



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

OCTOBER 11, 2023

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, and McClure

Commissioners absent: Ooley

Staff present: Kokinda (until 1:57 p.m.), Hernandez, Reidel, Johnson and Kira Esparza, Administrative Assistant

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Kevin Boss was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 27, 2023**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 11, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and McClure.

Action: Drury/Butler, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Kokinda announced that Staff will be sharing an update on the AUD (Average Unit Density) progress report at the October 12, 2023 Planning Commission (PC) meeting. The AUD program is the City's incentive multi-unit housing program that has been in existence for 10 years. Staff has compiled quantitative and qualitative data through focus groups and an online survey. The progress report does not include specific recommendations but does reflect on the AUD program thus far to be a foundation for policy conversions and next steps. The report is available on the PC website.
2. Chair Grumbine requested clarification on Discussion Item protocol and a discussion with the City Attorney, Council Member Sneddon, and the Mayor on State Street purview.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Ensberg requested corrections to the subcommittee listings on the agenda.

(1:45PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**1. 3237 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-112-026

Zone: RS-7.5/USS

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Owner: United States Indian Health Service;
Kevin J. D'Amanda, Director, Division of Facilities
Operations

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2023-10 designating the structure designed in 1953 by Architects Reisner & Urbahn a Historic Structure of Merit.)

[Historic Structures/Sites Report Accepted in 2022*](#)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)

[Resolution 2023-10*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Jonathan Gardener

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2023-10 designating the structure at 3237 State Street as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Drury/Ensberg, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(1:50PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. WATER TRANSMISSION RENEWAL PROJECT

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-645
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2021-00482
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Beth Anna Cornett, Senior Planner

(The City of Santa Barbara's Public Works Department is seeking to renew existing water transmission mains along Foothill Road and Mission Canyon Road as part of the City's Water Transmission Mains Renewal Project. Proposal to add three above ground CARV assemblies along Foothill Road in right-of-way area. One at San Roque Road, a second at Laurel Canyon Road, and a third at Alamar Avenue. This project is located within the public right-of-way road way surrounded by residential uses, vegetation, walls, fences and parking spaces parallel to the roadway. Site three aboveground CARV assemblies directly adjacent to the Foothill Road right-of-way to be colored to blend into the existing settings.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Dudek. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations, particularly that an archaeological monitor be present during earth-moving activities.

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Carlos Sanchez, Consultant, Mimiaga Engineering Group; and Heather McDaniel McDevitt, Archaeologist

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Doordan, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

3. **1303 STATE ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-014
Zone: C-G
Application Number: SGN2023-00046
Owner: Randall Fox, Agent for Bosse Toy Train Museum, Inc
Applicant: Dan Morris, Freedom Signs

(Designated a Historic Landmark, designed in 1951 by internationally recognized designer Kem Webber in the Streamline Moderne style. Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Proposal for one non-illuminated metal 14.1 square foot marquee sign to be installed on the character defining awning of the building. Total frontage is 40 feet.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alterations Findings are required.

Historic Significance Report*
Memo from Architectural Historian

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:14 p.m.

Present: Dan Morris, Freedom Signs; and Sebastian Herics, Planning Technician, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that although this is a sign project, it is before the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) because it is proposed on a designated Historic Landmark, a Kem Weber design, and will be less temporary than signs that have gone on other Historic Landmarks. It is up to the Commission to decide if the project meets the Secretary of Interior Standards and is compatible with the original historic materials.

Public comment opened at 2:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions and findings:

1. Condition that the first letter of each word shall be capitalized and at 10 inches. The remaining letters shall be proportionally reduced to reflect the proportions of the Christian Science Reading Room sign.
2. Condition that the letters shall be brushed aluminum.
3. The font is acceptable as submitted.
4. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
 - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.

- e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
- 5. As required for Major Alterations in Section 30.157.110 of the Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The exterior alterations are being made to restore the historic resource to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid its preservation or enhancement as a historic resource; and
 - b. The exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:25PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. **531 E ORTEGA ST**
- | | |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 031-101-024 |
| Zone: | R-M |
| Application Number: | PLN2023-00178 |
| Owner: | Providence School |
| | Soo Chang, Representative Member |
| Applicant: | Jay Higgins, H&H Environmental, Inc. |

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, designed in 1964 by Robert Ingle Hoyt in the Mid-Century Modern style. Proposal to redevelop the existing site to accommodate a Junior/High School campus for Providence School. The project involves additions and alterations to the existing single-story main building, demolition of the existing gymnasium and construction of a new 10,500-square-foot gymnasium, a new 4,969-square-foot two-story building comprised of a theatre, library and chapel, and a new 4,244-square-foot two-story building comprised of additional classroom and office administration space. The project includes alterations to the existing surface parking lot to accommodate a total of 40 uncovered vehicle spaces, new bicycle parking, grading, and landscape/hardscape improvements throughout the site. Planning Commission review and approval of a Development Plan to allow for the construction of new nonresidential floor area and a Conditional Use Permit to allow for the operation of a school use in the R-M zone is required.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Dudek. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the archaeology report has been reviewed by the City Environmental Analyst and Dr. Glassow. They were in agreement with the report's conclusion and had no recommended changes.

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Doordan, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

(2:30PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 531 E ORTEGA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-101-024
Zone: R-M
Application Number: PLN2023-00178
Owner: Providence School
Soo Chang, Representative Member
Applicant: Jay Higgins, H&H Environmental, Inc.

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, designed in 1964 by Robert Ingle Hoyt in the Mid-Century Modern style. Proposal to redevelop the existing site to accommodate a Junior/High School campus for Providence School. The project involves additions and alterations to the existing single-story main building, demolition of the existing gymnasium and construction of a new 10,500-square-foot gymnasium, a new 4,969-square-foot two-story building comprised of a theatre, library and chapel, and a new 4,244-square-foot two-story building comprised of additional classroom and office administration space. The project includes alterations to the existing surface parking lot to accommodate a total of 40 uncovered vehicle spaces, new bicycle parking, grading, and landscape/hardscape improvements throughout the site. Planning Commission review and approval of a Development Plan to allow for the construction of new nonresidential floor area and a Conditional Use Permit to allow for the operation of a school use in the R-M zone is required.)

A. Requesting acceptance of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine. The report concluded that the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; therefore, project impacts on significant historic resources would be less than significant (Class III). The Report last reviewed July 19, 2023.

B. No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alteration Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project last reviewed July 19, 2023.

Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

Revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report*

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Bryan Cearnal, AIA Architects; Steve Nuhn, AIA Architects; Justin Manual, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studios; Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; and Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment opened at 2:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission thanks the applicant for the great presentation, additional design improvements, and listening to previous Commission comments. The project is beautiful as presented and the courtyard is nicely done.
2. Add a cap, roof extension, molding, or other profile to the top of the gym and theater.
3. Study less bright shades of white for the plaster.
4. Study the glass railing design, some Commissioners feel that the railing design does not need another railing language wrought iron is suggested given the proposed school use and because the project already has wrought iron fencing as a base language.
5. Simplify the planting palette; the Commission understands more information is forthcoming with the decision from the City Arborist of the street tree for the site.
6. Restudy the windows on the west elevation of the gym and theater with the geometry of the other windows on the site in mind. Consider breaking them up to look more residential.
7. Study the administration glass box element to add more expression on the corners. Some Commissioners feel that the glass box element is not successful.
8. Add trees between the neighbors and the gym on the north side of the property.
9. The Commission feels that the 3D presentation, site sections, and neighbor studies were sufficient. Story poles are not needed.
10. The size, mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate.
11. The Historic Resource on the site was addressed appropriately. The Commission appreciates the changes and additions to the site.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. (Ooley absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:43 P.M. ***