



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 7, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, (absent 2:23-3:58 p.m.), Edmunds (at 1:32 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, Ooley, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: Drury

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 4:54 p.m.), Hernandez (absent 5:41-6:31 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest
2. Anna Marie Gott

Written correspondence from Anna Marie Gott and Thomas Van Stein was received.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 24, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Nemec, 6/0/2. (Veyna abstained from all items. Grumbine and Mahan abstained on Item 6, E Cabrillo Boulevard, and Item 7, 2948 Serena Road. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 7, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:**1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:**

- a. Commissioner Drury is absent from today's meeting.
- b. There will be a dinner break after Item 9, 113 W De La Guerra Street.
- c. Commissioner Ooley requested a handout about the process flowchart which is currently in draft form as it is being updated but staff will provide it as soon as it is finalized.

2. Commissioner Lenvik announced that he would like staff to agendize a discussion about the timeframes of approvals and requirements for application submittals. Ms. Plummer stated that she will confirm with the Design Review Supervisor and then schedule the discussion.**E. Subcommittee Reports:**

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Award Program.

(1:50PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**1. 14 W GUTIERREZ STREET**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-019

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Ablit Trust
Neil Ablitt, Trustee

(Review Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival Commercial Dry Cleaners, designed by noted architect Roland Sauter in 1930 located at 14 West Gutierrez Street.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Motion: **Adopt Resolution 2019-134 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival Commercial Dry Cleaners, designed by noted architect Roland Sauter in 1930 located at 14 West Gutierrez Street.**

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

2. 830 DE LA GUERRA TERRACE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-071-015

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Mara E. Hochman

(Review Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Alex D'Alfonso designed house constructed in 1931 located at 830 De La Guerra Terrace.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Adopt Resolution 2019-135 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Alex D'Alfonso designed house constructed in 1931 located at 830 De La Guerra Terrace.**

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: MILLS ACT CONTRACT

3. 830 DE LA GUERRA TERRACE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-071-015

Reference Number: PLN2019-00245

Owner: Mara E. Hochman

(Application for a Mills Act contract at 830 De La Guerra Terrace. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the property located at 830 De La Guerra Terrace.**

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: MILLS ACT CONTRACT

4. **1600 OLIVE ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-021
Reference Number: PLN2019-00245
Owner: Jinxing Zheng

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the Structure of Merit house located at 1600 Olive Street. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 1600 Olive Street, and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract.

Actual time: 2:11 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Structure of Merit located at 1600 Olive Street.

Action: Lenvik/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:10PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

5. **712 CASTILLO ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-073-018
Reference Number: PLN2019-00234
Owner: Belinda Elizabeth Abbott

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Vernacular Craftsman bungalow, constructed in 1913 located at 712 Castillo Street.)

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-10 to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Vernacular Craftsman bungalow constructed in 1913 located at 712 Castillo Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:12PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**6. 223 A E FIGUEROA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-017

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: David Walker and Nonie Hamilton

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Vernacular Craftsman bungalow, constructed in 1925 located at 223 A E Figueroa Street.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest

Public comment closed at 2:20 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-11 to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Vernacular Craftsman bungalow constructed in 1925 located at 223 A East Figueroa Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:17PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**7. 2410 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-072-017

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Anderson Family Trust
Rebecca and Ian Anderson, Trustees

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Shingle Style house, constructed in 1916 located at 2410 State Street.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-12 to hold a Public Hearing on August 21, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Shingle style house constructed in 1916 located at 2410 State Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:20PM) NEW ITEM: SIGN APPEAL HEARING

8. 514 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037

Zone: M-C

Application Number: PLN2019-00334

Owner: Garrett, Judith Johnson Living Trust
Garrett and Judith Johnson, Trustees

Applicant: Joe Andrulaitis

Business Name: Institution Ale

Business Owner: Roger Smith

(Appeal of a Sign Committee action denying sign exceptions proposed under SGN2019-00066. Proposal to permit an 8.3 square foot warm white exposed neon tube sign with 30 inch tall letters, currently installed within the 10 foot setback required by Sign Ordinance on the southeast interior wall of a commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV). The application requires Sign Exceptions to allow letter height to exceed the 10 inch maximum in EPV and to allow neon, an unacceptable material in EPV and prohibited by the Sign Ordinance.)

Consider the appeal of Joe Andrulaitis, of the Sign Committee's Denial of Sign Exceptions on July 2, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Hausz recused himself from hearing this item, because he opposed the project at the Sign Committee hearing.

Actual time: 2:23 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Applicant, Andrulaitis + Mixon; Shaun Smith, Co-owner, Institution Ale; and Renee Brooke, City Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer gave an overview of the project's history, the sign application findings, and the sign exception request; and read into the record a letter from Sign Committee Member Bob Cunningham, who made the motion for denial at the Sign Committee meeting where the project was originally heard.
2. Ms. Hernandez gave an overview of the history of the building and the grounds outlined in the Municipal Code the Commission may use to grant a sign exception.

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kate Schwab (support)
2. Rick Closson (oppose)
3. Anna Marie Gott (oppose)

4. Gene Deering (support)
5. Dave Pintard
6. Gwynn Hladyniuk (support) Judy Garrett ceded time to Ms. Hladyniuk
7. Don Sharpe (oppose)
8. Kellam de Forest

Written correspondence from Jamie Bishop, Ken Sorgman, Jim Meaney, and Bob Cunningham was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Uphold the Appeal and Approve the Sign Exceptions, making the findings as stated in Sign Ordinance subsection 22.70.070 for the granting of an exception:

1. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the property involved or to the intended use of the property because the building exemplifies the Streamline Moderne style, a unique style in El Pueblo Viejo, which does not apply generally to other properties designed in the Spanish Colonial Revival or Mediterranean styles in the vicinity.
2. The granting of the exception will not be materially detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity, because the sign is perpendicular to the street front.
3. The proposed sign is in conformance with the stated purpose and intent of the Sign Ordinance, because the Santa Barbara Municipal Code gives the flexibility for a sign to fit the style of the building (SBMC 22.22.104).

Action: Edmunds/Nemec, 5/2/0. (Lenvik and Mahan opposed. Drury and Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:50 TO 3:58 P.M. ***

(3:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

9. 113 W DE LA GUERRA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-027

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2015-00626

Owner: John R. Dewilde

Architect: Ed De Vicente, DMHA Architecture

(The W.D. Smith Building, constructed in 1928 and located at 113 W. De La Guerra Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 23-unit mixed-use project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program on two parcels known as 113-115 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-027) and 117 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-003). The project proposes the demolition of two existing 1,113 and 923 square foot commercial buildings, two outdoor patios, 15 surface parking spaces, and the near complete demolition of a 4,455 square foot commercial building, of which the historic façade and tile roof will be preserved. The project proposes to construct a 19,767 square foot, three- and four-story mixed-use building that includes 16,907 square feet of residential area, 1,162 square feet of commercial area, and 1,698 square feet of circulation. Twenty-six parking spaces will be provided by an at-grade parking garage. The residential component comprises 23 residential units with an average

unit size of 735 square feet and a unit mix of studios, one-bedroom, and two-bedroom units. The two parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential/Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). The proposed density on the lots totaling 16,273 net square feet will be 62 units per acre. One existing Queen Palm in the right of way is proposed to be relocated.)

A. Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on November 1, 2017.

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA Architecture; and Ed Di Vicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture;

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer stated that Commissioners who did not attend and have not reviewed the previous meetings for this project must abstain from the motion.
2. Ms. Hernandez provided additional information about the original Historic Structures/Sites report.

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Ana Sullivan (oppose)

Public comment closed at 4:38 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission feels that the project continues to be acceptable overall.
2. The Commission is concerned with the project's adjacency to neighboring balconies. Matching balconies are acceptable but the applicant should study the location and height of the walls and continue to develop the 3-D model.
3. Study the elevator tower as an architectural element and make it more interesting.
4. The brick arch on A801 should not be flat and the applicant should study alternative solutions.
5. While mass, bulk, and scale has been reduced, it continues to be a concern for some Commissioners.
6. Consider as many options as possible for door and window arrangements and capture openings on the neighboring property in the model.
7. Study more possibilities for the doors on the historic north street elevation.
8. Set the windows back 12-14 inches and thicken the walls along the north elevation
9. Address the rooftop equipment locations.
10. Study relief in the large wall along the south elevation at ground level, so it is not such a large mass looming over the bungalows behind the building on West Ortega Street.
11. Study additional articulation on the walkways, including additional covering and Monterey style balconies.
12. The project is coming along but needs another concept review before it is ready for Project Design Approval.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 4/0/4. (Lenvik, Ooley, Nemec, and Edmunds abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

B. Acceptance of an Addendum to a Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Alexandra C. Cole is requested. The Addendum to the 2005 Historic Structures/Sites Report concluded that the proposed project will retain the front historic section of the historic resource so that it can convey its original appearance. Because, the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the impacts are considered less than significant (Class III).

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect, DMHA Architecture; and Ed Di Vicente, Architect, DMHA Architecture

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Motion: Accept the addendum to the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 4/0/4. (Lenvik, Ooley, Nemec, and Edmunds abstained. Drury absent.)
Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:24 TO 5:41 P.M. ***

(4:05PM) CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

10. 101 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-008; -009; -018; -021; -024; & -027
Zone: HRC-2/SP-2/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00052
Owner: Wright Family H Limited Partnership
Agent: Ken Marshall, Dudek
Architect: Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Collective LLP

(The project consists of a new 250-room, 231,300-square foot (net) hotel located on a 4.53-acre site at the southwest corner of Garden and E. Yanonali Streets, in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The project site is Area A of the Cabrillo Plaza Specific Plan (SP-2). The hotel would consist of 119 standard guestrooms and 131 extended stay guestrooms. Amenities for the hotel guests would include restaurants, bar, lounge, library, media salons, meeting rooms, fitness rooms, market, laundry rooms, a pool, and a roof deck with trellis. A total of 267 parking spaces would be provided (39 surface and 228 in an underground parking garage). All existing structures and uses on the site would be removed. The project includes a voluntary lot merger of the six underlying legal lots.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires Planning Commission approval of a Parking Modification, Lot Area Modification, Development Plan, and Coastal Development Permit.

Actual time: 5:41 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; Ken Marshall, Agent, Dudek; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that the project went through pre-application review with staff only and will go before the Planning Commission for a concept review on Thursday, August 8, 2019 where Ms. Kennedy will convey the HLC's comments.

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. In general, the Commission finds the mass, bulk, and scale to be appropriate for the area, land, and views.
2. The Monterey and Spanish Colonial styles currently used are appropriate but other styles like Mission Revival would also be appropriate.
3. The Monterey style on the three-story element is not appropriate.
4. The porte cochère and restaurant windows need further development.
5. In general, the three-story masses need more plaster and chimneys.
6. The generous setbacks are appreciated.
7. The Commission suggests integrating Monterey Cyprus trees rather than palm trees on the corner.
8. Some members of the Commission would like more information about the roof decks.
9. The landscape plan is generally acceptable for the time being.
10. Study the flood gates and emergency equipment.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(5:05PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

11. 801 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2019-00360

Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust 5/9/84

Kim and Tammy Hughes, Trustees

Applicant: Matthew Chua, Cearnal Collective LLP

(The Last Tiendas Building constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 2,700 square foot third story addition comprised of two residential units on the existing two-story commercial building. Project will require a Parking Modification and Open Yard Modification for the residential units.)

A. Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project received a One-Time Pre-Application Consultation under PLN2019-00132 on April 3, 2019.

Actual time: 6:29 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP; Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Open Yard Modification is aesthetically appropriate because it is on a very wide paseo and adjacent properties have a large amount of open space.
2. The Parking Modification is aesthetically appropriate because there are other properties in the area with parking structures and urban living often requires parking away from residences.
3. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
4. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project because the addition fits perfectly, enhances the structure, and gives it better proportions.
5. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood, as the surrounding buildings are bigger.
6. The project is sensitive to historic resources in the vicinity including, City Hall and El Paseo.
7. Public views are not an issue.
8. Open space and landscaping are appropriate.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

B. Acceptance of an Addendum to a Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, is requested. The Addendum to the 2006 Historic Structures/Sites Report concluded that the proposed project will enhance the building by providing another story for housing, while restoring character-defining features of the original Structure of Merit building to their original 1925 appearance. Because the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the impact level is considered less than significant (Class III).

Actual time: 6:40 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP; Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the Commission will be required to make Structure of Merit findings that the project will restore to its original appearance or enhance the Structure of Merit property at Project Design Approval and advised that they keep those findings in mind as they proceed.

- Motion:** **Accept the addendum to the Historic Structures/Sites Report with conditions:**
1. The central State Street arch be squared off and extend to the ground for now until that façade can be completed.
 2. The changes to the transoms and doors on the De La Guerra elevation improve the architectural integrity of the building and improve its longevity.
- Action:** Mahan/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:21 P.M. ***