existing structures and construct a new four-story mixed-use hotel development comprised of 21 hotel rooms, and 1,766 square feet of commercial space for a spa. The hotel development will include a lobby, lounge, rooftop deck, and six parking spaces. Planning Commission approval is required for Development Plan Approval of 25,814 square feet (net) new non-residential floor area and a Transfer of Existing Development Rights.)

This is a One-Time Pre-Application Consultation. No final appealable decision will take place at this hearing.

Actual time: 3:47 p.m.

Present: Melisa Turner, Applicant, DesignARC Inc.; Mark Kirkhart, DesignARC Inc.; and Mark Shields, DesignARC Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project is a one-time Pre-Application Consultation and the Applicant is looking for discussion of the overall concept of the project.

Public comment opened at 4:07 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Matthew Ozyilmaz

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:09 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. Many, if not a majority, of Commissioners felt that, in general, this is a nicely designed project. The Commission recognizes that the height and size of State Street and Downtown is increasing.
2. There are concerns about the project's neighborhood compatibility.
3. Provide aerial views and three dimensional renderings moving around the site and looking at the larger context of the surrounding block and buildings.
4. There are too many different elements, simplify the openings and their shapes and designs.
5. The overall size and the combination of windows is too large in size and scale. Study the precedent of other Mediterranean buildings with similar openings in town. The mullions and divisions are too large to read as a residential scale.
6. Some Commissioners are concerned about the wrapping of the steel awning cover on the corner.
7. The entrance extending over the sidewalk is problematic for some Commissioners and draws too much attention to the building.

8. Applicant should try to get the parking access from the neighbor's easement rather than from Gutierrez Street.
9. On the State Street elevation consider providing more awnings and smaller windows on that elevation.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:58 P.M. ***