



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 8, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Ensberg, Lenvik, and Ooley

Commissioners absent: Drury, Grumbine, and McClure

Staff present: Kokinda (until 3:15 p.m.), Hernandez (absent 3:14 - 3:26 p.m.), Reidel, and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 25, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 8, 2023**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Commissioner Doordan announced he will be leaving the hearing at 5:30 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg reported on the State Street Interim Work Group.

(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM**1. 1200 BLK STATE ST AND LOT 11 TRELLISES**

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Owner: Sarah Clark and Chelsey Swanson; City of Santa Barbara

(Three trellises located in Parking Lot 11 (523 Anacapa Street) and one trellis on the 1200 block of State Street at the walkway that connects State Street with the Granada Garage, need significant repairs due to degradation from termite and weather damage. Staff is requesting input on the appropriate materials for repair and/or replacement of the trellises, including type of wood, color, and landscaping options.)

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: Sarah Clark, Downtown Plaza Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Chelsey Swanson, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Sergio Arriaga, Facilities Maintenance Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kokinda stated that Public Works staff reached out to have a discussion with the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) about a couple problematic trellises that are in the El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) District. Some are posing some safety issues, so staff is looking for the Commission's input to advise Public Works staff moving forward.

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission is in favor of keeping all trellises.
2. Generally, rebuild the trellises like for like.
3. The spacing of members could be adjusted so there are fewer of them but keep the same general aesthetic of the existing trellises.
4. The colors should be consistent with the colors of the trellis adjacent to the Granada theatre.
5. The landscaping could be replaced like for like or pruned back and allowed to regrow.
6. The trellises should have copper caps on the primary and secondary members to protect them.
7. Recommendation that the wood be pressure treated without indentations for greater longevity.
8. The Commission would support fast tracking the trellis at the Granada Theatre.

(2:00PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. CITY RIGHT OF WAY - MISSION AND STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-944
Application Number: PLN2023-00306
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Erica Madrigal, Public Works

(Located partially in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I and designated a City Landmark, the State Street Parkway was designed in 1917 by A.B. Cook. Proposal to construct a new lighting corridor along State Street (between Micheltorena Street to just north of Mission Street) and Mission Street (between Chino Street and Anacapa Street) and removal of a portion of the median at the intersection of Mission Street and State Street for a left turn lane.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Dudek. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations, specifically that archaeological monitoring of earth-moving activity should occur along the stretches of street specified on page 47 of the report.

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel McDevitt, Author of Archaeological Report

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**3. CITY RIGHT OF WAY - MISSION AND STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-944
Application Number: PLN2023-00306
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Erica Madrigal, Public Works

(Located partially in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I and designated a City Landmark, the State Street Parkway was designed in 1917 by A.B. Cook. Proposal to construct a new lighting corridor along State Street (between Micheltorena Street to just north of Mission Street) and Mission Street (between Chino Street and Anacapa Street) and removal of a portion of the median at the intersection of Mission Street and State Street for a left turn lane.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine. Phase 2 concluded the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).

B. Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alterations Findings are required.

Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Erica Madrigal, Project Engineer I, City of Santa Barbara; and Behdad Gharagozli, Supervising Transportation Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Fred Sweeney
2. Pat Saley

Public comment closed at 2:33 p.m.

Ex parte communication: Commissioner Ensberg disclosed that Mr. Sweeney told her, “photometrics” when she spoke with him at the hearing.

Public comment re-opened at 2:55 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Fred Sweeney

Public comment closed at 2:57 p.m.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 5/0/1. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent. Ensberg opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commission Ensberg stated that she opposes the report because she would prefer that the report and project be continued and agendized together.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Provide a photometric plot of the lighting.
2. Provide further details on the plans, dimensioning, and the modification to the State Street median at Mission.
3. Recommendation that the Commission surveys relevant areas of the City to evaluate what existing conditions are in terms of light fixture spacing and placement.

Action: Ooley/Lenvik, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

(3:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL**4. 1801 E CABRILLO BLVD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-391-008
Zone: HRC-2/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2022-00494
Owner: Joseph Miller
Applicant: John Cuykendall, DMI - Commercial Real Estate Services

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal for exterior alterations to the existing buildings as follows: remove/replace windows and doors, relocate existing retaining wall, new deck, rearrange demising wall, new AC system, restripe/reconfigure existing parking stalls, relocate bicycle parking, expand trash enclosure, and new landscaping. No changes to building square footages or footprints, or to the amount of on-site parking spaces, are proposed.)

Final Approval is requested. Project plans must demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on September 27, 2023, which is when the project was last reviewed.

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Michael Katsibas, Architect, KAP Studios; Michael Unwin, MGMT, Project Manager; Courtney J Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the comment that the project plans demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on September 27, 2023.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(3:30PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 221 E ISLAY ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-042-028
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2023-00373
Owner: Edward H Fisher IV
Applicant: Kaitlyn Earnest, SEPPS, Inc.

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1923 in the English Arts and Crafts style. Proposal for a new 1,044 square foot basement, 1,286 square foot ground floor addition, 1,526 square foot second floor addition to an existing 2,642 square foot single unit residence, demolition of existing 365 square foot detached garage, construction of a new 504 square foot attached garage and 166 square foot detached workshop.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings, Minor Alteration Findings, and Grading Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Historic Significance Report*

Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:26 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS; Serena Ettelson, Harrison Design; and Edward Fisher, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Lisa Camenzind

Written correspondence from Marcus Morales, James & Candace Whilt, and Peter & Lisa Camenzind was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission would be prepared to grant Project Design Approval when the project returns.
2. Restudy the openings of the covered porch on the second floor over the garage. The covered porch option is more appropriate to the architecture.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:53 TO 4:00 P.M. ***

(4:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

6. **1919 STATE ST**
- | | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 025-371-005 |
| Zone: | C-G |
| Application Number: | PLN2022-00346 |
| Owner/Applicant: | Nineteen Nineteen State LLC
Arvand Sabetian, Representative Member |

(Located within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to convert three buildings at 1913, 1919, and 1921 State Street from office use to hotel use. Proposal for a conversion of 435 square feet of ground floor area to private patios and a 1,302 square foot addition to the existing fourth floor to create livable space and a roof deck. Project includes reduction of 365 square feet at the second floor, reduction of 430 square feet at the third floor, replacement and relocation of existing stairs, elevator extension, site alterations, and new landscaping. No proposed exterior alterations to 1913 State Street. Proposed reduction of 110 square feet and new entry doors at 1921 State Street. Project requires a waiver by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow an alternative parking lot landscape design.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Alternative Landscape Design Waiver Findings are required. Project last reviewed on September 13, 2023.

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Eric Bear, AB Design Studio; Will Rivera, AB Design Studio; and Justin Emmanuel, Arcadia Studios

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that there has been a lot of public comment regarding land use. A reminder to the Commission and members of the public that the purview of the HLC is not over the land use, but only exterior changes and aesthetics.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Susan Shields, Deborah Brown, Anonymous, Bree Wall, Juliette & Daniel Moore, Melissa Lolley, and Elizabeth Flanagan was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The wood columns atop the plaster columns at the front trellis element appear spindly and should be more stout.
2. Study the feasibility of plaster over the wall on the cellphone screening element and consider adding a small cornice.
3. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
4. The Historic Landmarks Commission finds that the project qualifies for an Alternative Landscape Design Waiver to provide relief for the site constraints or to achieve a superior aesthetic.

Action: Ooley/Doordan, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and McClure absent) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:25 P.M. ***