



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JANUARY 18, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Justin Manuel
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner
Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Ms. Burkhart.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Ooley, and Manuel (Items 2 and 3)

Commissioners absent: Lenvik

Staff present: Kokinda, Hernandez, Burkhart, and Esparza

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2023 Election of Chair and Vice Chair.

Nominations for Chair: Grumbine. Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/1 (Grumbine abstained.)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Grumbine was elected as Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair: Hausz. Drury/Butler, 7/0/1 (Hausz abstained.)

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Hausz was elected as Vice Chair.

B. 2023 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Consent Calendar		
Architecture	Hausz	Ooley
Landscape	Manuel	Butler
Sign Committee	Drury	None assigned

C. Public Comment:

No public comment.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **December 21, 2022**, as amended.

Action: Ensberg/Hausz, 5/0/3. (Ooley, Mauel, Drury abstained. Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

E. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 21, 2022**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz

Action: Hausz/Doordan, 5/0/3. (Ooley, Manuel, Drury abstained. Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 18, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and Manuel (Items A, B, C).

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Burkhart announced the following:

- a. Commissioner Lenvik will be absent.
- b. A State St discussion item will be agenized for the February 1, 2023 meeting.
- c. Item 6 is postponed to Feb 1, 2023 at the Applicant's request.
- d. The African American Black Historic Context Statement is being recognized with an award by Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation on Saturday.

2. Ms. Kokinda announced the following:

- a. Staffers Brian Bosse and Jason Harris will be attending the next HLC meeting to be available for the State St. discussion item.

G. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg reported on the Airport Design work group, which met on January 11th at the Airport and provided good input on the initial work that the Airport is doing. There will be another on meeting on January 25, 2023.

Commissioner Hausz reported on the Plaza De La Guerra Pavilion meetings. The group reviewed landscape and hardscape proposal on the Anacapa St. side of City Hall.

(2:00PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**1. 400 W CARRILLO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-261-009

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2022-00354

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara, Dale Aazam

Applicant: Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective

(The project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to construct a new 63-unit residential building. The project includes at-grade surface parking and garage parking as well as additional amenity spaces such as a common room and courtyard outdoor space. The units are proposed to be 100% rent-controlled Moderate-Income (80-12% AMI) and Middle-Income Affordable (120-160% AMI). The project calls for the removal of 8 king palms, 1 jacaranda, and 15 tipu trees on the property; no City street trees or trees within the flood control area outside the western property line will be removed.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for a Project Design Approval. The project was last reviewed on June 8, 2022 on a Pre-Application (PRE2022-00027).

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Rob Fredericks, Exec, Housing Authority of City of Santa Barbara; Christine Pierron, Architect, Cearnal Collective; Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Staff comments: Ms. Arciniega stated that this is the first review for the project that is under a formal application, and it was previously reviewed under a pre-application. The project will be going to Planning Commission and City Council. Because of the density proposed and middle and moderate income levels, the project requires approval from City Council. The applicant would like feedback prior to going to Planning Commission and City Council. The parking lot tree removals are under HLC jurisdiction.

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Steve Johnson

Written correspondence from Steve Johnson and Tatiana Cruz was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:26 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**
1. The Commission appreciates all the work the Applicant has done, and it is a wonderful design and is going in right direction.
 2. The mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate.
 3. All commissioners are in support of the parking as proposed.
 4. The Commission is in support of the internal courtyard as the open yard solution. This is a good solution considering the existing site and it works as a protection for the residents from freeway noise and pollution.
 5. Most Commissioners feel it is appropriate to put up story poles showing the tower element at the Carrillo St. and Castillo St. corner and should be accompanied with an image of the entire project, showing what the story poles are representing, for the public's benefit.
 6. The parking lot landscape waiver is supportable.
 7. Most Commissioners find the height supportable. One Commissioner is seeking another potential height solution from Carrillo St, applying the roof condition as a solution for the height on the freeway side of the building.
 8. Study adjusting the height of the roof of the two-story tower element on the Castillo St. elevation so that it does not align with the floor of the third story.
 9. The Commissioners are split on whether the three arches on the Castillo St elevation should be unified arches or varied arches.
 10. Study screening the balconies of the proposed picket wrought iron design for privacy on the Castillo St. elevation.
 11. Study the third story corner deck proportions.
 12. Change the chain link fence to wrought iron fence on Carrillo St.
 13. Study simplifying the paving in the courtyard.
 14. Study the building elements on either side of the center on the north side of the building portion (the element with four square arches and the element with four round arches) to see if they can be moved forward to increase the internal courtyard.
- Action:** Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Lenvik and Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(2:45PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**2. 2310 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-123-017
Zone: RS-7.5
Application Number: PLN2022-00347
Owner: Parker Richard Jefferson
Applicant: Michael Ober, Vanguard Planning Inc.

(The project site contains a designated Structure of Merit, the Ritchie Bungalow. Proposal to construct a new 367-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above an existing 390-square-foot two-car garage, and to construct a new 12-square-foot utility room attached to the western side of the garage. The project is associated with an existing single-story 1,497-square-foot single-unit residence. The project would result in Substantial Redevelopment of the existing nonconforming garage.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings are required.

Historic Significance Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant, Vanguard Planning;

Staff comments: Ms. Burkhart stated that garage is not historically significant, but the main house is. Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue four weeks with the following comments:

1. The Commission understands the many challenges of the tight space of the project.
2. Study the parapet walls just above the tile with potentially removing the vertical parapet jog on the southwest elevation.
3. Study adding an awning over the pair of windows and/or another way of adding interest of shadow.
4. Bring back color renderings to help show shadows.
5. The windows in general should be in vertical proportion, similar to the house. Look at the main house's historic windows for proper size and proportion.
6. Study the horizontal windows on the northwest elevation for proper proportions.
7. Study changing the entry door to a French, or glass, divided light door.
8. Study bringing out the wall plane of the upper level where the paired windows are to be equal with the kitchen sink bump out.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:56 TO 4:03 P.M. ***

(3:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**3. 1242 DOVER LN**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-203-002
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2022-00411
Owner: Margaret Phelps
Applicant: Will Sofrin, Will Sofrin Inc.

(The subject residence is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal for demolition of a 199-square-foot single-story addition, a 91-square-foot portion of the porch, and a 56-square-foot exterior staircase at the rear (south) of the residence, and a 154-square-foot covered porch addition at the western side of the residence; construction of a new 2,003-square-foot two-story addition (including basement) and a 211-square-foot extension to the porch (includes new staircase) at the rear of the residence; and a re-roof to replace the existing clay S-tile material with two-piece Mission tile throughout.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post Hazeltine. The report concluded the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III).

B. Project Design Approval is requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings are required. This project was last reviewed on December 7, 2022.

Phase 1 Historic Structures/ Sites Report***Revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/ Sites Report***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 4:03 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine; Pamela Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine; and Will Sofrin, Architect, Will Sofrin Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Burkart read into record an email from Commissioner Manuel clarifying the landscape comments from the previous meeting. Staff also advised the Applicant to remove the pool from the plans as it is not being proposed at this time.

Public comment opened at 4:16 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment reopened at 4:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Doordan/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Lenvik absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Project Design Approval, and continue indefinitely back to the Full Commission for Final Approval, with the following comments:

1. The Applicant has done a wonderful job of listening to the Commission's comments and bringing a project worthy of approval.

2. Restudy the depth of the third floor balcony on the south elevation, with the width of the balcony being made smaller; bring it to the inside of the windows, between the doors. Look at other examples of that type of balcony historically in Spanish Colonial Revival.
3. Restudy the plaster piers on the south elevation; they are in conflict with the corbels and plaster beam above. Pick a direction based on historic precedence.
4. Restudy the two-story overhang above the ground floor on the south elevation in regard to corbel size, shape and number to make second story feel more visually supported.
5. The Commission is split between supporting all wood railings or wood and metal railings.
6. Study the lights on the third story on the south elevation; move them closer to the doors instead of flanking the windows. Study the number of lights overall.
7. Add planting on the west side where the area of development will be, at least to the level of disturbance.
8. Return with all appropriate details, especially all those that have been discussed.
9. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
10. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
11. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Doordan/Butler, 6/0/2. (Lenvik absent. Drury and Hausz abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:15PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 710 E COTA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-231-002

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2022-00277

Owner: Habitat For Humanity of Southern Santa Barbara County, Inc;
Jessica Wishan

Applicant: Ed deVicente, DMHA Architecture

(The project consists of three-story, three-unit condominium building with three parking spaces (one space per unit) on the 5,000 square foot lot. The existing 1,910 square foot residence will be demolished. The discretionary applications requested for this project are a Vested Tentative Subdivision Map, a Parking Modification, and a Front Setback Modification.

Note that a similar proposal for development of the adjacent property at 712 E. Cota St. is being review simultaneously under PLN2022-00276, and both projects are shown on the project plans.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report prepared for the project by David Stone, M.A., RPA, of Stone Archaeological Consulting. The report has been reviewed by Dr. Glassow who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 4:54 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting

Staff comments: Ms. Burkhart stated that this project will be going to Architectural Board of Review and is only here for the archeology report, and that the same report also evaluates Item 5 at 712 E Cota St.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Lenvik and Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(4:30PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**5. 712 E COTA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-231-003

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2022-00276

Owner: Habitat For Humanity of Southern Santa Barbara County,
Jessica Wishan

Applicant: Ed deVicente, DMHA Architecture

(The project consists of three-story, three-unit condominium building with three parking spaces (one space per unit) on the 5,000 square foot lot. The existing 1,462 square foot residence will be demolished. The discretionary applications requested for this project are a Vesting Tentative Subdivision Map, a Parking Modification, a Front Setback Modification, and an Interior Setback Modification. Note that a similar proposal for development of the adjacent property at 710 E. Cota St. is being review simultaneously under PLN2022-00277, and both projects are shown on the project plans.)

Request for acceptance of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report prepared for the project by David Stone, M.A., RPA, of Stone Archaeological Consulting. The report has been reviewed by Dr. Glassow who agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Manuel recused himself/herself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting

Public comment opened at 5:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 7/0/0. (Lenvik and Manuel absent.) Motion carried.

(4:45PM) POSTPONED ITEM: NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**6. 1002 ANACAPA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-024

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2022-00376

Owner: Ocean Hills Covenant Church of Santa Barbara, Inc.;
Jonathan Shaffer

Applicant: Michael Stroh, DMHA Architecture

(The 11,988 square foot project site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. The project consists of an 8,468 square foot interior and exterior renovation of an existing church/office building consisting of a 1,582 net square foot second story addition and a 3,579 net square foot roof deck, as well as a new corner entry tower, new trash enclosure, transformer, short term bicycle parking and new electric vehicle parking.)

Item postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:02 P.M. ***