City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 18, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:
Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present:	Grumbine, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, and Ooley
Commissioners absent:	Hausz and Veyna
Staff present:	Ostrenger, Hernandez (until 1:47 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Lanny Eberstein

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 4, 2019**, as amended.
Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 18, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Veyna and Nemec.
Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Ooley abstained. Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Ooley abstained because he has a personal relationship with the owners of 1555 Alameda Padre Serra (Item A).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
   a. Commissioners Veyna and Hausz are absent from today's meeting.
   b. Staff provided a response regarding an email from Commissioner Lenvik for the project at 9 West Figueroa St, which came before the Historic Landmarks Commission in 2018 for conceptual level review. The plans included a proposal for an SCE transformer at the paseo. The project has not completed the design review process, and staff will be providing additional information regarding the status of the proposal.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced that Commissioners received a packet with staff reports and an updated list for the next collective designation of Structures of Merit scheduled for October 16, 2019.

3. Commissioner Edmunds announced that she will leave at 5:00 p.m.

4. Commissioner Mahan provided a copy of Rosenburg's Rules of Order for the Commission's reference.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Awards Subcommittee.

(1:45PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 115 W ANAPAMU ST

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-222-002
Zone:	C-G
Application Number:	PLN2016-00436
Owner:	Sanctuary House of Santa Barbara Inc
Applicant:	The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for a new mixed use project using the Average Unit Size Density (AUD) Program and Density Bonus. The existing development on site consists of two single-story detached residential units, one two-story 8-unit apartment building, and 20 uncovered parking spaces. The proposal would demolish the two detached residential units and parking lot, maintain the 4,574 square foot 8-unit apartment building, and construct a new five-story, 59 foot tall, mixed-use building. Following the initial ABR Concept Review, the project will go before the Planning Commission for a hearing to consider the required findings for a Community Benefit project to exceed 45 feet in height. Unit mix will be 34 affordable studios with an average unit size of 458 square feet with a resident population including adults living with mental illness, and veterans. A community benefit designation will be requested for the proposed new nonresidential floor area totaling 7,031 square feet consisting of a medical and dental clinic, offices, and meeting rooms providing mental health services for residents. A total of nine parking spaces will be provided on-site and on the adjacent alley, and 16 bicycle parking spaces.)

Acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Wood Environmental & Infrastructures Solutions, Inc. is requested.

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeologist, Wood Environmental & Infrastructures Solutions, Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with the comment that the address on the cover should be corrected.
Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(1:50PM) REVIEW AFTER FINAL APPROVAL

2. 522 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2019-00127
Owner: James Craviotto
Applicant: Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal for a new outdoor Beer Garden associated with Institution Ale located adjacently at 516 State Street. Project involves renovating an existing 120 square foot storage structure, constructing a new 150 square foot shed and installing new bike racks at the rear of the parcel adjacent to Parking Lot #2. Project includes perimeter wrought iron fencing, gates and pilasters, new lighting, landscaping, associated outdoor furniture, and amenities including a fire pit and grass corn hole play surface.)

Review After Final is requested for miscellaneous design changes to reduce project costs including: simplification of the previously approved perimeter wrought iron fencing, removal of the majority of concrete to be replaced with degranulated granite, revision of the sloping roof to a flat roof on the storage shed, reconfiguration of lighting, fire pits, furniture and seating layout, new free standing outdoor heaters, and landscaping revisions including the number of trees. Project was last reviewed on September 4, 2019.

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Applicant, Andrulaitis + Mixon; and Roger Smith, Institution Ale

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Plummer stated that the review is limited to the Review After Final request, noted in the footer language, and substantial conformance with the Final Approval plans.

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**
Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:04 TO 2:16 P.M. ***

<u>(2:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW</u>

3. 628 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-026
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2019-00432
Owner: Catherine & Christopher Dann
Applicant: Matt Gries, DesignARC

(Proposal to construct a new 505 square foot restroom facility with storage closet at the rear of the parcel to serve the Glass House exterior bar and lounge patio located at 628 State Street in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project includes partial demolition of the existing bar and lounge patio, including surrounding site walls and fences, and partial removal of existing landscape area to accommodate stormwater improvements with new permeable pavers, and submetering and routing of electric, telephone, gas, and water services to the new building.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields, Senior Design Director, DesignARC; and Matt Gries, Applicant, DesignARC

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Plummer clarified that the parcel contains The Habit Burger, a paseo easement, and The Glass House exterior bar and lounge patio.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Continue indefinitely with comments:**

1. In general, the Commission is in favor of the project as designed, and feel that the project is ready to submit for Project Design Approval.
2. The Commission is generally in favor of the chamfers on the restroom building, but would like to see some additional study of chamfers on the lower portion of the building.
3. Edges should have a rounded, two to three inch radius at the top of the wall to tie into the southwest view of the architecture.

4. There is some concern about gaps in the permeable pavers; the Commission suggests the use of gapless permeable pavers, decomposed granite, or another permeable material as an alternative.
5. There is some concern about the reduction in landscaping; the Commission suggests additional landscaping in the interior courtyard or adding potted plants.
6. One Commissioner suggested that around the fireplace, a tile design might be appropriate.
7. The floorplan of the restroom facility is supportable as presented.

Action: Mahan/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:49 TO 3:23 P.M. ***

(3:15PM) IN-PROGRESS REVIEW HEARING

4. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-680-009
Zone:	HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3
Application Number:	PLN2016-00284
Owner:	American Tradition LLC
Applicant:	Suzanne Elledge
Architect:	Robert Glazier

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for an 86 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

In-Progress Review of revised architectural elevations. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. The exterior changes result from proposed floor plan changes to provide 86 rather than 60 hotel rooms, as well as back of house floor area. The building footprint and height remain as previously approved. The HLC is requested to comment on the proposed changes, and to determine if a revised Project Design Approval will be required. The proposed changes must be found by the Community Development Director to be in substantial conformance with the approved Development Plan and Coastal Development Permit. The Planning Commission will review the proposed changes at an upcoming hearing and provide comments to the Community Development Director for a decision on the substantial conformance determination request. The project was granted Project Design Approval on November 14, 2018 and last reviewed on March 20, 2019.

Actual time: 3:23 p.m.

Present: Allison DeBusk, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Robert Glazier, Architect; and Robert Green, Robert Green Company

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer stated that the purpose of the hearing is to comment on the exterior changes resulting from the proposed floor plan changes and determine if the revisions are in substantial conformance with the plans that received Project Design Approval, or if a new Project Design Approval will be required.
2. Ms. DeBusk stated that she is filling in for Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner. The Planning Commission will review the proposed changes at an upcoming hearing and provide comments to the Community Development Director for a decision on the substantial conformance determination request. The proposed changes must be found by the Community Development Director to be in substantial conformance with the approved Development Plan and Coastal Development Permit.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission generally feels that the project is in substantial conformance with the plans that received Project Design Approval, with some minor changes.
2. Provide a section through the terrace to see the arches in full on A502.
3. Provide a perspective sketch of the corner building element on A502A; the blank façade at the corner needs to be resolved.
4. Study introducing more plaster walls at the third floor between lines B7 & B8 on A505 rather than some of the wrought iron balconies.
5. The elevation on A506 is acceptable, but include rendered elevations showing awnings or portieres.
6. On A507 study adding plaster wall instead of wrought iron railings between detail C6 and C4, and D14 and D12, on level two, and bring back the little window next to D14.
7. The Commission appreciates the kick in the roof on A508.
8. Some of the Commission has concerns with the all-plastered corner on A508. The applicant should study a landscape or architectural solution and provide a rendering.
9. The Commission suggests that the applicant provide renderings of all elevations.
10. Carry forward the comments from the In-Progress Review Hearing on March 20, 2019 as follows:
    a. The air intake grilles on the north elevation should be flush with the wall surface and the Commission is in agreement with the photographic examples presented.
    b. The staircase on the grand court east elevation is supportable but the railing detail needs to be resolved.
    c. The Commission encourages roofing material to have a lot of character including staggered butts, texture, variety, and pitches.
11. The Commission understands the adjacent public parkland is outside their purview, but would be supportive of a pedestrian connection.

Action: Mahan/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Hausz and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:45 P.M. ***