



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 22, 2020

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Ooley, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta; Ellen Kokinda, Administrative Analyst; Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Janet Ahern, City TV Production Specialist; Hernandez; Plummer; and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 8, 2020**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 22, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that staff is incorporating a timer feature limiting applicant presentations to 15 minutes, which is consistent with the remote public meeting procedures provided to applicants in advance of the meeting. The Commission should state if they feel additional time is necessary at the beginning of the item.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:50PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. TRAINING ON HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM

Reference Number: PLN2020-00068

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Staff presentation on the Historic Preservation Program. Updates on the City Website, Historic Designation Reports, and general Commission training.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:55 TO 2:02 P.M. ***

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held.

(2:05PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM – RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

2. 1512 CASTILLO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-021

Zone: R-MH

Reference Number: PLN2020-00018

Owner: Cota Family Trust
Judy Cota, Trustee

(Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.035.(d)(2), the permit request of a possibly historic structure shall be scheduled at the Historic Landmarks Commission for a hearing on the application concurrently with a duly noticed hearing to allow the Commission to decide among the following options: 1) Listing on the Potential Historic Resources List, 2) Structure of Merit designation, or 3) City Landmark designation of the Queen Anne style house constructed in c. 1895 located at 1512 Castillo Street.)

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2020-5 to hold a Public Hearing on October 14, 2020 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Queen Anne style house located at 1512 Castillo Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

3. 1431 OLIVE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-022-007

Zone: R-M

Application Number: PLN2019-00428

Owner: Matt Davis

Applicant: Brett Ettinger, Ferguson-Ettinger Architects, Inc.

(The Craftsman style residence constructed circa 1920 and located in the Lower Rivera Special Design District is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as contributing to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. Proposal to demolish the existing detached carport and shed located at the rear of the property, and construct a new detached two-story building comprised of a 900 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and 400 square foot two-car garage. Project includes demolishing 105 square feet at the rear of the main residence to allow for a bridge connection from the ADU to the main residence, an approximately 144 square foot deck at the upper level of the new building that will service the ADU, and a 158 square foot patio. Hardscape alterations include improving the existing concrete driveway and a new permeable concrete turnaround at the new building. The proposed total of 2,626 square feet on a 6,250 square foot lot is 96% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. Staff Hearing Officer approval was granted for an Open Yard Modification.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires consistency with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 007-20. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Historic Resource findings are required. Project was last reviewed on October 16, 2019.

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Brett Ettinger, Applicant, Ferguson-Ettinger Architects, Inc.; and Matt Davis, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the Staff Hearing Officer did not place any conditions of approval on the Open Yard Modification.

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following findings:

1. The Commission makes the finding, as required for Historic Resources in section 22.22.037 of the Municipal Code: that the proposed alteration will not substantially and adversely alter the structure's appearance or remove a character-defining feature of the structure, site or natural feature.
2. The Commission finds that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance have been met as required in section 22.69.050 of the Municipal Code as follows:
 - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
 - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree or Landmark Tree.
 - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise and lighting.
 - g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley. Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The garage door is not acceptable as submitted and needs to be more craftsman in style.
2. The Juliet balcony is acceptable but the applicant should consider refining that detail.
3. The Commission makes the finding, as required for Historic Resources in section 22.22.037 of the Municipal Code: that the proposed alteration will not substantially and adversely alter the structure's appearance or remove a character-defining feature of the structure, site or natural feature.
4. The Commission finds that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance have been met as required in section 22.69.050 of the Municipal Code as follows:
 - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
 - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree or Landmark Tree.
 - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise and lighting.

- g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/1/1. (Lenvik opposed. Edmunds abstained.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Lenvik voted no because he does not feel that the concerns about the garage door merit a continuation.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(3:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 1221 ANACAPA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-046
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2019-00658
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Tyler Scott, Ameresco
Architect: DMHA Architecture

(Proposal to construct a new 500-kilowatt (kW) solar photovoltaic (PV) system on the upper level of the City-owned Granada Garage, located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District that will also function as a parking canopy. The superstructure will have a maximum height of 47'-3", and consist of high-strength steel columns and beams, with galvanized light-gauge steel purlins on top to support and attach the solar modules. Perimeter planters will be installed to soften the edges of the solar canopy. The project also includes the removal of existing rooftop light poles and 13 small olive trees in pots to allow for the new solar photovoltaic canopy. Planning Commission review and approval is required to exceed the standard height limit of 45 feet in the Commercial General/High Density Residential/Priority Housing Overlay (C-G) Zone.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on April 15, 2020.

Actual time: 3:08 p.m.

Present: Alelia Parenteau, Energy And Climate Program Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Ed deVicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Henry Lenny, Henry Lenny Design Studio

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project requires Planning Commission review for exceptions to height limitations. The project was revised since the Historic Landmarks Commission last saw it and now has one consistent height rather than an angled height range.

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission understands the need for solar but believes it should be hidden from public views as much as possible.
2. The design for Anacapa Street appears to work best, and for the Anapamu Street frontage it was suggested that the applicant study pulling back the panels from the parapet or dropping the solar panels along the edge to the ground level so they are out of view from the street.
3. Study the views from the alley, paseos, and paseo courtyards and include them in the next set of renderings.
4. The current design of the bougainvillea on the edge of the structure is not supportable.
5. The Commission would accept less parking at the roof of the parking garage to hide the solar panels.
6. Study tilting the panels to maximize energy in hopes of reducing the number of panels.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (Edmunds abstained.) Motion carried.

(4:00PM) FINAL APPROVAL**5. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
Zone: HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2016-00284
Owner: American Tradition LLC
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge, SEPPS
Architect: Robert Glazier

(Proposal for an 86 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion.)

Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on June 24, 2020.

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, SEPPS; Robert Glazier, Design Architect; Kirk Ellis, Gensler; and Joel Harms, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks to Consent with comments:

1. Update the rendering on the plan cover page.
2. The Commission appreciates the landscape design and suggests adding California sycamore in the entrance auto circle instead of pine.
3. The gutters and downspout color is not acceptable as presented, and the Commission suggests a copper or white color/finish.
4. Provide fabric samples.
5. Provide decorative tile samples.
6. The plaster material is acceptable, however the Commission is concerned about unpainted plaster longevity and cleanliness.
7. Either roof tile is acceptable.
8. Adjust the curling wrought iron stiffeners to be more traditional and spiral-like.
9. Adjust the necking of the short plaster columns as seen on Detail 6 of A8.160 to differentiate between the taller columns.
10. Some Commissioners would like the girders ends of the trellis to have a more traditional profile.
11. Cabanas are acceptable as presented.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:06 P.M. ***