



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 28, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (absent 2:22-3:27 p.m.), Butler, Drury, Ensberg (until 5:14 p.m.), Lenvik, and Ooley

Commissioners absent: Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.

Staff present: Kokinda (until 2:12 p.m.), Hernandez, Ted Hamilton, Project Planner (at 3:27 p.m.); Reidel, and Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

Written correspondence from Cheri Rae, Pamela Boehr, and Pamela Boehr was acknowledged.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 14, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 14, 2024**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Ooley, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **August 14, 2024.**

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **August 14, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

D. Ratification of action taken on the Consent Calendar of **August 28, 2024.**

Consent Calendar August 28, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 800 Santa Barbara St	APN: 031-012-028 PLN: 2024-00277 Zone: C-G	John Donaldson / Ed Devicente, DMHA	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions
2.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 107 Jorgensen Ln	APN: 021-110-037 PLN: 2024-00195 Zone: RS-1A	Goodstein, Leach Family Trust 5/23/03 Richard Goodstein & Joy Leach, Trustees/ Arturo Gonzalez, Cal Real Pools Inc.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions
3.	Project Design Approval 2801 Verde Vista Dr	APN: 053-372-006 PLN: 2023-00420 Zone: RS-7.5	Sanchez Family Trust 5/29/14 Nicholas Sanchez, Trustee/ Lovita Wibisono Andrulaitis + Mixon Architects	Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 28, 2024**, as reviewed by Chair Grumbine and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Reidel announced that the project at 17-21 W Montecito St will be reviewed by the Planning Commission (PC) on September 12, 2024. Staff requests that a member of Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) attend the hearing to represent HLC's review of the project.
2. Ms. Hernandez presented photographs of 1731 Santa Barbara St and 1624 Bath Street, two Mills Act properties depicting the conditions before and after the projects.
3. Commissioner Ensberg requested staff look into the development of a Department of Historic Preservation to focus on the many historical components of the City.
4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that there is a proposed Senate bill regarding historic preservation and housing. He recommends that those interested in historic preservation research and write letters to the State. Commissioners may write in as individuals, but not as members of the Commission.

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Grumbine reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

(1:45PM) HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**1. 1528 CASTILLO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-024
Zone: R-MH
Application Number: PLN2024-00146
Owner/Applicant: Jason Streatfeild

(Proposed remodel of existing 1,704 square foot duplex, including: new windows, doors, siding, roofing, and mechanical equipment. Project includes conversion of rear shed roof to hip roof and structural upgrades.)

Requesting acceptance of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Sarah Corder. The report concluded that the property is not eligible for designation as a City Structure of Merit or City Landmark.

Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian, South Environmental

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**2. 428 CHAPALA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PRE2024-00092
Owner: SBID LLC
Cole Cervantes, Manager
Applicant: Lonnie Roy, On Design Architects

(The Italianate wall on the south elevation only is designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish all existing onsite improvements except the historic sandstone wall, and construct a new 33-unit, three-story residential apartment complex developed under the City's Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program and the State's Density Bonus Program. No vehicle parking is proposed as the project site is in the overlay of AB-2097. The ground level includes a bike storage room, office, and miscellaneous storage.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alteration Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Scott Martin, Architect, RRM Design Group; and Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the Applicant has submitted for a one-time pre-application review under the PRT process to get design feedback on the development. This is an AUD project and requires Planning Commission (PC) conceptual review. Staff requests that the Commission provide comments to Planning Commission regarding the aesthetic appropriateness of the overall design within the El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) district, size, bulk and scale, consistency with the findings that the HLC would be making later under a formal application, and sensitivity to the Historic Resource on the property that is proposed to remain. Parking is not under the HLC purview and is not required for this project as it's located within the central business district, so the overall requirement for parking is a maximum of one parking space per unit, and because the project site is in the overlay of AB-2097.

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Stephen Vuillevmier
2. Linda Maron

Written correspondence from Gary Olszewski, Barbara and Daniel Maloney, and Wendy was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:40 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the Applicant's well designed first draft.
2. The size, bulk, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood as there are other large buildings in the surrounding area.
3. The Commission appreciates that the building is stepped back and the Chapala Street facade is modulated.
4. The base of the building should be studied and eliminated where it does not make sense.
5. The Commission suggests that the historic stone wall remain as is. Some Commissioners believe that studying relocating the wall to incorporate it into the entry of the building would be a benefit.
6. The windows of the historic wall need to either be restored or, if restoration is not feasible, replaced to match the current windows per the Secretary of Interior's Standards.
7. Awnings should be consistently applied, specifically on the west and north facing elevations.
8. Where Juliette balconies are located, the openings should be appropriately sized to the balcony.

9. Study the arch and its appropriate size and scale so that it is more pedestrian friendly.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:21 TO 3:27 P.M. ***

(2:45PM) PRE APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT PROGRAM (ITEMS 4-7)

(In compliance with Assembly Bill 1332, the City is implementing a program to provide for the pre-approval of accessory dwelling unit (ADU) plans. To gain pre-approval of their ADU design, a designer must receive an affirmative vote from at least one of the City's design review bodies (Architectural Board of Review, Single Family Design Board, and/or Historic Landmarks Commission). Once an ADU design has been approved by a design review body, the designer may submit working construction drawings to the City's Building & Safety Division for review of Building, Zoning, and Fire code compliance. Approved designs will be posted on the City's website with the designer's contact information so that anyone may contact the designer to purchase the pre-approved plan set. Pre-approved ADU plan sets are subject to shorter permitting deadlines in an effort to streamline housing production.)

3. CONTINUED ITEM: PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS

Application Number: PRE2024-00096

Applicant: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Proposal for pre-approval of a 732 square foot one-story accessory dwelling unit design with a gable roof in a Traditional style variation (Option A) and a Spanish style variation (Option B).

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A & B. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable. Design was last reviewed July 17, 2024.

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Jeff Melgar, Yakov Design; and Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner

Staff comments: Mr. Hamilton-Rolle stated that this is second round of review for the ADU designs, and there is not another agenda spot for the rest of the year to accommodate a continuance. Staff is requesting an action today, either approval, approval with conditions, or a denial. The fourth applicant will appear on a future agenda. Mr. Hamilton-Rolle confirmed that the Architectural Historian can review these on a case by case, but the only nexus for her review will be if a pre-approved ADU is proposed in a location that obscures or diminishes a designated historic resource. The ADU must be subservient to the main residence, otherwise the ADU will go through the discretionary review process. Staff recommends that the Commission does not condition that an ADU style belongs only with other architectural styles, as the program would be more useful if the ADUs can be used on majority of properties. The Commission can condition whether an ADU can be in the front yard and whether pre-approved ADUs can be located in historic districts.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend Approval of Design A with conditions:

1. Design can be used with historic resources that are built post-World War II.
2. Use the stucco and board and batten siding from the previous design iteration.
3. Use window style without muntins from the previous design.
4. Add the bathroom window from the previous design or a similar bathroom window size of either 24" x36" or 18" x 36".
5. Add a window in the bedroom on the wall opposite the door matching window number three.
6. Enlarge the dining room window to match window number one.
7. Front door should swing in.
8. Ridge beam should be dead center, either 3x10 or 4x8, to show its supporting. The eave beam should be the same.
9. ADU should be located in the backyard.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Recommend Approval of Design B with conditions:

1. Windows should include muntins, per the rendering. Muntin cut ups should be proportional to the window.
2. Add plaster bull nose finish on the windows.
3. Add the bathroom window from the previous design or a similar bathroom window size of either 24" x36" or 18" x 36".
4. Add a window in the bedroom on the wall opposite the door matching window number three.
5. Enlarge the dining room window to match window number one.
6. Ridge beam should be dead center, either 3x10 or 4x8, to show its supporting. The eave beam should be the same.
7. Front door should be Spanish style and without trim.
8. Add a red tile roof.
9. Finish should be smooth stucco.
10. Add a Spanish style wrought iron light fixture.
11. Gutters and downspouts should be painted galvanized.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 5/1/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Grumbine stated that he voted no because he would like to sleep at night.

4. CONTINUED ITEM: PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS

Application Number: PRE2024-00097

Applicant: Yakov Zariadnov, Yakov Design

Proposal for pre-approval of a 497 square foot one-story detached accessory dwelling unit design with a flat parapet roof in a Traditional style variation (Option A) and a Spanish style variation (Option B).

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of Design A & B. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable. Design was last reviewed July 17, 2024.

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Jeff Melgar, Yakov Design; and Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 5:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend Approval of Design Option B with conditions:

1. Remove the front door. Change the sliding doors to a single fixed and one opposite side operable door to operate as the front door. Doors should be slid down and aligned with the hinges of the current door that will be removed.
2. Add a post in the center of the trellis along the long span of the trellis. Post should be 6x6 inches. Remove the base of the post. Keep the tile cap. The color should be from the approved EPV style guide or match the main house.
3. Select the light fixture from any approved Spanish style project in town.
4. ADU should be in the backyard
5. Works at any site in the EPV.

Action: Ensberg/Drury, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Recommend Denial of Design Option A with comments:

1. Add horizontal siding.
2. Add trim on the corners.
3. Add muntins to the windows
4. Remove the trellis.

Action: Drury/Butler, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

5. CONTINUED ITEM: PRE-APPROVED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT

Application Number: PRE2024-00103
Applicant: Adam Stickels

Proposal for pre-approval of an 800 square foot one-story detached accessory dwelling unit design with a gable roof in Spanish style.

Request to provide a recommendation to staff for approval, approval with conditions, or denial. No specific findings are required. Recommendations on each individual design option will be taken by a motion and majority vote. Exterior colors are to be approved as shown on the plans or to match the primary residence. Recommendations are non-appealable. Design was last reviewed July 17, 2024.

Actual time: 5:14 p.m.

Present: Adam Stickles, Applicant; and Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 5:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend Approval with conditions:

1. Select a Spanish style light fixture from a previously approved project.
2. Widen the framing on the left side of the front entry to 8 inches.

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 5/0/0. (Hausz, Doordan, Ensberg and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:25 P.M. ***