



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

OCTOBER 25, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz (at 1:37 p.m.), Butler, Doordan, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure

Commissioners absent: Drury

Staff present: Ostrenger, Kokinda, Hernandez, Reidel, and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Izzy Savage
2. Cass Ensberg
3. Jim Knell

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 11, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Butler, 7/0/1. (Ooley abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 25, 2023**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Kokinda announced that the Staff Hearing Officer decision for 225 Equestrian was appealed to the Planning Commission. The project will eventually come back to the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC).
2. Commissioner McClure announced that he will not be present for the November 8, 2023 HLC hearing.
3. Commissioner Doordan announced that he will leave at 5:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the State Street Advisory Committee.

(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. STATE STREET INTERIM OPERATIONS

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Sarah Clark, Downtown Plaza Parking Manager
Tess Harris, State Street Master Planner
Brian Bosse, Public Works Manager

(Staff will provide an overview of the Commission's role in State Street Interim Operations and request that the Commission establish a process for providing reports and recommendations on proposed regulations and vote to create a State Street Interim Subcommittee.)

Actual time: 1:56 p.m.

Present: Tess Harris, State Street Master Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Sarah Clark, Downtown Parking and Plaza Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Dan Hentschke, Assistant City Attorney, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:04 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Jim Knell
2. Mary Ellen Brooks

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

Motion: Create the State Street Interim working group including Chair Grumbine, Commissioner Ensberg, and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:00PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

2. 1770 PROSPECT AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-061-007

Zone: R-2

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Owner: Eugene D. Keane & Helen M. Keane, Trustees for Keane Trust

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2023-11 designating the structure constructed in 1924 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report*

Resolution 2023-11*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:41 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2023-11 designating 1770 Prospect Avenue a Structure of Merit.

Action: Ooley/Ensberg, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

3. 43 PORTOLA LN

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-092-002

Zone: RS-7.5

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Owner: David M. Rosner

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2023-12 designating the structure constructed c. 1915 in the Craftsman style and relocated in 1975 to 43 Portola Lane a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report*

Resolution 2023-12*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara,

Public comment opened at 2:50 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2023-12 designating 43 Portola Lane a Structure of Merit.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:10PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

4. 101 W CANON PERDIDO ST

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Contributing historic resources to the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District designed in 1927, in the Spanish Renaissance Plateresque style by Maston and Hurd Architects. Request to review the Chapala Street elevation entrance installed in 1958 designed by Chester Carjola, AIA, to evaluate if the alteration has gained historic significance in its own right to guide appropriate treatment moving forward.)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

[National Park Service Guidance on Acquired Significance and Secretary of the Interior's Standard Number 4*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:52 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective

Public comment opened at 3:01 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Brian Cearnal

Public comment closed at 3:03 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commission comments:

- The Commission finds that the main 1928 Telephone building demonstrates the period of significance.
- The third story and rear additions are considered historically significant in their own right as architect Chester Carjola designed them in a compatible style to both the 1928 building and El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, and they are a part of the continued legacy of the building.
- The 1958 Chapala Street Entrance is not considered historically significant, although designed by Chester Carjola, who was a notable architect note in Santa Barbara. He also designed the additions which are more compatible with the historic resource and district. Thus, future treatment of the Chapala Street entrance can have the flexibility to be rehabilitated to some other configuration.
- The Commission recognizes that a restoration of the original door in the future could be a possibility.

(2:25PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**5. 105 HARBOR WAY**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-013
Zone: H-C/S-D-3,P-R/S-D-3
Application Number: PLN2023-00338
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Beth Anna Cornett, Senior Planner

(Project includes the construction of a 360 lineal foot rock revetment along the sandy beach between the Santa Barbara Yacht Club and Harbor West parking lot. The revetment is 15 feet high (partially buried) and 36 feet wide for a total area of 12,960 square feet and a volume of 7,200 cubic yards. Constructed using approximately 6,000 tons of granite boulders from a quarry in Cambria. The new rock revetment was installed adjacent to the west end of an existing rock revetment, continuing the existing revetment alignment, and extending the structure further to the west. The height of the revetment was constructed to match the existing height. Project also includes repairs to the parking lot asphalt and fencing. The project site includes all areas that have potential for cultural resources disturbances.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Rincon Consultants, Inc. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Matthew Gonzalez, Senior Project Manager and Archaeologist, Rincon Consultants Inc.

Public comment opened at 3:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

6. **276 CANON DR**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-142-027
Zone: RS-10/USS
Application Number: PLN2022-00475
Owner: Schuyler Hunt Greenawalt
Applicant: Sergio Ormachea, Vanguard Planning

(Eligible for inclusion on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1954 and designed by Paul A. Greene in the Mid-Century Modern style. Proposal for exterior alterations to the existing 830 square foot, single-unit residence located in the Hillside Design District, including: a nine square foot addition and roof extension, replacement of existing wood shake siding with vertical board and batten siding to match original, replacement of existing asphalt shingle roof with corrugated metal roof, new front door, window replacement, removal of existing 493 square foot deck with new 393 square foot deck, and front entry stair and landing replacement. Project also includes landscape alterations including California Oak tree removal and mitigation.)

- A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 1 and Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine. Phase 1 concluded the house, excluding its post-1954 additions and alterations, is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit under Criteria 2, 3 and 5, at the local level because it represents an important example of Mid-Century Modernism designed by Paul A. Greene, who made notable contributions to the City's architectural heritage. Phase 2 concluded the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).**
- B. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings, Minor Alteration Findings, and Hillside Design District Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.**

Phase 1 and Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; and Sergio Ormachea, Vanguard Planning

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ensberg, 3/5/2. (Butler, Doordan, Lenvik, and Ooley opposed. Drury and McClure absent.) Motion failed.

Motion: Accept the report with the condition that the conclusion of Phase 1 be revised to state that the building is eligible to be on the Historic Resources Inventory as a historic resource for the purposes of CEQA rather than as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Hausz/Ensberg, 6/1/1. (Lenvik opposed. McClure and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for their work on this project. It is generally supportable and sensitive to the historic resource.
2. Study the two-by-two horizontal members of the railing. The Commission suggests using a hardwood or other ways of designing the railing.
3. A metal roof for the building is appropriate due to its minimum visibility. Return with waterproofing details for the low slope corrugated metal roof to ensure that the material will last.
4. Study alternative roof colors/materials.
5. Study options for the small clerestory windows to try to unify them into a single ribbon or strip of windows.
6. The Commission is supportive of the addition.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(3:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

7. [1733 MOUNTAIN AVE](#)
- | | |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 043-171-006 |
| Zone: | RS-6 |
| Application Number: | PLN2023-00002 |
| Owner: | Graeme Lee-Wingate |
| Applicant: | Tod Stockwell, T Stock Design Studio |

(Historic Structure of Merit, constructed in 1930 in the English Vernacular style. Proposal for a 122 square foot first floor addition and a 592 square foot second floor addition to the rear of an existing 998 square foot single-unit residence. Project includes addition of dormer window on the front elevation and raising the side facing gable 5'2" from 18'10" to 24'0", removal of an as-built shed, new doors, rear windows, roofing, second story balcony, smooth stucco, exterior lighting, and restoration of original windows. The proposed total of 2,261 square feet on a 5,124 square foot lot is 92% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

No final appealable action will be taken at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project was last reviewed on August 2, 2023.

[Historic Significance Report*](#)[Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Tod Stockwell, Applicant, T Stock Design Studio; and Graeme Lee-Wingate, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that this project came before the HLC for Project Design Approval. Upon resubmittal staff noted that the project is over the required 85% required Floor-to-lot Area Ratio (FAR). The Commission should determine whether they wish to waive the supplementary materials required for Project Design Approval.

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for their continued work on this project. It is a great improvement on the last design and is heading in the right direction.
2. Restudy the corbels or supports for the balcony on the southeast elevation. Find Historic precedents in the English vernacular language. Study making it an ogee, stucco material, and adding continual spacing.
3. Update the roof plan and architectural drawings to be accurate.
4. Continue to study the front dormer. The Commission suggests narrowing the dormer by 25% or more.
5. Study several roof options for the dormer, such as a shed roof, hipped roof, or gable roof, as to which may be most appropriate and will help break up the mass of the large roof.
6. Study two narrow dormers as opposed to one larger dormer.
7. The Commission supports waiving the FAR supplemental requirements.
8. Generally, the project meets the Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alteration Findings.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:08 P.M. ***